



CARITAS Schweiz
Suisse
Svizzera
Svizzera



Final Evaluation

-

Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women project (EnJOY)

-

Ethiopia

Final report

21 January 2024

Peter Ton

Ton Consultancy

Netherlands

tel. (31) 6 509 57 183

e-mail peterton@xs4all.nl

Abiyot Tilahun

Abidan Consulting Group Plc

Ethiopia

tel. (251) 91 20 76 073

e-mail abiyot.tilahun18@gmail.com

Table of contents

- Table of contents..... 2
- Acknowledgements 3
- Acronyms and abbreviations 4
- Executive summary 5
- 1. Introduction 6
 - 1.1 Purpose of the evaluation 6
 - 1.2 Intended users 6
 - 1.3 Scope and objectives of the evaluation 6
 - 1.4 Methodology..... 7
 - 1.5 Limitations..... 9
 - 1.6 Structure of the report 9
- 2. Description of the development intervention 10
 - 2.1 Project contexts 10
 - 2.2 Project description..... 10
 - 2.3 Project intervention logic 12
 - 2.4 Theory of Change 12
 - 2.5 Monitoring & Evaluation 13
- 3. EnJOY project results and outcomes 15
 - 3.1 Power BI data..... 15
 - 3.2 EnJOY Logframe data 15
- 4. Findings 17
 - 4.1 Relevance & Coherence 17
 - 4.2 Effectiveness..... 19
 - 4.3 Efficiency 23
 - 4.4 (Initial) Impacts & Sustainability 24
 - 4.5 Cross-cutting issues..... 26
 - 4.6 Other specific questions 27
- 5. Conclusions and recommendations 29
 - 5.1 Conclusions 29
 - 5.2 Recommendations 32
 - 5.3 Lessons learned..... 33

References.....	34
Appendices.....	37
Appendix 1. EnJOY Logical framework & Achievements.....	37
Appendix 2. Dale and Dilla Zuria Woredas (10-12 December 2023).....	42
Appendix 3. Sankura Woreda (13-14 December 2023).....	48
Appendix 4. Gedeb Assosa Woreda (15-16 December 2023).....	53
Appendix 5. Adama Zuria Woreda (17-19 December 2023).....	59
Appendix 6. Wollega Woredas (online; AT; 19 December 2023).....	65
Annexes.....	68
Annex 1. Terms of Reference.....	68
Annex 2. Visit programme (5-21 December 2023).....	79
Annex 3. Evaluation matrix.....	82
Annex 4. List of Guiding questions per stakeholder group.....	83
Annex 5. Evaluation team.....	88

Acknowledgements

The Evaluation team would like to thank all those who contributed to this Final Evaluation of the EnJOY project, which was led by the International Consultant and Team Leader Mr. Peter Ton in collaboration with National Consultant Mr. Abiyot Tilahun in Ethiopia.

The evaluation benefited from the inputs of many different stakeholders in the EnJOY project, including project implementation staff and government officers at national, regional and woreda levels, OSJC staff, TVET staff, and individual enterprises and entrepreneurs involved in the project activities. Their contributions were critical to the team’s work and are deeply appreciated.

Disclaimer

This report has been produced with the financial assistance of the European Union through the EnJOY project. The content of this publication is the sole responsibility of the authors and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union or any of the consortium partners implementing the (EnJOY) project.

Acronyms and abbreviations

A/TVET	(Agricultural) Technical Vocational and Educational Training
BIC	Business Incubation Centre
BoLSA	Bureau of Labour and Social Affairs
CACH	Caritas-Switzerland
ECC-SDCO	Ethiopian Catholic Church – Social Development Commission / Caritas-Ethiopia
EDC	Entrepreneurship Development Centre
EnJOY	Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women project
ETB	Ethiopian birr
EU	European Union
EUR	Euro
EUTF	European Union Trust Fund
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
GIZ	German Development Organisation
IBIC	Innovative Business Incubation Competition
IDP	Internally-Displaced Person
JSED	Job and Skills and Enterprise Development
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
MEAL	Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Learning
MFI	Micro-Finance Organisation
MoLS	Ministry of Labour and Skills
MoU	Memorandum of Understanding
MoWC	Ministry of Women and Child Affairs
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
PES	Public Employment Services
PMU	Project Management Unit
PPP	Public-Private Partnership
OBN	Oromia Broadcast Network
OMO	Oromo Microfinance Organisation
ORDA	Organization for Rehabilitation and Development in Amhara
OSJC	One-Stop-Job-Centre
RESET	Resilience Strengthening in Ethiopia project
RESET Plus YEP	RESET plus Youth Empowerment for a Successful Transition to Decent Work project
RJOC	Rural Job Opportunity Creation Strategy
SACCO	Savings and Credits Cooperative Organisations
SDG	Sustainable Development Goal
SNNP	Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples region
SME	Small and Medium Enterprise
StC	Save the Children (NGO)
ToR	Terms of Reference
ToT	Training of Trainers
TVSD	Technical and Vocational Skills Development
UNISOD	United Society for Sustainable Development
USD	United States dollars
VIS	Volontariato Internazionale per lo Sviluppo
VITA/RTA	Irish Development Organisation
WBLS	Work-Based Learning Scheme

Executive summary

Youth unemployment is a big and growing problem in Ethiopia. The average population is very young, rural-urban migration is high, and investments in education are paying off in many skilled youth graduating from schools, TVET and universities. Youth unemployment concerns both skilled and unskilled youth. Job creation is a key issue for public agencies at all administrative levels.

The project “Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY)” (2020-2024) aims to enhance the capacities of local authorities in Ethiopia to proactively support job seekers (youth and women in particular) to have better access to information on available job opportunities and job placements. The project has been implemented by the NGOs Caritas-Switzerland (CACH), ECC-SDCO, VIS and VITA/RTA in eight project woredas in two regions (Oromia and SNNPR) but today these are four regions (SNNPR split up in 2023 into Central Ethiopia Region, Sidama Region and Southern Region). The project budget is EUR 9.7 million and the EU grant is EUR 8.7 million. The project implementation will end by 31 January 2024 and reporting by 31 July 2024.

This Final Evaluation of EnJOY took place in December 2023 and involved a variety of stakeholders in a participatory and consultative manner. The evaluators exchanged with a total of 102 persons (37 women; 65 men) in five project woredas in three regions. The evaluation is largely qualitative in nature, based on key informant interviews and focus group discussions.

EnJOY has been successful implementing the project as a consortium of NGOs and in consultation with the public agencies at federal, regional, zonal and woreda levels. Communication between partners and with public agencies was reported to be good, fluent, frequent and productive. The project has realized most of its stated objectives. It has contributed to substantial investment, capacity-building and upgrading of public actors’ ability to assess and support job seekers’ needs for employment opportunities.

The capacity-building of public One-Stop-Job-Centres (OSJC; Component 1) and of public and private Technical Vocational Education & Training institutes (TVET; Component 3) through Training-of-Trainers (ToT) is expected to be sustained after project period. The capacity-building trainings were well-organised, well-received, and the learning has been put into practice. Significant human and social capital has been built. The Innovative Business Incubation Competitions (IBIC) organised were also highly appreciated by the target groups. They contributed to a change in mindsets.

EnJOY provided significant material support (e.g. computers, printers, photocopiers, motorbikes, office refurbishments, solar panels, etc.) both to the OSJC and to the TVET. The TVET also received significant new machinery and equipment, to establish new Business Incubation Centres (BIC) and to strengthen existing -or offer new- training courses in sectors believed to be promising in employment opportunities (e.g. on garment production, mechanics, automotive sector, etc.). The sustainability of the EnJOY material support is yet to be secured. Budget or funds are needed at the TVET for operations and maintenance and for future replacement of materials.

The important EnJOY support to SME and enterprises (Component 2) made part of the capacity-building trainings and is likely to be sustained. The sustainability of the SME and enterprises as such is yet to be proven, and dependent on many variables beyond project control. First results are positive.

EnJOY was successful in engaging with public agencies and institutes. It was less successful in forging firm and sustainable Public-Private Platforms on Job Creation (Component 4). EnJOY was instrumental in the piloting of the job seeker registration tool ET Works and in the production of manuals.

1. Introduction

1.1 Purpose of the evaluation

The Final Evaluation of the “Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women” (EnJOY) project in Ethiopia (administratively known as project number T05-EUTF-HOA-72-01), had the double purpose of accountability and learning. The evaluation assesses the EnJOY project progress in achieving results and impacts, and their value relevant to target beneficiaries, national needs and priorities. The Appendices and the Annexes form an integral part of the report.

The EnJOY project started in February 2020 for a duration of 42 months. A 6-months’ no-cost extension was awarded in July 2023, largely based on delays in project start and implementation due to the impacts of the Covid-19 crisis (as of March 2020). At the time of the Final Evaluation, consortium lead Caritas-Switzerland (CACH) and the other implementing partners (i.e. ECC-SDCO, VIS, VITA/RTA) expected project implementation to finish in January 2024 and final reporting by July 2024.

The Final Evaluation took place in December 2023, with reporting in January 2024. This evaluation report integrates most of the comments and observations received from Caritas-Switzerland and the consortium partners on an earlier report version.

1.2 Intended users

The intended users of the evaluation results and outcomes are the EnJOY implementing partners, the EnJOY project staff, donor the EU, and the relevant Federal Ministries, Regional Bureaus and Woreda Offices involved. The results of the Final Evaluation may be shared with other stakeholders and third parties by EnJOY, the public agencies involved and/or by donor the EU.

1.3 Scope and objectives of the evaluation

The overall evaluation question is whether, and to what extent, the EnJOY programme has been successful in enhancing the capacities of the local authorities in the project woredas to proactively support job seekers (youth and women in particular) to have better access to information on available job opportunities and job placement.

The Final Evaluation covered almost the entire project implementation period (February 2020-December 2023; i.e. 46 out of 48 months) and covers all components of the EnJOY project. The main project had four components. A fifth component was added with EU approval to allow for emergency support provided during the Covid-19 crisis. The evaluation takes account of the outcomes and recommendations of the EU Results Oriented Monitoring (ROM) carried out in October-November 2021 (Gatera, 2022).

The Final Evaluation followed a standardized approach and has been structured according to a set of evaluation questions, indicators and sources of information. The evaluation covers the following standard OECD/DAC criteria: 1) relevance & coherence; 2) effectiveness; 3) efficiency; 4) (initial) impacts, & Sustainability; and 5) cross-cutting issues (including youth, gender, and the environment). See the Evaluation Matrix in Annex 3.

1.4 Methodology

The Final Evaluation has been a largely qualitative and participatory exercise with extensive involvement and consultation of the project beneficiaries, the EnJOY project staff, the relevant Ministries and Bureaux involved at federal and regional levels, the woreda public agencies, and the donor EU. The evaluation aims to assess how the EnJOY project has been implemented, and what results and outcomes have been achieved.

Document review

The document review took place before, during and after the field visits. It provided insights into the proclaimed quantitative outputs of the project, the evolution of its implementation, the methods used, and the learnings already documented. The documentation received included a large number of EnJOY project documents (i.e. Project proposal document and budget, Project database, Base-line study, 6-monthly Progress reports, the Mid-Term Evaluation 2022, the ROM report 2022, and other activity reports). See the References section below.

Interviews with stakeholders

Qualitative insights into the results and outcomes of the EnJOY project have further been collected through key informant interviews and focus group discussions (FGD) with key stakeholders and through field observations where possible. Data collection was gender-disaggregated.

Interviews with key stakeholders took place in four of eight project woredas in Oromia (Adama Zuria and Gedeb Assosa Woredas), Central Ethiopia Region (Sankara Woreda) and Sidama Region (Dale Woreda). The local VIS team for Dale is based in nearby Dilla (Southern Ethiopia Region). The EnJOY activities in the Wollega Woredas could not be visited due to security issues and are thus only partially covered; through a face-to-face interview with implementing partner ECC-SDCO and through two telephone interviews.

The interviews and FGD were semi-structured according to a check-list of issues (see Annex 4) which was adapted to the position of the interviewee towards the EnJOY project. The check-lists were used and adjusted in an iterative manner in order to make strategic use of the time available and to elaborate on earlier responses by interviewees.

Interviews and FGD with project target groups/beneficiaries and other relevant key actors (i.e. project staff, Woreda public agencies, OSJC staff, TVET staff) are considered the most appropriate means for assessing the field-level interventions and results and outcomes of the EnJOY project and for gathering the views and experiences of different stakeholders in project implementation.

The interviews with stakeholders in Addis Ababa involved 11 persons (3 women, 8 men): the EnJOY implementing partners (CACH, ECC-SDCO, VIS, VITA/RTA), the EnJOY project staff, the Federal Ministry of Labour & Skills (MoLS) and the Oromia Regional Bureau of Labour & Skills. The field visits involved a total of 91 persons (34 women, 57 men). See Annex 2 for the list of persons met.

Sampling

The Evaluation team initially proposed to take a sample of OSJC, TVET and beneficiary groups (youth, women, etc.) to be included in the evaluation; based on information from the EnJOY Project database. Yet, the database information was not available to the team in time. The visit program therefore was largely established by the EnJOY implementing partners, based on a draft skeleton

program by the team of the stakeholder groups to be included. The visit program was approved by the team. The lack of independent sampling may possibly have resulted in some bias towards realised project results and outcomes. The team has tried to take this into account during interviews.

For data collection in the field, the evaluation team proposed four Woredas out of a total of six Woredas, based on two criteria: A) representation of all implementing partners; and B) representation of as many regions as possible (an EnJOY request). One selected Woreda (Dugna Fango; led by VITA/RTA) was changed by the team (for Sankura; also led by VITA/RTA) for logistical reasons. Another Woreda (Dilla in Southern Ethiopia Region; led by VIS) was changed on the request of VIS (for Gedeb Assosa in Oromia Region; led by CACH) to reduce the burden of the evaluation on the local VIS team. The evaluation team agreed to this, also considering that budget differences between Oromia and SNNPR would thus be better reflected in the overall visit program (i.e. as per project plan, two-thirds of the project budget was spent in Oromia, one-third in former SNNPR).

The woredas selected for field visits include both far-off woredas and woredas close-by. In each woreda, the time available was used for interviews with the implementing partner, with involved authorities and with direct beneficiaries (i.e. woreda agencies, OSJC, TVET, private actors, etc.). Interviews and FGD took place with EnJOY project selected final beneficiaries (e.g. youth, women), to assess project performance and impacts. In areas where administrative changes are currently leading to disperse public institutions (as is the case e.g. in Central Ethiopian Region - formerly part of SNNPR), significant in-woreda travel was required to meet the different stakeholders.

Independence of the evaluation

The evaluation team was able to conduct its work in all independence. The team was not pressured at any time into any particular decision on what to ask or discuss. The team was left free in carrying out its work according to the agreed methodology and programme.

The team was facilitated by consortium lead CACH for transport and driver. One staff member of the local implementing partner accompanied the team for logistical purposes and to introduce the team to stakeholders, after which that person would withdraw. The team extends its gratitude to the implementing partners for the smooth organisation of the visits.

Summary of the visit program and stakeholders interviewed

The full program of the mission, including the field visits, is available in Annex 2. It comprised a total of 14 days: 4 days of consultations with stakeholders in Addis Ababa, 8 days for interviews with key stakeholders and for focus group discussions (FGD) in five woredas in 3 regions (Oromia, Central Ethiopia and Southern Ethiopia – the latter two were part of the former SNNP Region), and 2 days for travel to and from the selected project woredas.

The evaluation team exchanged with all stakeholders mentioned in Annex 2. These include 102 persons (37 women, 65 men) who were met in bilateral exchanges and in FGD. The meetings with intended beneficiaries (youth, women, SME/enterprises) were group meetings. The staff of the OSJC and the TVET were interviewed at their office. Where possible, the materials granted by EnJOY were presented to the evaluation team.

Analysis of the findings

Analysis of the findings of the evaluation was carried out by the evaluation team during and after the field visits and interviews. A summary of the results and outcomes are available in the Appendices 2 to 6 for each of the woredas involved in this Final Evaluation.

The first initial results and outcomes of the evaluation team's findings and analysis was presented to the EnJOY project team during a Debriefing session at the CACH office in Addis Ababa (20 December 2023). This provided a first opportunity for the EnJOY implementing partners to feed back on the presentation and to contribute additional relevant information.

CACH and the other EnJOY implementing partners further reviewed an earlier version of this report and provided additional information. Their feed-back, comments and observations were highly appreciated and have been considered and integrated into this Final report where possible.

1.5 Limitations

Caritas-Switzerland launched the Final Evaluation of the EnJOY project late in the (extended) project period. The preparation time for the Evaluation team was not sufficient to carry out the review of documents before the field visits. Time did also not allow for independent sampling of interviewees by the evaluation team, as the EnJOY project database was not available to the team in time. The actual visit program was largely defined by the EnJOY implementing partners, based on a skeleton programme proposed by the team. The evaluation team agreed to the actual visit programme.

EnJOY is a significant and ambitious project working simultaneously on multiple project activities and subject matters. The number of stakeholders at all levels is important. The Evaluation team tried to address this diversity of actors, activities and subject matters during interviews. Time to go into detail with each of the stakeholder groups per woreda was limited. The evaluation team did not find time to include any third-party observers.

The results and outcomes of the evaluation are biased to the extent that rather more successful and/or more positive beneficiaries may possibly have been met with. The evaluation team tried to decrease this potential bias by using open questions, by creating spaces for open reflections and critical remarks, and by focusing on some potentially sensitive matters (e.g. collaboration between partners, budget allocation, procurement issues, gender issues, etc.) that would arise during the exchanges.

Time available for the evaluation was limited compared to the range of subject matters at hand. Pragmatic choices were made before and during the exercise (e.g. actors to interview, time available per woreda, type and number of intended beneficiaries to meet, the representativity of the actors encountered, the number of project activities reviewed in detail, the depth of analysis per interview and subject matter, etc.). The team considers, however, that this and above limitations do not majorly affect the overall analyses and findings below. The set-up and implementation of the evaluation allowed the consultants to have a good insight and understanding of the EnJOY project and to come to fair and relevant conclusions, recommendations and lessons learned.

1.6 Structure of the report

Section 2 provides a brief summary description of the EnJOY project. The main EnJOY project results and outcomes are presented in Section 3. Section 4 presents the main findings for each evaluation question. The main conclusions, recommendations and lessons learned are presented in section 5. Appendix 1 presents the EnJOY project achievements against the logical framework (of December 2023). The Appendices 2 to 6 provide summary reports of the interviews, for each of the woredas involved in this Final Evaluation. The Appendices are an integral part of this report.

2. Description of the development intervention

2.1 Project contexts

Youth unemployment is a big and growing problem in Ethiopia. An estimated 2 million people enter the labour market each year (JCC, 2020). The average population is very young, rural-urban migration is high (especially from conflict-affected zones), and the large public investments in education are paying off in many skilled youth graduating (from schools, TVET and universities). Youth unemployment is a socially and politically important issue relating both to skilled and unskilled youth. Job creation is thus a key issue at all administrative levels.

The “Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women project (EnJOY)” (2020-2024) was inspired, amongst others, by prior work of VIS and ECC-SDCO in the project “Stemming Migration for North and Central Ethiopia” (SINCE); and by prior work of VITA/RTA in the project “Resilience Building and Creation of Economic Opportunities in Ethiopia” (RESET II). Both projects focused on migrant-prone regions, particularly in Oromia, Amhara and SNNPR, and were supported by the European Union Trust Fund (EUTF). SINCE focused on rural towns and urban areas and some densely populated woredas, whilst RESET II focused on drought-prone and remote areas.

Thematically, SINCE focused on creating improved livelihood conditions, while RESET II worked, in addition to creating employment opportunities, on improving access to basic services and disaster risk management capacity (EUTF, 2018?). Another source of inspiration was the EUTF-funded project “RESET plus Youth Empowerment for a Successful Transition to Decent Work (RESET Plus YEP)” (2018-2022), implemented in the Amhara and Somali Regions by NGO Save the Children in collaboration with Oxfam, UNISOD and ORDA.

The EnJOY project was designed to support the Ethiopian government’s Rural Job Opportunity Creation Strategy (2017) and the work of the Job Creation Commission (2018-2022; now part of the Ministry of Labour & Social Affairs – MoLS). EnJOY specifically aimed to support public agencies in service delivery to unemployed youth and women. Main partners at regional, zonal and woreda level are: Bureaus of Finance & Economic Cooperation, Labour & Social Affairs, Women, Children & Youth Affairs, Enterprise & Development Cooperation, and Technical Vocational Education & Training.

2.2 Project description

The “Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY)” project aims to enhance the capacities of local authorities in Ethiopia to proactively support job seekers (youth and women in particular) to have better access to information on available job opportunities and job placements. The project is being implemented by a consortium of civil society partners coordinated by Caritas-Switzerland (CACH). Other consortium partners are the Ethiopian NGO ECC-SDCO, the Italian NGO VIS and the Irish NGO VITA/RTA. The total EnJOY project budget is EUR 9.7 million. The EU financial contribution is EUR 8.7 million (i.e. 90% of total eligible costs) for an actual 48 months’ period (February 2020 - January 2024). Project implementation will be finalised by 31 January 2024 and reporting by 31 July 2024.

Target areas of the EnJOY project are eight woredas (i.e. districts): four in Oromia (Adama, Gedeb Assosa, Gimbi and Sibule), one in Sidama (Dale), one Central Ethiopia Region (Sankura) and two in Southern Ethiopia Region (Dilla Zuria, Dugna Fango). The woredas were pre-selected by the regional governments (of Oromia and the former SNNPR) prior to the EnJOY project formulation. The

evaluation team was not able to trace back through interviews with the EU and the project partners the exact criteria for selection of the eight project woredas. These likely included: a high rate of unemployment, a high rate of regular and irregular international migration, the number of migrant returnees from Arab states (especially from Saudi Arabia and Sudan), and the lack of employment opportunities.

In order to tackle the constraints and needs of unemployed youth and women, the EnJOY project approached them through existing public structures which are mandated to support job seekers. The target groups consist of individuals (unemployed youth, women and Internally Displaced Persons - IDP), students of Technical and Vocational Education and Training Institutes (TVET), of groups organized in small and medium-size enterprises (SME), and of public institutions (job centres, TVET, government line offices). Some private TVET also benefited from the EnJOY project support.

The public and private agencies all act as intermediaries but they benefit directly as well from EnJOY project support in order for them to provide better services to the target groups. Some other private agencies benefitted through contract-based service provision to the EnJOY project (e.g. those involved in Training of Trainers (ToT)).

The project's stated objective is "to enhance the capacities of local authorities to actively support job seekers to have better information on available job opportunities." EnJOY has four main components. ("Components" is preferred over "Outcomes" as in Project document - as "Outcomes" cannot be implemented but at best be achieved after implementation of the project activities.).

Component 1 focused on the transformation of existing public job centres into One-Stop-Job-Centres (OSJC). A best practices model for OSJC was designed, existing centres were refurbished, and additional ones established. Service-oriented trained staff shall deliver effective and efficient information for job seekers, potential entrepreneurs and existing SME. A public-private-partnership (PPP) platform at district level should ensure information exchange and strengthen linkages between the public employment system and the private sector. One online job portal was intended to be established on woreda level and to be linked to existing platforms on regional and national level in order to inform about skills development and employment opportunities.

Component 2 aimed to strengthen the private sector, mainly SME run by women and youth. An elaborate labour market assessment was done to identify promising sectors and value chains in the target districts that would have a high potential in creating jobs and self-employment opportunities. Young and potential entrepreneurs would be provided with business trainings and linked up with access to finance. A special loan and credit scheme was to be developed together with local finance institutes to best support startups and to increase the number of people with access to loans.

Component 3 aimed to improve the capacity of the TVET and to support them introducing market-requested new short- and medium-term trainings, to improve existing curricula with new thematic fields, and to link graduates to employment/internship opportunities through Work-Based Learning Schemes (WBLS) in cooperation with the private sector. The TVET would be refurbished and the required workshops for diversified and new practical trainings be installed. Trainers were to receive advanced skills trainings. A Business Incubation Centre (BIC) was to be established at each TVET to support graduates and newcomers in self-employment, through skills training in business planning and financial literacy.

Component 4 intended to establish a public-private partnership (PPP) at national level that shall manage and assess the effectiveness of the projects' active labour policies and employment measures. This PPP would strengthen linkages between the public employment service sector and businesses at regional and national level. The impact of the implemented employment schemes was

to be assessed yearly and recommendations for active labour market measures were to be given to enhance the sustainability of the governance system and the implementation of the National Rural Job Opportunity Creation Strategy. EnJOY planned to develop a MEAL methodology for use by the public agencies, to assess the Job Opportunity Creation Strategy, to evaluate its efficiency, and to assess if and to which extent the PPP clusters enhanced an increased demand in the targeted sectors and rural areas.

Component 5 was added after project start to take into account the food and protective items support provided by EnJOY in the project woredas during the Covid-19 crisis (to the value of 5% of the total budget).

2.3 Project intervention logic

The project has been conceived to address the root causes of limited economic opportunities and unemployment by means of stimulating economic development and job opportunities. The project partners recognize the multi-faceted challenges to reduce unemployment and to improve youth, women and IDP engagement in diversified economic opportunities.

Based on prior assessments, the project partners identified key gaps in the project woredas being: the limited government policy implementation capacity (including for job centres), the limitations of existing PPP, a lack of diversified economic opportunities, limited access to finance, and skill gaps. Activities were planned to address these gaps systematically. In this, the role of the EnJOY project was not on job creation as such but rather on “strengthening of the capacities of public and private business service providers, and on facilitating synergies in a systematic approach for sustainable interventions that might last beyond the project period”. The project envisaged job creation measures to be piloted by different levels of government through authorities’ capacity-building and structural improvements, increasing in the long run the management of economic and job opportunities for the target groups.

The general approach of the project was to primarily facilitate existing systems, service providers and government offices. The project did not intend to establish any double structure, but wished to use the momentum of the project to strengthen the public system to provide better services and a healthy service environment. EnJOY aimed to intervene strategically at all levels and to support operations and service delivery at woreda and kebele level by public agencies. It also wished to facilitate policy change and policy harmonisation at higher levels interconnecting different levels with active exchange mechanisms (CACH, 2019).

2.4 Theory of Change

The EnJOY Project document describes the Project Intervention Logic, but not the Theory of Change sustaining it. Below we describe and reconstruct the EnJOY Theory of Change (ToC).

In fact, the project partners identified a mismatch between labour on offer and labour demand. There are many new entrants in the labour market for which no job opportunities are (as yet) available. Labour on offer is in excess compared to labour demand, and the characteristics of the labour on offer do often not match with the kind of labour demanded by the market. Technical skills tend to be available but they are not necessarily up-to-date and adequate to be directly applicable in the jobs on offer. Many TVET colleges are too under-resourced to ensure that their trainees have sufficient practical skills next to their theoretical skills. Many trained youth moreover lack certain soft skills, such as life skills, appropriate work attitudes, skills in customer orientation, or entrepreneurial

and business skills. In the project woredas, these gaps are considered to fuel outmigration, either regular migration or irregular migration, and a high number of returnees looking for employment.

Economic opportunities, job creation and entrepreneurship are high on the agendas of the Ethiopian government at different administrative levels. Job centres had been put in place by the responsible offices and agencies but these lacked harmonised OSJC guidelines, and turned out to be understaffed and under-resourced. Many TVET were also lacking adequate machinery, equipment and sometimes even trainers and technical staff, to live up to the requirements of the labour market. Linkages between the OSJC, TVET and the private sector were considered too few and too little to provide adequate synergy between their respective activities. Services to help trainees into jobs or into self-employment were in short.

EnJOY identified the gaps and the potential of the public agencies, the OSJC, the TVET and of public-private platforms to support job seekers and aspiring entrepreneurs. EnJOY saw good opportunities for improvement provided that the entities would be supported in a tailor-made fashion, based on adequate needs and gap assessments, in full consultation with their staff, and be supported in kind through infrastructural and material investments. Three major needs and gaps assessments were realised in the eight woredas: a Labour Market assessment (ICOS, 2021), an OSJC assessment (NSC, 2021) and a TVET assessment (F&S, 2021).

2.5 Monitoring & Evaluation

The EnJOY project followed a clear Monitoring & Evaluation policy. It put in place in 2022 (i.e. halfway the project) an internal M&E system with a plan and a manual for Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Learning (MEAL). As required by the EU, the consortium produced and submitted Quarterly and Annual Progress reports. At the time of the evaluation, the report for August-October 2023 was in progress. The latest available Financial Progress report dates from July 2023. A Mid-Term Review was carried out in mid-2022.

EnJOY developed a M&E manual (Malacarne, 2022) that is concise and clear about operating procedures for annual surveys using Kobo, with data being collected by project staff. The project also developed a digital tool for visualisation of the MEAL data on the application Power BI.

EnJOY was subject to a Mid-Term Review (in April-May 2022) and to an EU-commissioned Results-Oriented Monitoring (ROM) visit (in November 2022). Both exercises stated that the EnJOY project was largely on the right track and achieving most of the formulated project results and outcomes. A no-cost extension was advised. Some recommendations (see below) came out for specific elements of the project design and implementation.

The Mid-Term Review included a quantitative survey under 280 project beneficiaries in Gedeb Assosa, Adama, Dale, Dilla, Sankura, and Dugna Fango Woredas, focus group discussions (32) and key informant interview (118 persons). The MTR recommendations (Miklol, 2022) are summarized as follows:

- a. Revise project plan for the remaining program period in a way that targets represent existing contexts and induce for higher results. Revise the logframe and the budget.
- b. Request the EU for a low-cost or no-cost extension for six months to a year.
- c. Strengthen the regional steering committees with necessary budgets to ensure sustainability.
- d. Strengthen the EnJOY field office structures at woreda level ensuring an appropriate professional mix between SME and TVET experts.
- e. Follow-up and ensure effective transfer of duties and responsibilities of signatory government organs to the new and revised administrative structures.

- f. Reinforce communication and reporting systems. Strengthen information verification and feedback mechanisms. Strengthen joint review meetings with relevant stakeholders.

The conclusions and recommendations of the ROM visit were as follows (Gatera, 2022):

- a. The project is progressing well. It is still relevant and effective and it is leading to sustainable improvements. The resources are efficiently used but a no cost extension is required.
- b. The OSJC are open to the beneficiaries and have been equipped with desktop computers, tablets, office tables and other equipment (e.g. solar panels). However, some of the OSJC do not use their desktop computer due to lack of electricity, access to internet, while some of staff members do not know how to operate them. The project partners should train all OSJC staff on how to use their computers and to make all training centres operational (access to electricity and internet connectivity, at least).
- c. The guidelines and tools for an improved Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Learning (MEAL) system on Rural Job Opportunity Creation are under development but the system is not yet led by an empowered PPP. The project partners should speed up work on the MEAL tool and on engagement with the private sector for ownership and scaling-up.
- d. The revised EnJOY logframe submitted by CACH in July 2022, as a follow up to the Mid-term Review, had not yet been fed back on, or been approved, by the EU.

3. EnJOY project results and outcomes

In this section, we present the main quantitative results and outcomes (as per December 2023) of the EnJOY project as reported through two lines: the application Power BI and the Logframe table.

3.1 Power BI data

The Power BI data were made available to the evaluation team through an Internet link, which provides direct access to the project's M&E dashboard of indicators, targets and achievements. The link is not available for public use. The dashboard is visually attractive, it provides numbers on EnJOY achievements. The data can be disaggregated per woreda, and per OSJC and TVET supported. A separate MEAL plan provides summary information and references to where the raw data could be found. These refer e.g. to Kobo survey results kept at the CACH intranet.

According to Power BI data (18 January 2024), the EnJOY project supported amongst others:

- 95 One-Stop-Job Centres;
- 3,893 government staff; through training in one or more of the following issues: ToT life skills/entrepreneurship/work readiness, ET Works application, Coaching and mentoring, Microfinance, BIC training, basic computer skills, etc.;
- 1,099 SME (having 6,252 members) (42% women, 58% men);
- 13 A/TVET, of which 11 were renovated and/or equipped;
- 499 A/TVET trainers (21% women, 78% men) were trained on one or more of the following issues: Business incubation, Agro-processing, Garment/Apparel, ICT, International financial reporting standards (IFRS), Life skills, Metal works, Proposal writing, AutoCAD, etc.;
- 12 Business Incubation Centres (BIC) were established, renovated and/or equipped.

The linkage between the Power BI data and project management is not evident to the evaluation team. The Power BI data are incomplete regarding reference values (baseline values, target values) that would allow appreciation of current values. No summary report of the Power BI information was available, e.g. outlining the main results, outcomes, conclusions and recommendations as perceived by the EnJOY project team.

3.2 EnJOY Logframe data

The latest and updated Logframe was shared by the EnJOY M&E unit on 5 January 2024. The document presents the EnJOY achievements until 12 December 2023. See Appendix 1.

The EnJOY Logframe raises some questions and concerns about the robustness and the applicability of the M&E data collected for project management. For example:

- (Impact level 1.1) (indicator) The “# of unemployed registered” is not equivalent to (indicator) “# of people with access to diversified economic opportunities”. No estimate is available for “Current value 12 December 2023”.
- (Impact level 1.2) The baseline value assumes that the number of people able to improve their employment situation before and/or without the project is zero. The indicator has no target value and reference year. It does have a current value, but it is unclear what the number implies for project management.
- (Impact level 1.3) The baseline value assumes that the number of people that could increase their income before and/or without the project is zero. The indicator has no target value and reference year. It does have a current value, but it is unclear what the number implies for project management. Why is the number only one-fifth of the number under 1.2?

- The data for 1.1 to 1.3 are partially, but not as consistently, disaggregated as was planned. Specification on sector, age and/or IDP/non-IDP is missing.
- (Outcome level 1.2) “Jobs facilitated by OSJC”: Whys is the target value missing? When is a “job” a job (e.g. regarding duration, payment level, compared to instruction level)? When can it be attributed to the OSJC? How sustainable are these jobs? Is double-counting possible (short jobs)? Etc.
- (Outcome level 3.1) Is the “# of people benefitting from A/TVET that were able to improve their employment situation” different from “# of people benefitting from A/TVET”? Are all to be attributed to the EnJOY project? Was the value ‘zero’ before the project? Would it be without the project? Why is there no target value defined?

The Logframe often states that baseline value is “zero”. This implies that the project principally monitors its own contributions to the job creation and entrepreneurship environment in the selected project woredas. As such, the project does not measure what other actors (e.g. other public and private agencies, job seekers themselves and entrepreneurs wishing to start or strengthen their business) are doing in the fields of youth (un)employment, job creation and business and entrepreneurship development; either in the selected woreda or elsewhere.

The evaluation team therefore considers that the M&E system appears to be good quality to present the EnJOY project activities and results. However, it does not allow adequate analysis of these results in relation to the baseline situation and/or to target values. It does also not allow for an appreciation of the project results and outcomes in relation to the larger challenge of unemployment per woreda, and/or to any other support mechanisms that are around (e.g. public investment budget for OSJC, public funds for TVET, support available to SME outside the project woredas, etc.).

Overall, the M&E system appears to the evaluation team to be elaborate but complex and difficult to sustain without ensured and adequate follow-up budget for, and organisation of, regular and independent surveys. The team acknowledges that the M&E system largely follows from the logical framework and the project approach agreed at project start.

4. Findings

In this section, evidence collected during the evaluation is analysed and findings are presented per evaluation question (EQ). Reference is made to the Logframe (as per December 2023) in Appendix 1. Analysis inputs from field visits are available from the Appendices 2 to 6.

4.1 Relevance & Coherence

EQ 1.1 Did the project objective and design remain relevant over time?

The EnJOY project aimed for a systemic and integrated approach to supporting public agencies' capacity providing information about job opportunities to unemployed youth. This objective remains relevant today. The estimated number of new entrants in the job market is high (some 2 million per year) and job opportunities are scarce and hard to come by. Projects such as EnJOY shall therefore be designed to be up-scalable if successful.

The "systemic and integrated approach" led EnJOY to support both public agencies, OSJC, TVET and PPP. This is relevant from the perspective of the labour market, where supply, demand and linkage are all interacting. You want to support the training of skills that are demanded by market actors. From the perspective of project management, however, a more limited range of components, activities and interactions could potentially smoothen project implementation and increase the project's effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability. Also, less components and activities would allow for more focused M&E in view of any future upscaling and replication.

EQ 1.2 To what extent does the project address the needs and priorities of clients/beneficiaries?

Unemployment and job creation are cross-cutting issues affecting the entire population; both men and women, adolescent boys and girls, abled and disabled people, married and unmarried people, average mixed-parents families and female-headed households, etc. Each of these groups has specific needs and requirements related to the workplace which merit to be taken into account in any job creation policies and strategies.

The EnJOY project partners pursued a deliberate policy of equal representation of women and men in the project activities. This contributed to achieving an estimated actual percentage of 35-40% participation of women as beneficiaries of the project activities (based on Power BI data and on the ratio of men and women participants in the evaluation). This figure is much higher than what could be expected e.g. based on the ratio of women in public agencies' staff (only some 15%).

Even though EnJOY carried out several assessments prior to project start, this did not include a gender assessment of the project and of the main stakeholders involved. As such, no Gender Action Plan is available. Yet, EnJOY did engage a Gender & Social Inclusion officer until early-2023, who was in charge of gender integration in the various activities.

All project partners followed deliberate policies favouring the inclusion of disabled persons as was witnessed at different project sites. A number of interviewees identified as Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) or as returnees from Arab countries (here Saudi Arabia and Lebanon).

EQ 1.3 Are the expected results still consistent with the national priorities?

The EnJOY project is in line with the main Ethiopian policies related to youth (un)employment, job creation and entrepreneurship, and in particular with the Plan of Action for Job Creation (2020-2015)

(JCC, 2020) and the later Ten Years' Development Plan (2021-2030) of the Ethiopia Planning and Development Commission (GoE, 2021). Consultations and exchanges with public actors are regular.

The Ethiopian Government's Plan of Action for Job Creation (2020-2025) aims "to foster the business environment and conditions necessary to create 14 million jobs by 2025, to absorb the currently unemployed, and to ensure that jobs are waiting for new entrants to the labour force." The plan implied an important paradigm shift from state-led to private-sector-led growth. Six strategies were formulated (JCC, 2020):

1. Remodelling government support to incentivize enterprise growth and self-reliance, through notably a better targeting of high-growth SME, the inclusion of high-potential sectors, shifting from a mandatory "group" perspective to more "empowered individuals" and a consensual partnership approach, and strengthening the role of families and communities in enterprise formation.
2. Improving the quality of business development services (BDS), to provide demand-driven skill development support and BDS and supporting the development of incubators and accelerators and facilitate SME access to information.
3. Improving SME access to finance, by notably establishing a partial public credit guarantee scheme, improving MFI capacity to provide adequate financing and supporting the development of innovative financial products for start-ups.
4. Improving local value chains and market linkages through horizontal and vertical integration, by establishing sectoral clusters for SME focused on manufacturing, networking and horizontal collaboration, improve SME access to public procurement, and promote domestic linkages with foreign investors (e.g. industrial parks).
5. Improving the competitiveness and access to technology for SME, by promoting technology diffusion, including in collaboration with universities and sectoral research institutes, providing incentives for high-growth SME to increase their access to inputs, and promoting innovation through funding by the Jobs Creation Fund.
6. Improving the business environment for SME, by streamlining bureaucratic and regulatory procedures, facilitating business opening and closure procedures, access to sheds and lands, and access to electricity and infrastructure.

The EnJOY project was designed to contribute to the above Plan of Action of the former Job Creation Commission (JCC), which later was integrated into the regular ministerial, regional and woreda office strategies. The project also supported public policy development through the elaboration of guidelines and a manual for Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability & Learning (MEAL) on job opportunity creation, which were formally handed over during a high-level event in September 2022.

EQ 1.4 How adequate is the project design (e.g. log frame coherence, linkages between components and activities) in supporting the activities and expected outcomes?

EQ 1.5 To what extent is the intervention coherent, both internal (among its different components) and externally (with other interventions in the country)?

The latest EnJOY logical framework (December 2023) was found by the evaluation team to be of moderate to meagre quality; for the following reasons:

- The terminology of the logframe is considered confusing. The project is composed of "Outcomes" but these are rather "Components". Outcomes go beyond the results or output level that the project and its management can directly influence.
- The definition of higher-level indicators is insufficiently clear. How to calculate indicator 1.1 ("the number of people with access to diversified economic opportunities")? When is their "access"? When are opportunities "diversified"? What is the value of an "opportunity"? This higher-level indicator cannot be measured through "the number of unemployed registered"

(as stated in the Baseline column). Similar concerns exist regarding indicators 1.2 (“able to improve their employment situation”) and 1.3 (“could increase their income”).

- For a number of indicators, there are no baseline values.
- Some higher-level indicators (e.g. Overall objective 1.2 and 1.3) lack target values.
- Most data are disaggregated by gender but not by sector, age and IDP/non-IDP.

Otherwise, measurable output indicators are available and have been reported upon.

The ENJOY logframe has been revised a couple of times during project period. In view of the Covid-19 crisis, Outcome 5 was added as per June 2020 to take into account the food and protective items support provided by ENJOY (to the value of 5% of the total budget).

The ENJOY project was found to be coherent with the national policies and with similar interventions on job opportunity creation. As stated above, it was inspired by the SINCE project, by RESET II, and by the RESET Plus YEP project in Amhara and Somali regions. It is also understood to have been complementary to long-term GIZ investments in the TVET sector; and congruent e.g. with other youth employment and entrepreneurship projects such as “Employable Youth in Ethiopia” (EYE) (2018-2022) working with TVET and local communities in Addis Ababa, Hawassa and SNNPR.

4.2 Effectiveness

EQ 2.1 To what extent has the project achieved the expected results and outcomes?

EQ 2.2 & EQ 2.3 Which intended and unintended results have been generated (positive, negative)?

Are they contributing to the achievement of the project's objectives?

EQ 2.4 Are the expected outcomes likely to be achieved?

The ENJOY project has been successful as a consortium composed of different NGOs, working in Ethiopia for many years, to elaborate with public agencies at all administrative levels (i.e. federal, regional, zone, woreda, kebele). ENJOY focused especially on the regional and the woreda levels - in Oromia and parts of SNNPR (now Central Ethiopia Region, Sidama Region, Southern Ethiopia Region).

ENJOY supported both the OSJC (under Component 1) and the TVET (under Component 3) through the training of staff (Training of Trainers - ToT) and through material support to enhance their operational capacities. This capacity-building is expected to remain relevant to contexts also after the project period. The ENJOY support on business development and entrepreneurship contributed to leveraging substantial structural change at OSJC and TVET; e.g. through material support (e.g. office renewal, computers, printers, photocopiers, motorbikes, etc.), and e.g. through the establishment of new Business Incubation Centres (BIC) and the start of new technical courses at TVET.

The ENJOY support to individual SME and businesses primarily benefitted those directly concerned. The exact material support differed according to the business plans, the sector and the initiators’ capabilities and needs. Their potential to leveraging change in the job market is uncertain. Most SME/enterprises consist of groups that did not emerge organically but were organised through external OSJC support. This may affect their internal cohesion and sustainability over time. The support they receive is temporary and so is their access to market sheds. The market sheds are generally located on a central and attractive spot, but their use is limited to maximum 5 years, after which relocation is required. Relocation may jeopardise the continuity of the business.

Many SME/enterprises and/or individuals supported through ENJOY are small or micro in size, and may not be expected to grow fast or big generating a lot of additional employment in the short term. Some of the established enterprises may be valid but may not be considered “innovative” as their services would likely be available in the market (e.g. retail of coffee & tea sales, fruit & vegetables,

etc.) but this is dependent on the added value of the new business e.g. in terms of customer care, product range, quality of product and service, etc. Any signs of replacement and outcompeting of other market actors shall ideally be monitored.

For the groups and individuals concerned, the project support on SME and enterprises has certainly brought big and positive change, as was evidenced in interviews. Material support (e.g. for machinery and equipment) helped them to kickstart and/or expand their activities. The ENJOY trainings enhanced their entrepreneurial attitude and skills, their leadership, and helped them to access infrastructure and government support. The enterprises networked, participated in market bazars, and many enterprises diversified their business. Service provision was improved thanks to the different trainings (e.g. on customer relations). Some will have had financial and economic success, others may not. This is common for starting SME and enterprises. Partial failure shall be accounted for. Not all SME/enterprises supported will be able to sustain and to create jobs for others.

ENJOY also worked on the gaps between the institutions and the labour market; e.g. facilitating TVET to private/public sector linkages, OSJC to private /public sector linkages, the establishment of Work-Based Learning Schemes (WBLS), cooperative training, apprenticeship, mentoring and coaching support for youth entering the labour market, etc. These linkages are understood from interviews to be important and to be new and additional to common practice.

On some issues, the ENJOY work on linkages was less or little successful (e.g. the linkage to financial actors - i.e. RuSACCO/MFI/banks). Access to finance remains a barrier for new starting businesses without a track record or major assets. Revolving Funds were established with ENJOY support in most project woredas, but not in all because of the (known) non-acceptance of loan interest in some (not all) Muslim-dominated areas. The size of the Revolving Funds is relatively small (a few million ETB per woreda); and likely too small to manage and sustain as a separate fund or many years.

The Business Incubation Centres (BIC) established at the A/TVET and the IBIC competitions that ENJOY organised are regarded to be highlights for bringing about a change in mindset amongst youth and amongst public staff of the employment support agencies. The Business Incubation Centres (BIC) at the TVET and the IBIC competitions were highly appreciated by the target groups. The trainings and the competitions appear to have contributed to a change in mindsets. The focus on the opportunities for entrepreneurship and the related technical, social and life skills required, appears to have unleashed new entrepreneurial dynamics.

The stated objective of ENJOY was to help local public service providers “to proactively support job seekers to have **better access to information** on available job opportunities and job placements”. Information from the market needs to be made available to job seekers, and information about job seekers needs to be made available to those looking for employees. Job seeker registration is therefore important, as is job vacancy information. Equipment is required for OSJC to carry out their basic functions. New OSJC were considered necessary to ensure better access of job seekers (especially from rural areas) to the registration system.

The material support of the ENJOY project to public agencies, OSJC and TVET has been important. Material support generally included e.g. desks, tables, computers, printers, photocopying machines and motorbikes. The job centres were refurbished into OSJC and the offices renovated or upgraded. The number of staff per OSJC increased. Also, and based on labour market assessment, selected TVET received significant numbers of relevant but expensive and hard-to-get machinery and equipment for upgrading their existing courses and to develop new areas of specialization and new types of (short-term, and sometimes fee-based) technical courses.

The evaluation team agrees that the material support to the OSJC is functional in principle in enhancing the agencies' information function. Yet, the sustainability of the material support is a concern: sustainability is not ensured unless the government and the institutions would explicitly agree and engage to take over, take care of, maintain and feed in with an operations and maintenance budget and a future replacement strategy and fund for machinery and equipment. For the material support to TVET similar concerns apply.

Appendix 1 presents the latest EnJOY logframe and the achievements of the project until 12 December 2023. The evaluation team added a coloured column indicating its appreciation of the performance per indicator. The colours shall be interpreted as follows:

- Red: Not according to plan.
- Orange: No target set. Partially achieved. Significant underperformance.
- Yellow: Largely achieved. Limited underperformance.
- Green: Fully or almost fully achieved. As planned.
- Light blue: More achieved than was planned. Limited overperformance.
- Dark blue: Much more achieved than planned. High overperformance.

High (red) and limited (orange) underperformance is considered “concerning” as it indicates (partial) non-achievement. High (dark blue) and limited (light blue) overperformance is also considered “concerning” in the sense that project management achieved (much) more results than was planned according to the latest revised Logframe (December 2023).

Based on this Logframe assessment, the team's impression is that the EnJOY project management did not have adequate grip at least on some activities, as the reported achievements were either (much) lower or (much) higher than was planned. The team does not have a clear explanation for this. It may possibly be explained in part by a lack of adequacy of the logframe, and/or by a lack of grip of the EnJOY project management on the implementation by the project partners.

In any case, the EnJOY project does appear to have realized most of its stated objectives. It has contributed to substantial investment, capacity-building and upgrading of public actors' ability to assess and support job seekers' needs for employment opportunities. The regional and woreda public agencies, the OSJC and the TVET all enhanced and expanded their capacities to serve unemployed and underemployed youth, women and vulnerable groups (disabled, IDP, returnees, etc.). The appreciation of the EnJOY project's activities was high and unequivocal by all interviewees.

The project largely achieved its objectives under Components 1 (OSJC) and Components 3 (TVET). The achievements under Component 2 are harder to interpret, both in quantity (no clear target values) and in quality (When is a starting enterprise considered to be established and functional? When is it sustainable? Are all members contributing equally? What happens once it has to relocate, as the market shed is temporary? Etc.). Also, the proclaimed achievements on access to finance for SME and members of SME (under 2.2: 227% and 277% respectively) have not been confirmed in interviews.

The achievements under Component 4 are also less clear (An evidence paper is produced: Is it good and helpful, and to whom? A MEAL Manual was delivered: Is it complete, helpful and used, and by whom? Etc). It is also unclear how the outputs under Component 4 would lead to the establishment of strong, sustainable and self-sustained Public Private Partnerships (PPP) (When would that be the case? Who is the owner, and who manages? Is there a budget? Etc.) – whereas this is also a stated objective of EnJOY. The number of PPP organized is substantially lower than planned. Job Creation Steering Committees have hardly been held. It is not clear whether this is due to internal (e.g. the project convening power) and/or to external factors (e.g. limited availability of regional authorities).

EnJOY approached the labour market from two sides – the job demand side (i.e. labour on offer) and the employment supply side (i.e. labour demand). A labour market assessment was carried out to define which sectors of the economy would be most promising to invest in for employment creation. Assessments were also carried out of the “vehicles” for change: the job centres (later turned into One-Stop-Job-Centres – OSJC) and the TVET institutions in the project woredas. EnJOY subsequently formulated interventions to support the matching of labour offer and labour demand (through the OSJC, job placement, school-to-work mentoring, etc.) and to increase the employability of the unemployed (youth, women, disabled, etc.).

Market actors were involved in the EnJOY project e.g. through consultations, labour market assessment, job placements, the set-up of Work-Based Learning Schemes (WBLS) etc. Other market actors provided services to EnJOY project implementation. The evaluation team is of the impression that market actors could have been more integrated in EnJOY as a vehicle -and a target- for the planning and the realization of job opportunity creation. Markets lead the demand for labour and thus also the type and quality of that labour. Industry associations, import/export bodies, financial institutions, big institutional investors and foreign investment bodies involved in Ethiopian import/exports, for example, could possibly have been more involved indicating the actual needs and gaps in terms of the quantity and the quality of current and future labour demand.

Any high-level ministerial decision-making on large investments in specific sectors (e.g. agriculture, energy, industry, ICT, the service sector, etc.) also have huge implications for the public demand of specific skilled and unskilled labour, and therefore for the orientation that TVET and OSJC should or could provide. The evaluation team did not encounter any particular indices reflecting the EnJOY assessment of, responses to, or anticipation on, such evolving politics and contexts.

The EnJOY project has been influenced, and has responded to, changing environments in terms of politics, security and conflict, to the best of its knowledge and understanding. EnJOY adjusted its initial planning to the Covid-19 crisis, dedicating part of its budget (approx. 5%) to emergency support on food and protective items, after prior approval by the EU. The project also evacuated some of its international staff in late 2021 when the violent Tigray crisis broke out. The project appears to have been adequately agile on these matters; these major events did not induce major project delays.

The Evaluation team did not encounter, though, any additional labour market assessments to better understand the impacts of these major political, social and economic events on the economy and on the quantity and quality of labour demand. For example: A) certain investors (especially foreign investors) will have withdrawn their (intended) investments; B) the USA decided to withdraw Ethiopia of the AGOA free trade arrangements, especially affecting the textile industry; C) workers of Tigrayan identity fled other parts of the country for reasons of insecurity; D) Amharan people reportedly felt unsafe in Oromia due to increasing political and violent conflict, etc. All this (and more) must have had, and likely continues to have, significant impacts in the labour markets.

EQ 2.5 What is the quality of the M&E system?

The EnJOY project followed a clear Monitoring & Evaluation policy. As required by the EU, it produced and submitted Quarterly and Annual Progress reports. The project developed a concise and comprehensive digital tool for Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Learning (MEAL). The Power BI link provides direct access to the project’s M&E dashboard of indicators, targets and achievements. The link does not relate current values to baseline values and/or target values.

The M&E system presents the EnJOY project activities and results. Yet, it does not allow comparison of some main indicators to the baseline situation and/or to target values. The system does not relate

the project results and outcomes to the larger environment and challenges of unemployment per woreda, and/or to other support mechanisms. See section 3 above.

EnJOY commissioned a timely Mid-Term Review (in April-May 2022) and it received an EU-commissioned Results-Oriented Monitoring (ROM) visit (in November 2022). Both mid-term exercises confirmed that the EnJOY project was largely on the right track and achieving most of the formulated project results and outcomes. A no-cost extension was advised to compensate for understandable delays related to the Covid-19 crisis.

4.3 Efficiency

EQ 3.1 To what extent has the project been effective and efficient?

EQ 3.2 Has the intervention encountered any delays and was the planning revised accordingly?

EQ 3.4 To what extent is the project efficient in executing the resources??

The EnJOY project appears to have been implemented in an effective manner. The activities planned and the outputs expected have generally been achieved, within the budget at hand. Delays in implementation occurred at project start due to the Covid-19 crisis and later the crisis in Northern Ethiopia. The delivery of food and protective items during the Covid-19 crisis, and following review of the project budget, contributed to gaining trust and confidence from the public agencies and the communities. This was also beneficial to implementation of the project later on.

The administrative changes in 2023 in the SNNP region and in the Adama areas, caused some public staff turnover and led to some discontinuity in public involvement in, and attention for, the project. This may have an impact on the local processes of handing-over after project closure. Delays encountered were related to local conflicts and security issues, especially in the Wollega areas and in some parts of Oromia. In all, the consortium still managed to implement the project with only a six months' no-cost extension.

Procurement of materials and equipment was an important part of the EnJOY project. The procurement was delegated to each of the implementing partners; it was decentralized. The evaluation team did not have time to assess to what extent procurement procedures were similar (or different) between implementing partners, and how efficient procurement has been.

The evaluation team has not been able to assess the efficiency of the project implementation in detail. It is noted that the project did not have any major hard targets to allow such an analysis; it wanted "to improve the access to information on job opportunities". Also, the team lacked comparative data e.g. for an analysis of the costs per unit (i.e. per OSJC, TVET, SME, etc – or per job seeker, TVET student, etc.). The team considers that the high overachievement on trainings (see Appendix 1), and the important investments made per OSJC and TVET, would merit further analysis. That analysis would serve defining, planning and budgeting any upscaling activities in the current woredas, and/or elsewhere in Ethiopia.

EQ 3.3 Have the modalities and quality of implementation, the institutional structure and governance of the project, the financial, technical and operational resources and procedures in place contributed to or hindered the achievement of the project's results and objectives?

The EnJOY project implementation structure consists of four NGOs who collaborate in principle as equal partners without any hierarchy. Caritas Switzerland (CACH) is the consortium lead. The budgets differed though between the project partners according to the region in which they were implementing. CACH and ECC-SDCO roughly managed double the funds managed by VIS and

VITA/RTA. On the request of donor EU, two-thirds of the budget was dedicated to Oromia region and one-third to the (previous) SNNP region. This is reportedly motivated by the size of total population per region. For the implementing partners, this budget division between the regions was a given.

The evaluation team observed that all implementing partners had a similar understanding and implementation of the project. Communication between the partners was reported by all to be good, fluent, frequent and productive. Disbursement of payments during the project period has also been adequately fluent and timely. As far as budget expenditure posed concerns, it was related to underspending because of exchange rate issues between Euro, Swiss franc and Ethiopian birr. At project start the exchange rate EUR:ETB was around 1:30. Today it is around 1:60. The purchasing power of the project thus was higher than planned. The inflation of the Ethiopian birr compensated for this in part through higher costs.

No major implementation barriers were mentioned by any project partner, except for the security situation in the Wollega woredas (covered by ECC-SDCO), and sporadic conflict in Gedeb Assosa and Adama Zuria woredas, which impeded EnJOY project staff at times to go there for information, training, monitoring and evaluation. In case of need, the ECC-SDCO staff would come to Addis or to the CACH field office in Adama for discussions and trainings etc. In other occasions, e.g. for the assessments, local consultants would be hired to carry out operations in the Wollega woredas.

EQ 3.5 To what extent does the project ensure good coordination with other projects and initiatives?

The EnJOY project was found to be coherent with national policies and with similar interventions on job opportunity creation. As stated above, it was inspired by the SINCE project, the RESET II project and by the RESET Plus YEP project in Amhara and Somali regions. It is also understood to have been complementary to long-term GIZ investments in the TVET sector; and congruent e.g. with other youth employment and entrepreneurship projects such as the Dutch NGO-led project Employable Youth in Ethiopia (EYE) (2018-2022) working with TVET and local communities in Addis Ababa, Hawassa and SNNPR.

The project organized many meetings with public and private stakeholders which allowed for exchange and collaboration between parties. As such, it was well-positioned both to share and to receive information about the job creation and entrepreneurship work of other actors. Yet, EnJOY could possibly have been more active contacting similar and related interventions, e.g. to mutually learn and exchange in workshops, conferences or PPP platform meetings. Opportunities would include e.g.: Mercy Corps (e.g. on fee-based skills development and TVET courses; 2023), GIZ and others (e.g. on EnJOY TVET support in relation to the longer term support provided by GIZ and others), with the Dutch-funded EYE project (e.g. on their approach and experiences with private business service providers, with TVET and local communities, etc.), with the ILO and the World Bank (e.g. on digitalization tools related to job creation) (ILO, 2022), etc.

4.4 (Initial) Impacts & Sustainability

EQ 4.1 How sustainable are the results achieved to date and what are the prospects for sustainability in a next phase of project implementation?

EQ 4.2 What is the potential for the project's components to be scaled-up or replicated?

EQ 4.3 Is the project contributing effectively towards institutions and beneficiaries capacity development? Is capacity building based on real needs and building on existing capacities? Is it integrated (individual, organizational, enabling environment level)?

The EnJOY project largely achieved its objectives under Components 1 (OSJC) and 3 (TVET). These achievements are considered to be sustainable, in that they are embedded in existing structures with appropriate governance models, which have been delivering services before, and which have proven to be instrumental in helping the target groups of unemployed youth, women and less-privileged groups.

The interviewees have been sufficiently clear and univocal that the EnJOY capacity-building trainings have been well-organised, well-received, and that the learning had been put into practice. This capacity has been built as human and social capital; it will find its way in intended contexts and in unknown future contexts through the individuals concerned (e.g. trained staff being relocated or taking up other tasks and responsibilities).

For the OSJC (Component 1) the Ministry of Labour & Social Affairs (MoLS) has committed to using them as centres for job creation development in the country. There is no upscaling plan as yet. The main concern regarding sustainability of the supported OSJC is whether sufficient budgets for operations and maintenance of machinery and equipment (including stationary, fuel, etc.) will be available from the authorities at woreda and/or regional and/or federal levels. This same concern applies to the supported TVET. The sustainability of EnJOY's material support is yet to be secured.

The TVET (Component 3) depend largely on public funds for their operations. The Ethiopian government allows TVET today to generate income to support their training program and entrepreneurship support program. Some of the TVETs have already started some income generation activities (e.g. Sankura – dairy farming). Many TVET manage important areas of land which they could in principle put to use for income generation purposes.

The sustainability of the supports to SME and enterprises (Component 2) is less clear from the interviews conducted by the evaluation team. Whereas all actors unanimously thanked the project for its support, and gave testimony of the capacity-building, the new learning and the work experiences acquired, the sustainability of the individual SME and enterprises is yet to be proven and dependent on many variables that are beyond the control of the project. What is clear is that the individuals interviewed felt empowered, skilled and enriched by the experience of passing through the project-supported trainings, job placements and business innovation competitions. Most of their SME/enterprises were still afloat and are reportedly doing well.

EnJOY appears to have been less successful in producing outputs under Component 4 (PPP platforms). The number of PPP established is limited to one at the national level according to the logframe. Some private sector players are reported to be difficult to mobilise. The larger players, e.g. those based in industrial parks, are reportedly organising recruitment themselves without OSJC support. Possibly the primary focus of EnJOY on the support of public agencies has limited the interest of some private sector partners to join PPP platforms on job creation.

In all cases, the sustainability of PPP is dependent amongst others on: a clear common objective, a dynamic and inspiring leader and owner of the initiative, a good governance model, the availability of a clear budget for operations, financial and content support from all parties (not just from public sources), continuous consultations between stakeholders, and regular (but no-to-frequent) concrete joint activities that merit the time and funds invested in participation. There is not currently a clear EnJOY plan setting out when PPP are considered firm and sustainable.

The EnJOY work on a MEAL system (through the piloting of ET Works) has been instrumental to the public agencies. By today, it appears to have been largely absorbed by other developments such as the new World Bank supported and laptop-based Electronic LMIS system (E-LIMS) which is currently

being rolled out for more detailed and combined job seeker and personal registration; including through EnJOY-supported OSJC (example of Adama Zuria). Yet, the tablet-based ET Works system is still providing added value especially for off-line use in rural kebeles (i.e. outside the OSJC).

The EnJOY activities that appear to qualify best for upscaling and replication are the trainings by ToT trained trainers on a variety of subject matters including life skills, business skills and entrepreneurship, as well as the IBIC business competitions. This can (and will) be done by OSJC and TVET alike. The significant material support to OSJC and TVET cannot likely be upscaled or replicated in similar quantity and quality due to a lack of public budgets. Community mobilisation of funds for scaling-up investments at TVET is being tried e.g. in Sankura woreda through fee-based evening courses and through TVET entrepreneurship in animal farming. Such business models merit further analysis and assessment. In all cases, it would be worthwhile to try and define meaner and leaner models of TVET support for upscaling and replication with public or private funds.

EQ 4.4 How has information on project objectives, progress and results been communicated and knowledge gained been shared among stakeholders?

EnJOY has been successful in communicating and collaborating with the different public agencies at federal, regional, zonal and woreda levels on the project activities. The public actors were involved in the different stages of project development and implementation, both for consultations on activities and planning and as beneficiaries of staff training, office refurbishment, materials, machineries and equipment.

EnJOY appears to have been less successful in convening private sector parties and in organising and establishing sustainable platforms for Public-Private partnerships on youth employment and entrepreneurship. The evaluation team is of the impression that the project was mostly geared to the public agencies. Future activities could put the private sector and business models more central.

The project has been successful in organizing (24) radio information sessions in Oromia region on youth employment and entrepreneurship, thus reaching out to beneficiaries both in the project woredas and in the (many hundreds of) woredas elsewhere in the Oromia region. Assessment of the impacts of the radio information sessions has not yet been carried out.

The visibility of this EU-funded project has been good to excellent on-site. The project and the EU investment are well identified through billboards, information displays, banners, stickers on purchased materials and equipment, etc. The project and the EU have been visible during high-level events and through the presentation of a national manual. The project has also been publicised through some social media (e.g. CACH website, Twitter, etc.). The English language 10 minutes' videos on the OSJC and TVET are available on YouTube, but diffusion and thus impact is minimal (status on 16 January 2024: the number of views were 15 times and 10 times only after 10 months).

4.5 Cross-cutting issues

EQ 5.1 To what extent have considerations of youth and women and less-privileged groups been taken into account in the project design and implementation?

The EnJOY project partners pursued a deliberate policy of equal representation of women and men in the project activities. This contributed to achieving an estimated actual percentage of 35-40% participation of women as beneficiaries of the project activities (based on Power BI data and on the ratio of men and women participants in the evaluation). This figure is lower than planned but higher than what could be expected e.g. based on the ratio of women in public agencies' staff (15-20%).

Even though EnJOY carried out several assessments prior to project start, this did not include a gender assessment of the project and of the main stakeholders involved. As such, no Gender Action Plan is available. Yet, EnJOY did engage a Gender & Social Inclusion officer until early-2023, who was in charge of gender integration in the various activities.

All project partners followed deliberate policies favouring the inclusion of disabled persons as was witnessed at different project sites. Some interviewees identified as Internally Displaced Persons (IDP) or as returnees from Arab countries (here: Saudi Arabia and Lebanon).

EQ 5.2 How is the intervention dealing with environmental constraints and opportunities?

EnJOY did not have any particular provisions regarding the (potential) environmental effects and impacts of the project activities. No particular policies were formulated and applied; for example regarding the production practices in the irrigated agriculture plots. No other major environmental concerns were identified.

4.6 Other specific questions

In addition to the OECD/DAC criteria, the ToR specified a few other questions. These questions did not figure in the Evaluation matrix included in the approved Technical proposal and in the Inception report. The Evaluation matrix guided the evaluation team in its work of document review, data collection and analysis of findings. Below are reflections on three specific questions from the ToR.

SQ1: Understanding the practical nature of the EnJOY program's impact, what kind of social change do interventions such as the community businesses (i.e. market shades) have on the fabric of remote and peri-urban communities that were supported?

The evaluation was not able to assess this complex question. The market sheds constructed are expected to have contributed to improved access to services for people in – and or travelling to - the selected sites. E.g. sales of food and drinks near to a bus station (Sankura), sales of cellular phones in a main street (Sankura), sale of milk and milk processing products on a main tar road (Dale), etc. Market sheds differed between woreda and/or implementing partners as to materials, size and site (e.g. metal vs. concrete, bus station vs. road, central vs. less central, etc.).

Assessment of the market sheds as a separate tool would require an in-depth assessment of e.g.: before/after situation, contextual issues, user right/obligations, user selection procedure, user/building match, user/customer relations, product/market matching, businesses' financial situation, etc. This goes beyond the scope of this evaluation.

SQ2: What is the added value of the use of business case competitions and other business development activities in creating sustainable and lucrative jobs?

The evaluation team met with groups of participants and beneficiaries of IBIC competition, including a number of award winners. Based on these interviews and FGD, the IBIC competitions are considered a highly interesting, useful and motivating instrument to install a combined sense of business development, entrepreneurship, innovative thinking, learning, competition and reward amongst the applicants.

Each IBIC counted with many applicants of which 30 persons would usually be selected and be invited to follow a range of project-supported trainings on business development, entrepreneurship and

business proposal formulation. They would subsequently improve their business proposal, after which typically three award winners would be selected and awarded by a project-led but independent panel of experts. The IBIC provide good opportunities for communication through radio and social media about the opportunities for, and experiences of participants with, business development, entrepreneurship and job creation.

SQ3: Does working directly with and providing in-kind support to local government organizations (e.g. TVETs and job centres) generate more effective results and therefore more impact on the local communities? If so, how? If not, why?

One of the assumption underlying the project is that support to existing public structures would generate more effective results than other types of interventions. The Evaluation team lacks comparative material to test this assumption, but believes that the assumption is valid.

The team confirms based on the interviews with stakeholders that public structures were interested in collaboration with the project on youth (un)employment, entrepreneurship and job creation. The staff encountered at different levels confirmed to feel more empowered, motivated and enabled through the project trainings and collaboration, to provide better services to youth, women and unemployed also in more remote rural areas. The EnJOY project proved that the collaboration with the public agencies was feasible, functional and productive. As existing structures, the public agencies are in a good position to provide continuity and sustainability to the project interventions, and to possibly upscale these within and beyond the current beneficiary project wordas.

5. Conclusions and recommendations

5.1 Conclusions

The project “Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY)” in Ethiopia aims to enhance the capacities of local authorities to proactively support job seekers (youth and women in particular) to have better access to information on available job opportunities and job placements. The project is implemented by the NGOs Caritas-Switzerland (CACH), ECC-SDCO, VIS and VITA/RTA. The project budget is EUR 9.7 million. The EU financial contribution is EUR 8.7 million (i.e. 90% of total eligible costs) for a 48 months’ period (February 2020 - January 2024). Project implementation will be finalised by 31 January 2024 and reporting by 31 July 2024.

Target areas of the EnJOY project are eight woredas (i.e. districts): four in Oromia (Adama, Gedeb Assosa, Gimbi and Sibule), one in Sidama (Dale), and three in the SNNP Region which since 2023 make part of the new Central Ethiopia Region (Sankura) and South Ethiopia Region (Dilla Zuria, Dugna Fango). The woredas were pre-selected by the EU in close cooperation with the regional governments of Oromia and SNNPR. It was decided by EU before project start that two-thirds of budget would go to Oromia Region and one-third to the (previous) SNNP Region.

The Final Evaluation covered almost the entire project implementation period (February 2020-December 2023); i.e. 46 out of 48 months. The evaluation covers all components of the EnJOY project. It takes account of the outcomes and recommendations of the EU Results Oriented Monitoring (ROM) carried out in October-November 2022 (Gatera, 2022).

Relevance & Coherence

- C1. The EnJOY project objective and design remained relevant over the project period. A reduced number of project components and activities would have eased project management and would have allowed for more focused M&E in view of any future upscaling and replication of success.
- C2. The capacity-building of the OSJC and the TVET through Training-of-Trainers (ToT) is expected to remain relevant also after the project period. The EnJOY support on business development and entrepreneurship contributed to leveraging substantial structural change at OSJC and TVET.
- C3. The EnJOY support to SME and businesses primarily benefits those directly concerned. Project support to individuals and SME/enterprises to reduce unemployment may potentially lead to replacing or outcompeting existing market actors, and shall be monitored. The Business Incubation Centres (BIC) at the TVET and the IBIC competitions were highly appreciated by the target groups. The IBIC appear to have contributed to a change in mindsets.
- C4. EnJOY succeeded in involving both women and men in the project activities. The estimated ratio of women beneficiaries (35-40%) was slightly lower than intended (i.e. 50%). The EnJOY project partners successfully involved other vulnerable groups, such as disabled persons, IDP and returnees, as beneficiaries in the project activities. The various gaps and need assessments contributed importantly to the design and implementation of EnJOY based on needs.
- C5. The EnJOY logical framework was adequate for presenting project implementation results, but it did not adequately allow comparative analysis of current values against baseline and target values, or e.g. for comparison with similar efforts by other actors and/or In other areas.

C6. The EnJOY project results are in line with the federal, regional, zonal and woreda priorities. A manual was developed for the MEAL system of the Job Opportunity Creation policy. The project was coherent with, and built partly upon, prior youth employment interventions (e.g. SINCE, RESET, GIZ, EYE). EnJOY organised many meetings with public and private stakeholders. Exchange and collaboration with related interventions could have been stronger.

Effectiveness & Efficiency

C7. EnJOY has been successful implementing the project as a consortium of NGOs and in consultation with the public agencies at federal, regional, zonal and woreda levels. Communication between partners was reported to be good, fluent, frequent and productive.

C8. The project appears to have realized most of its stated objectives. It has contributed to substantial investment, capacity-building and upgrading of public actors' ability to assess and support job seekers' needs for employment opportunities.

C9. EnJOY largely achieved its objectives under Components 1 (OSJC) and 3 (TVET). The regional and woreda public agencies, the OSJC and the TVET all enhanced and expanded their capacities to serve unemployed and underemployed youth, women and vulnerable groups. The appreciation of the EnJOY project's activities was high and unequivocal by all interviewees.

C10. The EnJOY support to individual SME and businesses (Component 2) benefitted those directly concerned. Their potential to leveraging change in the job market is yet to be proven. Access to finance remains a barrier for new starting businesses without a track record or major assets.

C11. EnJOY succeeded in involving both women and men in the project activities. The ratio of women beneficiaries (35-40%) was lower than intended but higher than might be expected e.g. based on the ratio of women in public agencies' staff (15-20%). EnJOY also successfully involved other vulnerable groups (e.g. disabled persons, IDP and returnees) as beneficiaries in the project activities.

C12. EnJOY contributed to the formulation of harmonised guidelines for M&E on job creation policies (under Component 4). The establishment of firm and sustainable Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) platforms was less successful.

C13. Market actors were involved in EnJOY project implementation through various activities. They could possibly have been more integrated in EnJOY as a vehicle -and a target- for job opportunity creation (e.g. industry associations, import/export bodies, financial institutions, institutional investors and foreign investment bodies).

C14. The project appears to have responded adequately and in a timely fashion to major challenges in the project environments (e.g. Covid-19, Tigray crisis, local conflicts, etc.). The implications this has for the labour markets is to be assessed.

C15. The EnJOY project followed a clear Monitoring & Evaluation policy. The EnJOY project management dashboard on Power BI is visually attractive. The data on EnJOY achievements can be disaggregated per woreda, OSJC and TVET supported. The linkage between the data and project management is not evident: the current values are not linked to reference values (baseline values, target values). The M&E system does also not relate project results and outcomes to the larger challenge of unemployment per woreda, and to other support mechanisms.

C16. The EnJOY project appears to have been implemented in an overall effective manner. The activities planned and the outputs expected have generally been achieved, within the budget at hand, and with only a six months' no-cost extension. The evaluation team has not been able to assess the efficiency of the project implementation in detail, by lack of major hard project targets and of comparative data for analysis of the costs per unit.

(Initial) Impacts & Sustainability

C17. The EnJOY project proved that the collaboration with the public agencies was feasible, functional and productive. As existing structures, the public agencies are in a good position to provide continuity and sustainability to the project interventions, and to possibly upscale these within and beyond the current beneficiary project woredas.

C18. The EnJOY achievements under Components 1 (OSJC) and 3 (TVET) are considered to be sustainable. They are embedded in existing structures with appropriate governance models, which have been delivering services before, and which have proven to be instrumental in helping the target groups of unemployed youth, women and less-privileged groups.

C19. The EnJOY capacity-building trainings have been well-organised, well-received, and the learning has been put into practice. Significant human and social capital has thus been built. The sustainability of the EnJOY material support to TVET and OSJC is yet to be secured. Budgets are required for operation and maintenance as are funds for future replacement. Income generation by the TVET, and possibly also the OSJC) is an option to be considered.

C20. The EnJOY support to SME and enterprises made part of the capacity-building trainings. Those trained felt empowered, more skilled and enriched. The sustainability of the individual SME and enterprises is yet to be proven, and dependent on many variables beyond the project's control.

C21. EnJOY has been less successful in establishing sustainable PPP on job creation. Many stakeholder events were organized, yet there is no clear plan for setting up strong platforms.

C22. Activities that qualify best for upscaling and replication are the ToT trainings of trainers on a variety of subject matters including life skills, business skills and entrepreneurship, as well as the IBIC business competitions. Models for self-financing of activities shall be explored.

C23. EnJOY has been successful in communicating with the different public agencies at federal, regional, zonal and woreda levels, on the project activities. EnJOY appears to have been less successful in convening private sector parties and in establishing form and sustainable PPP platforms.

C24. The project has been successful in organizing (24) radio information sessions for audiences in and (far) beyond the project woreda in Oromia. This work may merit replication. The visibility of this EU-funded project has been good to excellent on-site, and to a lesser extent on social media.

C25. EnJOY did not have any particular provisions regarding the (potential) environmental effects and impacts of the project activities. No major environmental concerns were identified.

5.2 Recommendations

- R1. (to Implementing partners) Establish a plan for follow-up. Identify the possibilities for a leaner and meaner model for future upscaling and replication. Carry out an analysis of the efficiency of project implementation in view of any plans for replication and upscaling of success.
- R2. (to GoE, EU, other donors) Consider financing of a next phase for upscaling and replication in other woredas and regions of the capacity-building and infrastructural investments in OSJC, TVET and IBIC competitions. The activities that qualify best for upscaling and replication are the trainings by ToT trained trainers on a variety of subject matters including life skills, business skills and entrepreneurship, as well as the IBIC business competitions.
- R3. (to MoLS and other relevant public agencies) Ensure adequate budgets for operations and maintenance of machinery and equipment at TVET and OSJC in order to sustain the quality and the quantity of their services. Encourage TVET, and possibly also OSJC, to develop business models to generate own income.
- R4. (All stakeholders) Help the private sector to play a central role in the youth and women job creation agenda. Elaborate and explore support for developing business models for private agencies to match labour on offer with labour demand. The private sector should be able to realize high-quality matching services and to sustain these through fee-based business models.
- R5. (to EnJOY implementing partners) Ensure in future projects a greater focus on project design and on the preparation of a coherent, comprehensive and flexible ToC and Logframe.
- R6. (to EnJOY implementing partners) Carry out in future projects a robust gender analysis, develop a Gender Action Plan and allocate sufficient human power at all levels to effectively mainstream the issues of gender in the activities.
- R7. (to EnJOY implementing partners) Establish a plan for the establishment and up-scaling of firm and sustainable PPP on job creation and entrepreneurship, including sources of funding.
- R8. (to EU) Elaborate a plan for support of access to finance for SME and enterprises as a stand-alone or core project. The revolving funds under EnJOY were diffuse and small.
- R9. (to GoE) Ensure that any electronic labour market information system goes beyond mere biometrical and job seeker registration to becoming a real vehicle for the matching of labour on offer with labour demand.

5.3 Lessons learned

L1. The consortium of NGOs has been communicating and collaborating successfully on youth (un)employment, job creation and entrepreneurship with the public agencies at federal, regional, zonal and woreda levels. Communication between partners and with the public agencies was reported to be good, fluent, frequent and productive.

L2. The project has been most successful in the capacity-building and material infrastructural support of OSJC and the TVET. Substantial structural change was achieved.

L3. The extensive gaps and needs assessments contributed to the project being needs-based. Making the OSJC services accessible to both rural and urban youth decreases the systemic exclusion of rural youth and women.

L4. The integrated character of the EnJOY project implied interventions on many different components and activities, posing additional challenges for project management and M&E.

References

Project document:

CACH (2019), Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY) Project, Stimulating Economic Development and Job Opportunities in Oromia and SNNP Regions of Ethiopia EU Grant Application Form (T05-EUTF-HOA-72-01). September 2019, 82p (plus Budget + Annexes.).

Progress reports:

CACH (2023). Annex 5 – Standard Format for Evaluation Reports. Caritas-Switzerland, 1p.
CACH (2023), EnJOY project 14th Quarterly Report (01 May 2023 – 31 July 2023), 14p.
CACH (2023), Final report (file: P200022_Annex_I_Financial Report_Q14), 2p.
CACH (2023), EnJOY project Interim Narrative Report (01 February 2023 – 31 July 2023), 13p.
CACH (2023), EnJOY project 13th Quarterly Report (01 February 2023 – 30 April 2023), 14p.
CACH (2023), EnJOY project Interim Narrative Report (01 February 2022 – 31 January 2023), 21p.
CACH (2022), EnJOY project 5th Interim Narrative Report (01 May 2021 – 31 July 2022), 25p.
CACH (2022), EnJOY project 3rd Interim Narrative Report (01 May 2021 – 31 January 2022), 18p.
CACH (2021), EnJOY project 7th Quarterly Report (01 August 2021 – 31 October 2021), 21p.
CACH (2021), EnJOY project 6th Quarterly Report (01 May 2021 – 31 July 2021), 20p.
CACH (2021), EnJOY project 2nd Interim Narrative Report (01 Feb 2020 – 30 April 2021). 19p.
CACH (2021), EnJOY project Interim Narrative Report (01 Feb 2020 – 31 January 2021), 16p.
CACH (2020), EnJOY project 3rd Quarterly Report (01 August 2020 – 31 October 2020), 17p.
CACH (2020), EnJOY project 2nd Quarterly Report (01 May 2020 – 31 July 2020), 11p.
CACH (2020), EnJOY project 1st Quarterly Report (01 Feb 2020 - 30 April 2020), 12p.

Other documentation:

BAN-DRCE (2022), Final Evaluation report of RESET Plus project “Youth Empowerment for Successful Transition to Decent work in Amhara and Somali regions of Ethiopia.” December 2022, 95p.

CACH (2022), Local Security Plan (LSP). November 2022, 20p.

CACH & Elias Ermias (2022), Contract for EnJOY Radio Program Draft Episodes Review Workshop. April 2022, 4p.

CACH & Oda Ginbe (2022), Contract for Trainings of Youth and Women SMEs on life skills to improve their mind-set toward job creation. February 2022, 6p.

CACH & Oda Ginbe (2022), Contract for Training women SMEs by Wonji A/TVET. March 2022, 6p.

DAB Development Research and Training (2021), Situation analysis and Baseline study for the EnJOY project. Final report. June 2021, 129p.

EnJOY (2023), EnJOY Logframe Nov 23 Update (with Current values per 12 December 2023). Excel sheet.

EnJOY (2023), Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY). Power Point Presentation (.ppt). December 2023, 68p.

EnJOY (2023), EnJOY Visibility Intervention Area Map. December 2023, 1p.

EnJOY (2023), Overview of consortium partners. Contact list (in .xls) (6 December 2023).

EnJOY (2023), Oromia Region Public Private Partnership High-Level Meeting. September 2023, 6p.

EnJOY (2023), EnJOY Multi-stakeholder Workshop (Adama, Ethiopia, 25-26 July 2023), 12p.

EnJOY (2023), Success stories EnJOY. February 2023, 7p.

EnJOY (2023), Video EnJOY. Clima Video Productions. February 2023 (9 minutes).

EnJOY (2023), An Interview Guide to assess regional radios, 1p.

EnJOY (2022), Monitoring plan EnJOY project. August 2022. (Excel sheets)

EnJOY (2022), Development of Labor and Skills PPP Platforms. Concept Note. March 2022, 9p.

EnJOY (2022), Federal Workshop Summary – MEAL system development (15-16 April 2022), 8p.

EnJOY (2022), EnJOY Project Evidence Paper. March 2022, 52p.

EnJOY (2021), Adama and Gedab Hassasa Woreda Rapid Small Scale Irrigation Feasibility Assessment report. By: O. Ginbe, G. Abebe, D. Imiru & A. Haji. May 2021, 36p.

EnJOY (2021), EnJOY. Flyer. April 2021, 4p.

EU (2023), Agricultural Recovery, Improved Domestic Food Production and Food Security in Ethiopia. (EuropeAid/179149/ACT/ET) Guidelines for grant applicants. October 2023, 30p.

EU (2021), PRAG. External action. Financial instruments on participation in procurement procedures and grants. EU Programme eligibility rules 2021-2027, 9p.

EU (2019), EU Grant Contract for External Actions (T05.1052). December 2019, 4p.

EUTF (2018?), European Union Trust Fund for Stability and Addressing the Root Causes of Irregular Migration and Displaced Persons in Africa. Action Fiche, Second amendment, 18p.

F&S (2021), Skills, Needs and Gaps Assessment of Agricultural/Technical and Vocational Education & Training Institutions (A/TVETs). Final report. Fair & Sustainable Consulting. November 2021, 149p.

GATERA, J. D. (2022), EU Results Oriented Monitoring (ROM) report of the EnJOY project. Draft Consolidated report (18 November 2022), 8p.

GoE (2021), Ten Years' Development Plan (2021-2030). Ethiopia Planning and Development Commission, 82p.

ICOS (2021), Labour Market Assessment for EnJOY project. ICOS Consulting. September 2021, 514p.

ILO (2022), Comprehensive assessment of the state of Labour Market and Migration Information System in Ethiopia. International Labour Organization (ILO). Draft report, 108p.

JCC (2020), Plan of Action for Job Creation Sustainable Jobs for All (2020-2025). Jobs Creation Commission (JCC), 49p.

MALACARNE (2022), Monitoring guideline EnJOY project. September 2022, 12p.

MERCY CORPS (2023), Short-term, fee-based skills development: A new model for technical skills training in Ethiopia. Feed the Future, Learning Brief (November 2023), 5p.

MIKLLOL (2022), Mid-Term Review EnJOY. Miklol Consulting & Research, July 2022, 103p.

MoLS (2022), National MEAL Handover Ceremony (16 September 2022). September 2022, 4p.

MoLS (2022), Standardized monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Learning Guideline for Job Creation. Ministry of Labour and Skills (version 5 - Final). September 2022, 52p.

NSC (2021), One-Stop-Job-Center Baseline Assessment. North-South Consulting (NSC). July 2021, 53p.

TESEMA, E. (2019), Technical & Financial Proposal to Provide Training for project staff on Community Mobilization to Enhance Youth and Women Economic Empowerment. June 2021, 6p.

Appendices

Appendix 1. ENJOY Logical framework & Achievements

Below document presents the latest EnJOY logframe and the achievements of the project until 12 December 2023. The evaluation team added a coloured column indicating its appreciation of the performance per indicator. The colours shall be interpreted as follows:

- Red: Not according to plan.
- Orange: No target set. Partially achieved. Significant underperformance.
- Yellow: Largely achieved. Limited underperformance.
- Green: Fully or almost fully achieved. As planned.
- Light blue: More achieved than was planned. Limited overperformance.
- Dark blue: Much more achieved than planned. High overperformance.

	Results chain	Indicator	Baseline (value & reference year)	Target (value & reference year)	Current value* (12 December 2023) (* to be included in interim and final reports)	Achievement Against Target (%)	Source and mean of verification	Assumptions
Impact (Overall Objective)	Enhancing the capacities of the local authorities to proactively support job-seekers to have better access to information on available job opportunities and job placements	1.1 # of people with access to diversified economic opportunities (disaggregated by gender, age, IDP/non-IDP)	13'600 unemployed registered in 2020 (5'300 female) in 25 OSJC	62,053 individuals (ca. 57,265 youth and women, ca. 3,876 Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs), and members of the host communities, and 912 owners of Small and Micro Enterprises (SMEs) at the end of the project period. Targets per year TBD in the inception phase	Not applicable now, will be determined after end evaluation	Not available.	Regional and zonal level Bureau of Labour and Social Affairs (BOLSA) statistics on unemployment rate/numbers (quarterly) Ethiopian Humanitarian Requirement Document (HRD) (annually and updates)	Not applicable
		1.2 # of people who were able to improve their employment situation (disaggregated by sector, gender, age, IDP/non-IDP)	zero	TBD	27'831(11'070 Female)	No target set.	Government, International Organization (incl. International Labour Organisation (ILO), United Nations Industrial Development Organization (UNIDO), etc.) Socio-Economic Databases and Surveys (upon publication) Baseline midterm-review and final evaluation reports by the consortium	
		1.3 # of people who could increase their income (disaggregated by sector, gender, age, IDP/non-IDP)	zero	TBD	5'322 (1'978. Female)	No target set.		
Outcome (s) (Specific objective(s))	1. The local public-private governance system, including empowered One-Stop-Job-Centres (OSJC), is capacitated to plan, deliver, manage and monitor effective job opportunities for vulnerable youth and women at district, zonal, regional and national levels	1.1 OSJC standard service package adopted and government decision in place for its implementation	System not functioning but standard One-Stop-Job-Centre format under development	Final format and standard service package of the OSJC tested and documented	Service Guidelines approved by MoLS and implementation ongoing	OK.	Project monitoring and - --progress reports by the consortium1 Socioeconomic data-bases and surveys by the consortium members and implementing partners (frequency TBD)	The Government remains willing and committed to provide resources e.g. office space and staff Steering committee partner institutions are willing to improve cooperation Industrial Parks, SME are available and willing to cooperate Industrial Parks, SMEs are available and willing to cooperate Micro finance Institutions (MFIs) are willing to develop marked needs finance products Saving and Credit Cooperatives (SACCOs) and its Unions are ready to increase their revolving fund loan portfolio and assume new members Involved stakeholders (incl. PPPs) are willing to contribute to the development and implementation of a MEAL system
		1.2 # of people benefitting from OSJCs who were able to improve their employment situation	zero	# jobs facilitated by OSJC: tbd	# jobs facilitated by OSJC 18'862 (7'545 female), data collection ongoing since set up of OSJCs not finalized	Not available. No target set.	Official government correspondence Baseline, mid-term and final evaluation reports by the consortium Minutes and list of participants of PPP platform meetings Government MEAL system and its reports Capacity building measure reports incl. list of participants by the involved facilitators	
	2. Enabled environment for a strengthened private sector in Oromia, Sidama and Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples (SNNP) Regions promoting economic development through better access to finance by MSMEs and self-employment opportunities for vulnerable youth and women	2.1 # of MSMEs supported by the project (disaggregated by sector)	zero	720	997	138	Project monitoring and progress reports	Government data is verifiable No major hazard or conflict occurs in the target areas
		2.2. # of MSME members supported (disaggregated by gender, age, IDP/non-IDP)	zero	3'600 (estimation of five members/MSME)	5590 (2078 female)	155	Baseline, mid-term and final evaluation reports Socioeconomic data-bases and surveys	
		2.3 # of people benefitting from MSME activities who could increase their income	zero	at least 80% of targeted MSME member	4961 (1828 female)	111 (4961 / 80% * 5590)	Tracer study reports by the consortium (frequency defined during development of M&E system)	
	3. Agriculture/ Technical Vocational Educational Training institutes (A/TVET) offers are more flexible, demand driven and matches job opportunities facilitating skills development and school to work transition	3.1 # of people benefitting from A/TVETs who were able to improve their employment situation (disaggregated by gender, age, sector, IDP/non-IDP)	zero	TBD	3668 (1557 Female)	No target set.	Project monitoring and progress reports Baseline, mid-term and final evaluation reports Training reports incl. list of participants Training database of TVET providers (frequency depending on the timing and frequency of the trainings) Tracer study reports	Government data is verifiable No major hazard or conflict occurs in the target areas

	Results chain	Indicator	Baseline (value & reference year)	Target (value & reference year)	Current value* (12 December 2023) (* to be included in interim and final reports)	Achievement Against Target (%)	Source and mean of verification	Assumptions
	4. An improved Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability and Learning (MEAL) system is in place, enabling the tracking, evaluation of the effectiveness and the impact of Active Labour Market Policies (ALMPs) and of governance tools & measures	4.1 # of labour market policy recommendations brought forward for decision	zero	3	0	0	Project monitoring and progress reports Baseline, mid-term and final evaluation reports	Government data is verifiable
		4.2 MEAL system adopted at national level	No standardized MEAL system in place	1	1	100	MEAL manual by the consortium (timing TBD) MEAL/Governance tools (timing TBD)	No major hazard or conflict occurs in the target areas
Outputs for Outcome 1	For Outcome 1 1.1 Job centres (at woreda level) are transformed into OSJC	1.1.1 # of woreda level OSJC baseline studies conducted	zero	8	8	100	Project monitoring and progress reports	Government departments realize the need for capacity building and engage in learning and training activities
		1.1.2 # of OSJC that are renovated and/or equipped and transformed	0	87	80	92	Baseline, endline and final evaluation reports	Key regional state agencies, government departments, TVET institutions support / collaborate in the realization of training courses
		1.1.3 # of staff of local authorities trained on job creation related topics (disaggregated by gender, woreda)	zero	950 staff of local authorities trained	3'893 staff of local authorities trained	410	Training attendance report and photos of the training courses by the facilitators	Private sector is responsive and interested in the issue of youth unemployment
		1.1.4 # of job seekers registered at OSJC	13'600 unemployed registered in 2020 (5'300 female) in 25 OSJC	15% increment per year 2021: 15'640, 2022: 17'986, 2023: 20'869	2023: 17383 registered unemployed (6'968 female)	84	Post-training evaluation assessments by the consortium	Government is supportive to the establishment of SMEs / cooperatives and does not discourage it
		1.1.5 # of job seekers trained by OSJC	1.1.5 zero	at least 50% of registered job seekers receive training	2023: 12'316 trained (4'229 female)	118 (12316 / 50% * 17383)	Registration database / reports from BOLSA	Key actors including relevant government offices and private sector are responsive and contribute to action as planned
	1.2 PPP (local authorities, private sectors, OSJCs, Public Employment Services (PES), A/TVET institutes) platforms at woreda level are in place	1.2.1 # of in-depth assessments on existing PPPs conducted	zero	8	8	100	Job portal registration database	Key government departments have resources but no systemic blocks to convergence and to institutionalize best practices
		1.2.2 # of PPP guidelines established	zero	8	ongoing	Not available	Reports from Cooperative Development and Marketing Offices	Platform members are willing to meet and work together
		1.2.3 # of PPP platform events organised at woreda level	zero	32	8	25	Minutes of platforms organised at woreda level	Government will allocate infrastructure/building to OSJC and BICs
		1.2.4 # of Job Creation Steering Committee coordination meetings facilitated (woreda/zone)	one meeting annually	72	6	8	Minutes of PPP platform meetings	Local industries will employ local labour force
	1.3 #networks application that was developed by MoLS is piloted and scaled out to rural woredas and OSJCs capacitated to digitally report on job seeker information	1.3.1 Existing application by MoLS for digitalization of job seeker information scaled out to rural woredas	no application existing on woreda level	8	8	100	Human interest stories/ short video clips	The political and security situation in the target areas remains conducive and areas
		1.3.2 # of OSJC using digital job seeker registration application (#networks) (disaggregated by woreda)	zero	87	68	78	Installation and set-up reports of job portal as well as activity log and Registration database	
	For Outcome 2 2.1 Existing MSMEs business plans are updated, life-skills training facilitated, and start-up of innovative MSMEs run by youth and women supported	2.1.1 Labour Market Assessment conducted	zero	1	1	100		
2.1.2 # of irrigation structures supported (disaggregated by woreda)		zero	16	6	38			

	Results chain	Indicator	Baseline (value & reference year)	Target (value & reference year)	Current value* (12 December 2023) (* to be included in interim and final reports)	Achievement Against Target (%)	Source and mean of verification	Assumptions
Outputs for Outcome 2	2.1 MSMEs have improved access to finance and market opportunities	2.1.3a # of MSMEs supported to generate income (disaggregated by type of activity, sector)	zero	626	859	137	Project monitoring and progress reports	remain accessible
		2.1.3b # of members of supported MSMEs (disaggregated by age, gender, sector, IDP/non-IDP)	zero	3'130 (estimate of five members/MSME)	5'590 (2'078) members directly trained	179	Baseline, endline and final evaluation reports	No occurrence of adverse climatic change affecting small businesses in the agricultural sector
		2.1.4 # of gender forum events held to promote female employment (disaggregated by woreda)	one gender forum event per woreda around March 8 (IWD)	three gender forum events per woreda (24 total)	18 events	75	MoUs with private sectors Annual success records of: OSJC, A/TVET, BICs	No further significant influx of IDPs and returnees
		2.1.5 # of educational radio programs on decent work broadcasted	zero	1	1	100	Policy papers/ recommendations/ leaflets developed/ submitted/ approved to/ by regional /national symposium	Inflation and significant raise of costs remain at an acceptable level
	2.2 MSMEs have improved access to finance and market opportunities	2.2.1a # of MSMEs supported to access finance and market opportunities (disaggregated by type of activity, sector)	zero	245	555	227	Memorandum of Understanding (MoUs) with A/TVET and companies Government and project	
		2.2.1b # of members of supported MSMEs (disaggregated by age, gender, sector, IDP/non-IDP)	zero	720	1994	277		
Outputs for Outcome 3	3.1 A/TVETs' capacities are improved to address skill gaps and increase youth employability	3.1.1 Capacity gap assessment conducted for A/TVETs (disaggregated by woreda)	zero	13	13	100	MEAL systems and its reports	
		3.1.2 # of A/TVETs renovated and equipped (disaggregated by A/TVET)	zero	11	11	100	Training attendance report and photos of the training courses by the facilitators	
		3.1.3 # of A/TVET teachers trained (disaggregated by gender and A/TVET)	zero	330	499 (109 female)	151	Business plans, reports by and audits of the SMEs	
	3.2 Work based learning schemes (WBLS) (between A/TVET providers and companies) are established	3.2.1 # of students benefitting from WBLS (disaggregated by gender and A/TVET)	zero	750	1864 (734 F)	249	Financial contracts between SMEs and financial service providers	
		3.2.2 # of graduates who transitioned into employment (disaggregated by gender and woreda)	zero	80	229 (60 female)	286	Registration database / reports from BOLSA	
	3.3 Business Incubation Centres (BIC) at government and private A/TVETs are established and functional	3.3.1 # of BIC established and/or refurbished/equipped	zero	11 BIC (one at each A/TVET)	12 BIC (one at each A/TVET) except Awash melkasa	109	Reports from Cooperative	
		3.3.2 # of persons trained at the BIC (disaggregated by gender, age, IDP/non-IDP)	zero	1'080 students trained	2185 (female 984)	202	Development and Marketing Offices	
		3.3.3 # of incubatees supported to start-up businesses	zero	one per A/TVET (total 11)	zero	0	Project monitoring and progress reports	
for Outcome 4	4.1 PPP platforms at regional/national level established	4.1 # of regional and national level public PPP (Symposium) events	zero PPP events on job creation existing on national or regional level	two PPP platform events on national and each two on regional level (total eight events)	one PPP at national level	50	Baseline, endline and final evaluation reports	
	4.2 Evidence based paper to assess the impact of the employment schemes implemented and recommend	4.2.1 Labour market policy recommendations made	zero	one document at the end of the project with labour market policy recommendations	zero	0	Training attendance report and photos of the training courses by the facilitators	

	<i>Results chain</i>	<i>Indicator</i>	<i>Baseline (value & reference year)</i>	<i>Target (value & reference year)</i>	<i>Current value* (12 December 2023) (* to be included in interim and final reports)</i>	<i>Achievement Against Target (%)</i>	<i>Source and mean of verification</i>	<i>Assumptions</i>
Outputs	active labour market measures to enhance the sustainability of the governance system and the effective implementation of the National Rural Job Creation Strategy	4.2.2 # of evidence papers produced and published	zero	2	1	50	BICs' user lists by A/TVET providers	
		4.2.3 MEAL system developed for national level	zero	1	1	100		
Outputs for Outcome 5	For Outcome 5	5.1 # of beneficiaries of PPE material	zero	902	2902	322	Project monitoring and progress reports	
	5.1 Members of impacted MSMEs and unemployed youth, women, IDPs have been supplied with personal protective equipment						Baseline, endline and final evaluation reports	
	5.2 Most vulnerable of these MSME members and unemployed youth, women, IDPs have been supplied with once off food items	5.2 # of beneficiaries of PPE materials and food items	zero	2040	2176	107	Assessment reports by PPPs Evidence paper	
	5.3 Selected MSMEs have been supported to maintain in business (through purchasing PPE from them)	5.3 # of MSMEs supported to produce face mask	zero	3	6	200		

Appendix 2. Dale and Dilla Zuria Woredas (10-12 December 2023)

Introduction

Below is a summary report of data collected for the Final Evaluation regarding activities, results and outcomes of the EnJOY project in Dale Woreda of Sidama region, with additional data from Dilla Zuria Woreda (where the VIS field office is located).

Outcome 1:

Working with Public Agencies at Woreda and Regional Level: EnJOY signed an MoU with different public agencies including the Labour and Skills & Enterprise development, Women & Children affairs, Labour & Social affairs, Finance & Economic development, TVET, and the Woreda administration. ToT trainings were provided for staff of these public agencies and for the staff of OSJC, so as to enable them to cascade the training to enterprises. The trainings resulted in active engagement of the public sector in project management and implementation. The trainings were also provided to staff of the Regional Job, Skill & Enterprise development bureau (esp. Job creation and TVET directorate). The project appears to have a very smooth relationship and collaboration with all stakeholders at all levels. The EnJOY project is reported by stakeholders to be transparent and participatory and the communication of the project staff with the public stakeholders was found to be proactive and easy.

Capacitating OSJC: Before directly engaging in the implementation of activities, the project has undertaken different gap and need assessments (on OSJC, TVET and the labour market). The five existing job centres (2 in Dilla Zuria, 3 in Dale; focused on urban areas) were poorly equipped; both in terms of human power and equipment including office furniture. EnJOY supported upgrading of the existing 5 job centres into OSJC and the establishment of 12 new OSJC in rural areas, to a total of 17 OSJC (9 in Dale, 8 in Dilla Zuria). The new OSJC are mainly focused on rural areas to contribute to fulfilling the Rural Job Creation agenda. EnJOY enhanced the capacity of the OSJC by supporting the renovation and furnishing of the OSJC offices and by providing basic equipment (e.g. computers, printers, furniture). EnJOY contributed to installing ET Works software to register unemployed youth (and to share the info with line offices at woreda, zonal, regional and federal level). The material support in Dale woreda includes office furniture (e.g. tables and chairs, shelves, stationaries) and four motorbikes (3 for the OSJC, 1 for Woreda office). The project has also provided trainings (e.g. life skills, entrepreneurship, financial management, basic computer skill and data management, etc). The ToT trainings were oriented towards public agencies at woreda and regional level and towards staff of OSJC.

The OSJC established and supported by EnJOY have enhanced their capacity to provide services to unemployed youth. The OSJC also provided mentorship and follow-up support to the enterprises in their operational areas. Key informants at all levels state that the OSJC have contributed to reducing urban and rural youth unemployment by generating self-employment in enterprises and wage employment via job placements. According to EnJOY project staff, the regional government is planning to scale up OSJC establishment to all 100 rural kebeles.

PPP: Steering Committees were set up at regional, zonal and woreda levels with representatives of the relevant public actors (i.e. the signatories of EnJOY project). Members of the committees jointly visit project activities and they evaluated the contribution of the project to their offices' objectives and

priorities. The consulted public agency representatives confirmed that they have had a good collaboration with the project and that they have been supporting implementation by helping the supported enterprises to access work spaces, loans and relevant trainings. The project provided trainings to help them carry out their responsibilities. A total of 180 government staff (including 120 staff from Sidama Region) have received ToT trainings in the areas of work readiness, life skills, and entrepreneurship. A work readiness manual was prepared by EnJOY and approved by MoLSA. The universities of Hawassa and Wolayita/Sodo participated in its elaboration.

On line job portal creation: EnJOY contributed to piloting the ET Works online job registration tool which was designed by the former Job Creation Commission (JCC) - currently called Ministry of Labour and Skills development (MoLS). The project provided tablets with ET Works software to each OSJC, and training of staff to register the unemployed youth and to share the info with the relevant woreda, zonal and district level offices/bureaus. The tool allows job seeker registration, yet it does not allow job seekers to access information on available jobs and trainings. ET Works is only used to register the unemployed youth and to help the government know the number of unemployed youth in the district.

Outcome 2:

- A. **Strengthening existing SME and organizing new SME:** EnJOY did not directly engage in strengthening and establishing SME but rather tried to enhance the capacity of local relevant actors/public agencies (i.e. the Job Creation & Enterprise development office and the OSJC) to provide ToT trainings and other supports mentioned above. The evaluation team considers that this was a well-designed endeavour ensuring ownership and sustainability. The project had first identified any capacity gaps with the public actors in establishing and supporting enterprises. According to the interviewees, the Enterprise development office and the OSJC currently have the knowledge and capacity to mobilize youth and to organize the enterprises, and they are able to support these through training and access to loans.
- B. **Reducing the skill gaps of enterprises:** According to the labour market assessment, there were significant skill gaps among the unemployed youth (women and men) and the owners of the existing enterprises. EnJOY worked on these through different approaches including: 1) Trainings of enterprises on life skills, work readiness and entrepreneurship, 2) Experience-sharing visits within and outside the region to give SME good exposure, 3) Mobilising youth and enterprises to engage in IBIC. According to interviewees, the support helped enterprises to establish demand-driven businesses and to successfully manage their business. The enterprises engaged in: poultry (one day old pullets), dairy farming, tree and vegetable nursery, beekeeping, crop production (teff and Irish potato), service sector and manufacturing (woodwork and metalwork). All key informants stated that the established SME are doing well thus far. The SME are at an early stage, so it is early to judge on their success and sustainability as an enterprise, but their progress looks promising.
- C. **Access to finance for SME:** One of the findings of the labour market assessment is the lack of access to finance for SME. EnJOY managed to avail loans through a revolving fund managed by Omo Bank (formerly Omo Micro-finance). To properly manage the revolving fund, a MoU was signed between the project, OMO Bank and relevant public agencies (mainly the Enterprise development office and Woreda administration). EnJOY provided a total of ETB 6,197,000 for both Dale and Dilla Zuria Woredas to be used as a revolving fund for SME to access loans. In Dale woreda, a total of 27 SME

have received loans at an interest rate of 10% per year. To ensure reimbursement, a loan repayment committee has been established under the leadership of kebele and woreda administrators. All the key informants at the woreda and regional level confirmed that reimbursement is good thus far and as per plan. The key informants explain this by the good trainings to SME, the engagement of the SME in business, effective collateral arrangements, good political buy-in from officials, and by the profitability of the SME. Yet, the amount of loan provided to the SME is very small. According to Dale Woreda Enterprise development office, all 27 SME that received a loan have started reimbursement with some of them having paid up to 50% of loan to date. EnJOY supported OMO Bank with microfinance training manuals and provided training to OMO Bank staff, to OSJC and to cooperative offices.

- D. **Facilitation of IBIC:** In both Dale and Dilla Zuria the project has managed to registered a total of 477 youth (women and men) to participate in IBIC (i.e. 150 from Dilla Zuria and 327 from Dale) for which 60 (30 from each) were shortlisted and received training on Business Development Services (BDS). Four (4) of the 30 participants were awarded ETB 100,000 each. In the process of competition all the participants received support for designing a business plan. Some of the IBIC winners have managed to start their business and to create jobs for others. The review revealed that some of the IBIC winners managed to receive a loan and are doing well in their business. Those who participated in IBIC but did not succeed to get a loan still consider this to have been a good learning experience and they appreciated the support.
- E. **Construction of sheds:** The project identified a lack of working primacies for SME. EnJOY therefore supported the construction of two blocks in brick, each having eight rooms. The construction of the sheds is concluded for 90%. The sheds will be provided to SME in the near future. The evaluation team considers that this activity needs to be completed soon in view of end of project. Though the constructed sheds are small as compared to the needs, they help to reduce these needs.
- F. **Other supports for SME:** In addition to training and financial support EnJOY provided different other supports. This includes the provision of 200 quintal of seeds and four water pumps for irrigation in Dale Woreda.

Outcome 3:

General: Before supporting the three TVET (Yirgalem Polytechnic, Don Bosco TVET in Dilla, and Dilla Polytechnic), the project carried out a TVET gaps and needs assessment. VIS prepared the ToR for the assessment, in which 30 TVET were assessed. A TVET implementation guide was then developed. VIS supported EnJOY to follow TVET related skill trainings in Hawassa in the South TVET institute and in Hawassa Polytechnic institute. VIS also contributed to the set-up of a BIC training for all EnJOY consortium members.

The review shows that several activities have been carried out to enhance the capacity of the TVET:

- a. **Enhancing the Capacity of TVET employees (both trainers and management staff):** VIS provided capacity-building support for technical and managerial staff of one private TVET (Don Bosco TVET) in Dilla town and one public TVET (Polytechnic TVET in Yirgalem) on AutoCAD and Solid Works (used for designing machine parts). Other soft skill trainings concerned: work readiness, life skills,

entrepreneurship and financial management. The technical trainings were not only given to the trainers of the TVET but also to staffs of industries involved in cooperative trainings for TVET students. All key informants from Sidama region and the TVET confirmed that the capacity of the trainers was enhanced thanks to the quality of the trainings.

- b. **Purchasing machineries and equipment:** EnJOY provided significant material support for Don Bosco in Dilla and for the Yirgalem Polytechnic TVET. The Yirgalem Polytechnic upgraded the already available internet with ETB 65,000 to make it very fast, it purchased 25 computers with chairs and tables, one printer and one photocopy machine for the newly opened BIC, it purchased machineries for the garment department, and it repaired some class windows of the colleges. The Dean said that the project has expended more than ETB 4 million on material purchases. In the case of Don Bosco TVET in Dilla, EnJOY purchased 25 computers and 19 garment machines (of which 15 sewing machines) plus some other machines for the electricity department. These supports have contributed importantly to the quality of the trainings. The purchased machineries and equipment are very modern and of high quality.
- c. **Setting up of BIC:** Before the project there was no BIC established in any TVET in Ethiopia. EnJOY has helped the government to make this desire a reality. Yirgalem Polytechnic TVET is the only TVET in Sidama having a BIC for incubating new business ideas: it has 25 computers and printers, chairs and tables. In Don Bosco TVET in Dilla, no BIC was established. According to VIS, the government had a plan to establish 10 BIC in ten TVET at national level in 2020/21. EnJOY already managed to establish 12 BIC in TVET. EnJOY also helped to put in place national level BIC guidelines and every supported TVET also has BIC services guidelines. The evaluation team considers that BIC are very helpful for youth (male and female) to incubate their business and to establish demand-driven and market-informed enterprises. The EnJOY support for BIC is considered very relevant.
- d. **Supporting Cooperative trainings:** As per the government directives, regular/level-based trainings need to ensure TVET trainees 30% theoretical and basic skills trainings in TVET and 70% practical training in other relevant industries under a cooperative training arrangement. According to Don Bosco TVET, before EnJOY there were no cooperative trainings and the companies in the area were hesitant or unwilling to accept students. Today, 200 students follow cooperative training with companies. The Sidama region TVET directorate stated that EnJOY helped to establish healthy TVET-industry linkages. EnJOY covered some of the expenses of students in cooperative training.
- e. **Co-financing:** In addition to the cooperative training the project has helped TVET graduates (mostly short term trainees) to get jobs in the relevant industries through job placement. According to the Dean of Yirgalem TVET, 48 graduates have got temporary job opportunities through the co-financing arrangement, in which the project covered 50% of the salary for six months and the company the remaining 50%. This mechanism helped graduates to improve their practical skills in a real-life setting.
- f. **Supporting apprenticeship trainings:** A total of 226 graduates of Yirgalem Polytechnic TVET participated in an 1-month apprenticeship with cost being covered by the project. Out of these, 20 persons later obtained permanent jobs.

Policy assignment of the ENJOY support to TVET:

EnJOY is in line with the governmental policy as regards employability. The regional relevant TVET directorate carried out appraisals to checks for conformity with the public policies and strategies. EnJOY focused on employability and on creating the capacities of the TVET and enterprises and industries.

1. Impact as a result of the support of TVET: EnJOY greatly contributed for Yirgalem TVET to transform from an industrial college into a polytechnic college, and to provide regular training up to level 6 (equivalent to degree level education) with additional budget from the government. Before the change into a Polytechnic TVET, students were expected to travel to other areas to continue their higher level education. Today they can continue their level 5 and 6 education onsite, thus reducing expenses. This is of particular importance to students of vulnerable groups.
2. The project strengthened the industry and TVET linkages ;
3. The ToT and the material support have improved the quality of the TVET education and training;
4. The capacity of the TVET trainers was strengthened to provide the needed skill to the trainees;
5. The TVET provide training to students who are at the eve of graduation. The soft skill training (e.g. on life skills, mind set, entrepreneurship) help them to create their own jobs. It makes them very sharp;
6. The development activities, the trainings and other supports of the TVET have become more visible to the public as a result of the project support;
7. In the case of Don Bosco TVET, the support resulted in the creation of two key departments that provide trainings with high market demand (i.e. garment/tailoring and ICT). Before the project the TVET only had electricity, metal work, and wood work departments. The support has also contributed to the creation of strong linkages between the relevant government office and Don Bosco TVET. Following the labour market assessment Don Bosco TVET managed to provide market-driven trainings. The TVET started providing short term trainings for six months which focus on the skills required for the new machines. It also linked the trainees of the garment department with employers/companies.

Lessons Learned:

- a. The EnJOY financial support for the cooperative trainees was a good help.
- b. Co-financing (50%) of the salaries in job placements was innovative and of great help both to the employers and the alumni;
- c. The government is getting involved now in the work of (the private) Don Bosco TVET. The support is more effective and more collaborative.

Sustainability:

- Don Bosco TVET: The machines are there and they have got trained. The linkage established with relevant stakeholders (labour office, MFI, the job creation) is expected to pertain. The TVET received recognition from the relevant public agencies.
- Don Bosco TVET: The students are expected to pay for the short term trainings. Before, the college used to give such trainings for free, but now the student needs to pay to help them ensure that they take their education seriously.

- Yirgalem TVET: Regular maintenance of machinery and equipment is ensured by the TVET professionals. The purchasing of spare parts will be covered by the government. Yet, some problems in purchasing spare parts might occur.
- Don Bosco TVET: The TVET received the license for the short term trainings from the responsible bodies – for electricity, garment, ICT, metalwork, woodwork.

Recommendations by stakeholders:

1. As TVET are capital-intensive, more support is required and requested. The TVET demands continuation of the project.
2. EnJOY has contributed in two basic ways: 1) capacity-building, and 2) material support. As there are many poor and unemployed youth, there is a need for: continuation and upscaling of the capacity-building trainings, material support, construction of workshop/sheds, generators, etc. The capacity of the government to provide material support is very limited.
3. Machinery support and reference manuals and books are needed, continuation of the co-financing arrangements is very important, as well as the access to seed money for the enterprises from local MFI. Power generators are required where there is no power connection or where power cuts are frequent. The TVET are not able to purchase such from own capital.

Output 4:

1. Enjoy supported the Ministry of Labour and Skills (MoLS) to have national MEAL guidelines.
2. An Evidence Paper was developed and communicated to the relevant actors. The paper explains how the project is in line with existing policies and strategies.

Appendix 3. Sankura Woreda (13-14 December 2023)

Introduction

VITA has been implementing EnJOY project in Dugna Fango (Southern Region) and in Sankura (Central Region). Both regions were formerly part of the SNNP Region. Before EnJOY, VITA has been working directly with end users in the areas of food security and food systems, WASH, rural livelihoods and rural cooperative development. EnJOY is a new type of project for VITA both in terms of approach (market system approach), scope (system level) and target group (mainly Intermediaries in the job creation agenda of the country). VITA is considered the EnJOY thematic expert on Enterprise Development. Below is a summary report of data collected on activities, results and outcomes for this Final Evaluation.

Context of Sankura: Sankura Woreda has a high rate of youth unemployment. The majority of people are Muslim. Both legal migration (through agents) and illegal migration are frequent, especially to the Middle East (mainly Saudi Arabia). Migrants are both female and male youth, but most are female migrants. Migration has been triggered by: peer pressure (i.e. stories of successful migrants), promotion by brokers/traffickers, little prior knowledge of the migrants, the ambition to earn money fast, lack of interest to engage on whatever jobs available locally, etc. Migrants usually pay between ETB 200,000 (legal) and ETB 500,000 (illegal) to reach the Arab host countries. Some Illegal migrants do not consult their family when migrating. Along the migration route they may experience lots of problems including extortion, torture and even loss of life. According to the Woreda Women & Children Affairs and Labour & Social Affairs Offices, in 2021/22 about 600 returnees arrived home.

Outcome 1:

Working with the Public Agencies: EnJOY has been working actively with the SNNP regional government, but not yet with the recently established Central Region (three months ago). The relevant regional offices are now dispersed across different zones. Therefore, VITA has been working with multiple public agencies in the zone (Siltie Zone) and woreda (Sankura): 1) Finance and Economic Development Office and NGO Focal point, 2) Women Affairs Office as responsible for ensuring women inclusion, 3) Labour and Social Affairs Office responsible for ensuring inclusion of people living with disabilities, 4) Labour, Skills & Enterprise Development Office responsible for creating and strengthening of SME and for youth employment, and the 5) Woreda Administration Office.

EnJOY provided various ToT trainings for staff and heads of the Zonal and Woreda level public agencies in life skills, entrepreneurship and work readiness. It also provided different reference training manuals for the offices. EnJOY further provided computers and printers for key woreda offices that are closely working with VITA (i.e. Women & Children Affairs, Labour & Social Affairs and Enterprise Development). The evaluation shows that there has been smooth collaboration between the relevant offices at zonal and woreda level and VITA. VITA has managed to engage these key stakeholders during project design and implementation. The public actors properly know, internalized and own the project, which is a prerequisite for sustainability. VITA has been transparent to relevant public agencies and to the end users. The implementation and management of the project was found to be participatory. VITA has been punctual in providing quarterly reports to the relevant offices and it organized a joint visit to the operational areas on a quarterly basis.

Establishment and enhancement of OSJC: EnJOY undertook several assessments including a OSJC gap assessment and a labour market assessment. The assessments identified key gaps in terms of OSJC availability, accessibility and capacity. Before the project, the woreda had only 1 poorly equipped job centre in town. EnJOY supported the establishment of 13 additional OSJC (i.e. one in Alem Gebeya, 11 in rural kebeles and 1 in the rural town). EnJOY also supported the renovation of all 14 OSJC offices and provided office furniture (computers, printers, tables) for each OSJC. The OSJC staffs met in Sankura Woreda received different trainings. According to Power BI data, a total of 42 staff members (20 women, 22 men) of 14 OSJC were trained in: ET works application, life skills, entrepreneurship, work readiness, coaching and mentoring, and basic computer skills.

The consulted staff in one sample OSJC in Alem Gebeya town confirmed that this OSJC was pre-existing but poorly equipped. Now, thanks to EnJOY, the center has the necessary equipment and a full staff of 11 trained persons. They now manage to provide the required follow-up support to enterprises and to efficiently engage in selecting and registering unemployed youth, organizing the youth into enterprises, providing them with trainings, and helping them get jobs (via job placements). In 2023, the visited OSJC registered 1,135 unemployed youth and created jobs for 225 youth (113 women, 112 men). During the project life a total of 7,336 unemployed youth have registered (47% are women). Of these, 29% got a job (35% are women). All the key informants from the sample OSJC witnessed that they are actively engaged in the job creation and enterprise development activities and that the communities have a positive attitude towards their OSJC while their work is very visible in their operational areas. They confirmed that this is due to EnJOY support. However, they regret that EnJOY did not also provide technical trainings on key sectors like manufacturing and agriculture.

Functioning of ET Works: There is no district level online portal in place, but EnJOY has provided each of the 14 OSJC with a tablet with ET Works software in order to register unemployed youth, and to share that information with woreda, zonal, regional and federal level line offices. EnJOY provided training to OSJC staff (74 persons according to Power BI data) on how to register the unemployed youth and to share data with the relevant offices at all levels.

Outcome 2:

Establishing and strengthening SME: Sankura Woreda counts a total of 49 enterprises with 223 members as per Power BI data. According to the heads of the urban and rural Labour, Skills & Enterprise Development Offices, most SME engage in the services sector, agriculture and manufacturing (e.g. wood work, furniture production, metal works). The services sector takes the lion share of jobs created.

Before being trained by EnJOY, the youth involved first need to identify their business and to establish their enterprises with follow-up and assistance of OSJC staff. Then they become eligible to receive trainings, mainly provided by Sankura TVET and by OSJC staff. This way, some 223 members of different enterprises received entrepreneurship, life skills and work readiness trainings. The project also arranged experience-sharing visits for 22 SME. Furthermore, EnJOY supported renovation of the irrigation channels of 1 enterprise. It also provided training on irrigation management and distributed some improved seeds for planting.

EnJOY also granted 3 female lead SME ETB 10,000 each as an incentive. Two (2) model enterprises received refrigerators, bread and Injera baking equipment as a gift. In addition, the staff of both rural and urban OSJC provided mentoring and follow-up support to the SME. This is reported to have been useful for the continuation of the enterprises in their business.

Helping SME to access finance: Enterprises supported by EnJOY through VITA did not increase their access to loans. No revolving fund was established. According to VITA staff there are only a few private financial institutions in the operational area and there is also reluctance (in the case of Dugna Fango of Wolayita) to engage with the OMO Bank. As Sankura is a Muslim area, loans at an interest are not accepted. VITA moreover had had a difficult relationship with the predecessor of OMO Bank (i.e. OMO Micro-finance). VITA lost confidence and trust setting up a revolving fund. The related budget was reallocated to other activities, such as the installation of solar technology at OSJC which are out of grid, and granting incentives to some women lead enterprises (e.g. refrigerators).

All key informants of the public institutions highlighted access to finance to be a critical challenge for new and established enterprises. In principle, non-interest free loans are offered by OMO Bank in Sakura woreda; the bank then purchases the equipment and provides it to enterprises in exchange for collateral at the bank. The key informants stated that this is a good arrangement for Muslim areas like Sankura. Yet, most enterprises, especially in the rural areas, cannot provide sufficient collateral.

To solve financially-related problems, the enterprises engage in services sectors which do not demand a big financial investment. With the accumulated income they then shift their business to other sectors like manufacturing. Yet, even to engage in the services sector they need to solicit some money, either from families or friends in the form of a gift or a loan (at no interest).

Facilitation of IBIC: EnJOY facilitated IBIC for youth and enterprises. According to Power BI data a total of 15 enterprises took part. As per the key informants from Sankura Woreda, 6 of them received an IBIC award - 4 from urban areas (Alem Gebeya) and 2 from rural areas. The amount awarded ranged from ETB 60,000 to ETB 100,000. All awardees have started their business in the meantime.

Construction of sheds: Through VITA, EnJOY supported the construction of market shades for SME; one for urban areas and the other for rural areas, each of the blocks having five (5) rooms. The market sheds can be used by the enterprises for five (5) consecutive years.

Outcome 3:

General: Siltie Zone has 9 TVET. EnJOY supported only the Sankura Construction and Industrial college. This Sankura TVET includes following subject matters: ICT, Automotive, Mechanics, Woodwork, Garment, Construction, Installation (plumping and sanitation) and Electrical. EnJOY first undertook a TVET gap and needs assessment and a labour market assessment to inform the intervention. According to the interviewees, the assessment was very helpful to understand what is really needed.

Purchase of machinery/equipment: EnJOY purchased 27 computers to capacitate the ICT department. At project start, the ICT department had only two (2) old desktop computers. It then was at risk of losing its accredited level of teaching by lack of adequate equipment. By today, however, the TVET department has been upgraded and is able to provide certificates to its trainees.

EnJOY has purchased different relevant machineries and associated accessories for the Sankura TVET woodwork and automotive departments. The TVET in the country are expected to provide 70% practical and 30% theoretical trainings respectively. Before the project, however, 95% of the trainings by Sankura TVET were theoretical, due to a lack of key machineries and equipment. Today, Sankura TVET is able to provide practical trainings both on a long-term and a short-term basis.

The Mechanics department was established in 2016 and then received different machineries from the government including a LiSEC machine. These high-cost machines were not functioning, though, due to a lack of some essential low-cost accessories. As per the key informants, EnJOY spent up to ETB 1 million to purchase the required accessories and to make the machines functional again. Electric power cuts are another problem identified at project start. EnJOY has purchased a 35 KVA Generator for ETB 2.2 million for the TVET, but it was not yet operational at the time of field assessment.

In general, as per zonal and woreda level key informants, the project support has been useful and very relevant, as it has helped the TVET to provide skills and practical trainings. The support was very good both in terms of quality and quantity. Zonal TVET sector representatives stated that it made Sankura TVET being almost equivalent in service level to the Werabe Polytechnic College. The key informants state that it is really impossible for the government to do what EnJOY did for the college. This raises some concerns about the scalability of the EnJOY approach. In any case, the TVET is now able to provide against the government 70/30 directive. The evaluation team finds the EnJOY support to be relevant and huge, but given the financial constraints of the local and federal governments, machinery maintenance cost and purchase of key accessories may remain problematic, and may have a negative impact on sustainability. The TVET should reflect on how to generate adequate own income to cover these machinery operational costs.

Capacity-building of TVET trainers and management: EnJOY has provided trainings for TVET technical and management staff. These include training on business incubation, life-skills, entrepreneurship, project proposal development, IBEX and other financial management trainings. Vocational related trainings related to: agro-processing, garment production, metalworks, AutoCAD and surveys. The staff was also trained in the use of vocational training manuals. According to Power BI data, a total of 17 TVET staff received ToT trainings (1 women, 16 men). EnJOY also arranged an experience-sharing visit for the trainers to Werabe Polytechnic College.

Setting up BIC: EnJOY has helped the TVET to establish a BIC. However, unlike the other target TVET, the support of EnJOY for Sankura TVET in the establishment of BIC is minimal. Only 2 of the 27 computers supported for the ICT department are being used in BIC. EnJOY did provide training for the TVET staff on how to set up the BIC, how to select business ideas and how to incubate the business idea in the centre. However, the college did not receive any innovative business ideas from its trainees so far, therefore no business ideas have as yet been incubated.

Results due to the support of the project

1. The support created a significant capacity both in terms of equipment and human capital. The TVET now is able to provide CoC to its trainees which was not the case before the project. In fact, the EnJOY support prevented the TVET from closure of the ICT department by the regional TVET agency;

2. The support helped the TVET to shift from 95% theoretical training to providing more practical trainings;
3. Government public agencies at woreda level were encouraged to start promoting the trainings of the TVET throughout the woreda, which helped to raise the number of students enrolled;
4. Trainers of the different TVET departments were encouraged to proactively support the youth;
5. The TVET has started planning to establish own enterprises which may use the TVET machinery at a fee basis (using their own raw materials) to engage in production;
6. Due to the EnJOY support, Sankura TVET increased the provision of practical trainings, so that trainees do no longer have to go to Werabe Polytechnic College (at 60 km from Sankura). This solved problems related to transport and reduced the expenses for the trainees.
7. Due to the EnJOY support, Sankura TVET has started providing short-term trainings at a fee basis. The short courses (mainly in ICT) target staff from enterprises and from government.

Challenges

1. The lack of raw materials in the different department of the TVET, especially in woodworks and metalworks and garment production;
2. The small number of computers in the BIC, and in general the limited support for BIC;
3. More student need to engage in ICT, but the ICT department has only 20 computers;
4. The lack of access to finance by SME to develop their business.

Lessons learned

- a. The Zonal TVET department has been mobilizing the communities to generate resources. In 2022, the department managed to generate ETB 1 million from communities to purchase more than 40 computers for Dalocha TVET in Dalocha Woreda, which as a result then started providing CoC. In Lara Woreda, thanks to community mobilization, the agency managed to purchase automotive related machines. This community mobilization work will be continued.
- b. Based on the EnJOY experience, the Zonal TVET department planned to establish a BIC in Werabe Polytechnic College; but it is still faced with financial problems.

Recommendations

1. Provide more financial and vocational trainings for TVET and other public agencies to support the government's youth job creation agenda;
2. Continue the EnJOY project for the benefit of other woredas;
3. Enable the TVET to generate own income in order to be self-sufficient financially.

Appendix 4. Gedeb Assosa Woreda (15-16 December 2023)

Introduction: Caritas Switzerland is the consortium lead and implementer of the EnJOY Project in Gedeb Assosa (West Arsi Zone) and Adama Zuria (East Shewa Zone) in Oromia Region. Below is a summary of the key activities, results, lessons learned, challenges, sustainability and recommendations by stakeholders.

Context of Gedeb Assosa: The woreda has 33 kebeles of which 25 are rural kebeles and 8 urban kebeles. The woreda is known for its high number of unemployment. In 2022/23, 12,600 unemployed youth were registered, of which 850 returnees mainly from Arab Countries, including Saudi Arabia and Sudan. In 2021/22 there were 500 people living with disabilities. Though there is a high number of Muslims in the woreda, the provision of loans with interest is accepted by all groups.

Outcome 1:

Working with Public Agencies: EnJOY has been working with Regional and Woreda public agencies in a proactive manner. At Woreda level these include: Job Creation, Women & Children Affairs, Finance & Economic Development, Youth, Labour & Social Affairs, Agriculture and Woreda Administration Offices. CACH organized two committees at woreda level: 1) a management committee constituted of the heads of the seven agencies, and 2) a technical committee constituted of focal persons of the same agencies. Most of the project activities have been undertaken by the technical committee in association with the CACH staff. Decisions were made by the management committee.

CACH assessed the capacity of the seven stakeholders before implementing EnJOY. Logistics and skills/knowledge were found to be critical gaps. In response, EnJOY has purchased motorcycles, printers and computers for each of the offices. All key informants confirmed that these supports helped them speed up their service delivery and to reach out to all 25 rural kebeles. Whereas the evaluation team considers these supports to be relevant, it notes that the responsibilities of the different agencies are not the same, and that the logistic support could thus have been more varied in line with needs. The logistic support for the Job creation office is considered most critical for EnJOY.

EnJOY provided capacity-building trainings for staff of the public agencies. The trainings considered: life skills, entrepreneurship and work readiness, coaching and mentoring, organizational leadership, basic computer skills, proposal development and Monitoring and Evaluation.

The evaluation indicates that EnJOY exhibited positive, collaborative and transparent relationships with the public agencies. Project activities were planned jointly. The evaluation team believes this to be crucial for ownership and sustainability of the project outcomes and impacts. The representatives of public agencies are found to be very familiar with the project.

Shifting existing Job Centers into OSJC and supporting new OSJC: The OSJC were assessed on needs and gaps and a labor market assessment was carried out. At project start, the Woreda had 4 job centres (1 in Assosa and 3 in rural areas) which were poorly equipped in terms of human power and office facilities, and therefore were not providing services as expected. As to the current OSJC staff, the offices were not inviting (poorly maintained) and did not receive enough attention of the government. EnJOY strengthened the existing 4 job centres transforming them into OSJC, and it supported the establishment of 8 new OSJC. Now, the woreda has 12 OSJC of which 2 are in town to serve 8 urban

kebeles and 10 in rural areas to serve 25 rural kebeles applying a cluster approach. All OSJC have legal status. EnJOY supported renovation of their offices and provided key equipment like a computer, triple purpose printer (printing, scanning, copying), office furniture (tables, chairs, shelves) and a motorcycle. EnJOY also installed solar powered electricity for each of the OSJC. The government assigned OSJC, to which EnJOY provided trainings on: life skills, entrepreneurship, work readiness, ET Works application, mentoring & coaching, and leadership. According to Power BI, 37 OSJC staff were trained (11 women, 26 men). However, the number of staff assigned by the government is small compared to the number of positions to be filled. For instance, in one of the visited OSJC, only 3 out of 11 positions were filled. In urban-based OSJC, which are more busy than rural OSJC, the government assigned a relatively higher number of staff. For instance, 7 out of 11 positions were filled in Assosa Town.

Due to the EnJOY support, the staff feel highly encouraged and enabled to support the unemployed youth. The OSJC now have better acceptance by the communities, the number of unemployed youth getting registered is increasing, and the quality of the services improved. The evaluation team has concerns, however, about the sustainability of the OSJC after project closure, as they lack sufficient budget for running cost and maintenance.

ET Works: EnJOY supported the Ministry of Labour & Skills (MoLS) to pilot its ET Works software to register unemployed youth at grassroots level and to share the information with the Federal Ministry. In Gedeb Assosa, EnJOY purchased a tablet for each OSJC to upload ET Works and provided training on its application. The application is available both in Oromiffa and in English language.

Outcome 2:

Establishment and Strengthening of SME: EnJOY has provided support for the establishment of new SME through capacity-building of OSJC and of the Job Creation office. According to Power BI data, a total of 282 SME and 705 members (289 women; 41%) have received support from the project. The number of unemployed youth being organized into SME increased. The main sectors concerned are: services sector, agriculture, manufacturing, mining and construction.

All relevant public agencies and the TVET have been involved in establishing and strengthening SME. The Women Affairs and Social & Labour Affairs Offices have been striving to ensure the inclusion of women and disabled persons, and the Agriculture Office provided technical assistance for SME in the agricultural sector. The Job Creation office strived to put in place roles and procedures and to help SME to get access to finance, training and coaching/mentoring from OSJC staff. The evaluation team values the integrated engagement of the relevant stakeholders. In total, 12 SME with 120 members (all women) have engaged in pottery production in Negele Kebele after having been trained by an expert from Addis Ababa. The Job creation office, the OSJC and the TVET were also involved.

Access to finance for SME: EnJOY has put in place a revolving fund for loans for SME at the Oromia Cooperative Bank. So far, 14 SME have received a loan. A total of ETB 1.4 million was disbursed. Each SME received ETB 100,000 to be reimbursed within 12 months. At the time of the evaluation, about 80% of the loans had been reimbursed which is as per plan. The remaining 20% is expected to be paid within the agreed period. However, according to the Job Creation office, the amount of loan available is small compared to the demand. Currently, there are more than 30 SME on the waiting list. Also, the amount of loan per SME is small taking into account the current high rate of inflation, which reduces the effective purchasing power.

Facilitation of IBIC: The IBIC competitions are used to enhance the capacity of unemployed youth and enterprises in business planning and business development, and to strengthen their skills and knowledge for getting access to finance. In Gedeb Assosa, two types of IBIC were organized: 1) organized by public agencies and OSJC and open to all unemployed youth, and 2) organized by TVET for graduates who incubated their ideas in the BIC. The open IBIC generated a total of 250 applicants of which 30 were selected for trainings and 12 became award winners. The TVET IBIC registered 130 TVET graduates of which 30 were shortlisted and 10 won an award. In total 22 individuals and groups thus received an award to the aggregated value of ETB 2.45 million. The winners of the open award received between ETB 65,000 to ETB 100,000. The TVET IBIC award winners received between ETB 100,000 and ETB 200,000. All interviewees stated that the IBIC mechanism is very important to motivate youth to be creative, capable and determined in innovation. The regional government says to be planning to scale up the IBIC experience with own budgets.

Construction of sheds: EnJOY has constructed 4 block of sheds to help enterprises access working space. Lack of access to working premises is one of the key problems for starting enterprises. The demand for work premises is high, which would justify additional support in this area.

Market linkages: EnJOY also helped enterprises and individual producers to link to markets. A total of 283 individuals participated in bazars. According to Power BI data, only 31 of these were women.

Other support to SME: Some SME in irrigated agriculture were provided with seeds for wheat, potato and barley production: 60 persons have received potato seeds, 20 persons barley seed and 231 persons wheat seed. During interviews it turned out that it is critical as a project to link producers with the seed suppliers, rather than to ensure the mere provision of seeds. In fact, producers said not to have been able to procure the same improved seeds the following year.

Outcome 3:

General: In Gedeb Assosa Woreda there are two TVET: 1) Assosa TVET, and 2) Ardaita Agricultural College. Ardaita Agricultural College is reported to be relatively strong in terms of human capital and equipment as compared to Assosa TVET. EnJOY supported both TVET - but quite significant portions of the support went to Assosa TVET, especially machinery.

Purchase of machinery/equipment: The Assosa TVET has 14 departments of which 3 were added in the last three years. The new departments are: Hair dressing, Livestock production (mainly bee keeping, poultry, livestock production and fattening) and Crop production. Hair dressing is established thanks to the support of EnJOY. Other major departments are: ICT, Garment/apparel, manufacturing (metalworks and woodworks) and General Mechanics.

EnJOY has enabled the purchase of many machines and equipment for the TVET based on a detailed and consultative needs and gaps assessment. EnJOY purchased a total of 40 computers for the TVET: 25 for the BIC and 15 for the ICT department. The garment department received 40 machines (most are modern sewing machines). Furthermore, 10 hair dressing machines were purchased for the new hair dressing department. The General mechanics and woodworks departments also received machinery support. Two motorbikes were purchased for the TVET. The Ardaita TVET received 25 computers for the establishment of its BIC, and also 2 motorbikes.

The high EnJOY contribution in machineries brought visible capacity improvement. For instance, the ICT department of Assosa TVET has started receiving more students and the number of groups of ICT students increased from 2 to 4. Previously, the TVET had no BIC but now it managed to train 143 students in the BIC and 30 students incubating their business ideas. The Garment department has improved its level of training from levels 1 and 2 to levels 3 and 4. Previously, the college had no hair dressing department, but now 30 students are attending their education and there are other additional students engaged in short term trainings. These are all tangible impacts of the EnJOY support.

The support of a motorcycle helps the college to reach the rural kebeles, to provide technical trainings to farmers, and to promote the TVET trainings to the rural people. This has resulted in an increase in the number of attendees.

Thanks to the material support, the college has reached to higher levels with a better quality of trainings and an increased number of students. Students do no longer have to travel to continue their next level trainings; thus reducing the cost of education. The evaluation team believes that the support contributes importantly to the college realizing the governmental directives (70% practice, 30% theory). The TVET can now deliver skilled trainees who are capable of creating their own business and/or to enter the industry. Yet, the TVET shall review how to generate adequate income for coverage of its own maintenance and running costs.

Capacity-building support: EnJOY has provided capacity-building through Training-of-Trainers (ToT) courses for technical and supporting staff of both Assosa TVET and Ardaita Agricultural College. According to Power BI data, 46 TVET staff were trained (of which only 4 women) on: agro-processing, business incubation, apparel/garment, ICT, soil work, monitoring, database management, IFRS, iBEX, metalworks, life skills, project proposal development, Auto CAD and surveys. The interviewees testified that the trainings were very helpful to manage the TVET activities and to enhance the quality of the TVET trainings.

BIC: EnJOY supported the establishment of BIC in the two TVET, for the incubation of business ideas. The interviewees praised this support. EnJOY has provided 50 computers for the 2 TVET, plus chairs and tables. According to Power BI data, 131 students got trained in the BIC, of which 10 won an award and got financial incentives. Currently, 30 students are incubating their business in the BIC of Assosa TVET.

Cooperative Trainings: Any trainees who enroll in TVET need to have 70% practical and 30% basic and theoretical trainings before they get graduated. The practical trainings are organised in cooperation with relevant colleges and industries. In the case of Assosa, the cooperative trainings have been managed with the Assosa, Shashamane and Melka Wakana TVET. The EnJOY project supported the trainees with transportation fees and allowances. So far, 500 students have benefited from this.

School-to-work transfer/Co-financing: To facilitate school-to-work transition and help graduates get both experience and job opportunities, EnJOY has co-financed 24 students in two rounds of job placements, covering 50% of their salary for a 6-months' period. Of these, 12 students (50%) have subsequently become permanent employees.

Results

1. The number of trainees is increasing and the quality of trainings improved thanks to the EnJOY support. The TVET is getting positive response from the communities;
2. The project contributed to a change in mindset and attitude of the youth towards being self-employed. The EnJOY support enhanced the commitment of the staff of the public agencies to support the system and the end users;
3. A new department was opened (hair dressing), for which there is a high market demand;
4. The TVET now is able to reach out to the rural kebeles thanks to the logistic support (motorbike);
5. The linkages between the TVET and the Industry improved due to the facilitation of school-to-work transition;
6. As the college has been improving the level of some of its departments (e.g. Garment from levels 1 and 2 to levels 3 and 4), the students do not have to go elsewhere for further trainings. This reduces the cost of education;
7. The Assosa TVET now provides short-term trainings for enterprises and individual job seekers in the areas of garment production, ICT and hair dressing ;
8. Due to the support, the Assosa TVET ranked 1st in a competition organized by the Zonal relevant government. It received recognition for the types and quality of the trainings it has been providing.

Lessons learned

1. Working with the relevant stakeholders in a collaborative, participatory and transparent manner is found to be impactful;
2. All the project interventions were informed by a prior needs and gaps assessment;
3. The IBIC have been motivating youth to create business ideas and to engage in business development;
4. Several research institutions and universities (i.e. Adama University) were involved in evaluating the business plans of IBIC participants ;
5. The organisation of the women-only pottery production enterprises was successful in increasing the quality of the pottery and the product range on offer.

Challenges in project implementation

1. High staff turnover at public agencies;
2. Lack of sufficient budget from the government side to ensure maintenance and running costs;
3. The size of loans given to the enterprises is small and the amount of fund available for loans is very small as compare to the existing demand.

Sustainability

1. The project has made important investments through purchase of the necessary materials/machineries and by enhancing the capacity of the trainers/staffs. It shall be relatively easy to sustain the work of the project. Good political buy in from the government, and adequate public budget, is needed to ensure such;

2. The TVET staff itself can contribute in the smaller and medium-size maintenance of the new machinery and equipment. The TVET staff trust that any severe damage to the machines will be covered through the government. They believe that the maintenance costs are relatively small and can be covered from the public budget.

Recommendations by stakeholders

1. Both the TVET and the OSJC need to re-think how to generate sufficient income to at least cover the running costs of the new machinery and equipment, including machine maintenance cost and purchase of some accessories, stationery, etc.;
2. As youth unemployment is very high in the areas, continuation of the project is badly needed;
3. The support of EnJOY for the TVET has been enormous. Yet, in order to become the desired Centre of Excellence, further support will still be required from the government and/or NGOs;
4. Lack of access to finance is a critical gap. More support is requested to reach more enterprises.

Appendix 5. Adama Zuria Woreda (17-19 December 2023)

Introduction: Caritas Switzerland (CACH) is consortium lead and implementer of the EnJOY project in Adama Zuria (East Shewa) and Gedeb Assosa (West Arsi Zone) in Oromia Region. Below is a summary of the key activities, results, lessons learned, challenges, sustainability and recommendations by stakeholders in Adama Zuria Woreda.

Context of Adama Zuria: The woreda consisted of 45 rural kebeles. However, following the geographic expansion of Adama Town at the expense of the woreda, as of mid-2023, 23 of the 45 rural kebeles have become part of the town. Some of the OSJC and SME supported by the project now thus fall under the mandate of the town administration. In Adama Zuria, unlike in the other project woredas, many industries are present and are providing job opportunities for youth in general and for TVET graduates in particular. EnJOY has supported two TVET in the woreda: Wonji Polytechnic and Awash Meklasa. Most support went to Wonji Polytechnic TVET.

Outcome 1:

Working with public agencies: EnJOY has been working with Regional and Woreda public agencies in a proactive manner. At woreda level these include the: Job Creation, Women & Children Affairs, Finance & Economic Development, Labour & Social Affairs, Agriculture and Woreda Administration Offices. Interviewees confirm that the project has enhanced the human capital and the material and operational capacities of the public agencies. All the focal persons and heads of the offices have received ToT trainings on different subjects including: work readiness, entrepreneurship, life skills, project development, and coaching and mentoring. All focal persons also took part in PPP and MEAL related workshops. The ToT trainings intend to build the capacity of the staff of the public agencies to convey training to members of the SME and other unemployed people of the rural kebeles. The evaluation team considers these capacity supports to be most relevant to achieving the objective of the Ethiopian Rural Job Creation Agenda.

The EnJOY project has provided material supports to the public agencies, including computers, printers, office furniture and motorbikes. The focal persons from the Finance and Women Affairs offices said that their respective offices have never before received such types of support from any NGO, and that even the government has never planned to equip their office in such a manner. Thanks to the human and material support the offices are now able to support the enterprises and OSJC in the rural kebeles. The evaluation team considers these supports to be relevant. Yet, as the responsibilities of these agencies are not the same, the logistic support could also have been more diversified. The logistic support for the Job Creation office is considered most critical.

The interviews by the evaluation team revealed that it has not been difficult for the project to work with the relevant offices and other stakeholders, and that there have been collaborative, participatory and transparent relationships between CACH and the public agencies. There was regular reporting and there were joint visits of project activities by the relevant stakeholders. Planning and implementation of the project activities was collaborative and consultative, and was based on the findings of various needs assessments undertaken by EnJOY. The focal persons of the public agencies said that the EnJOY staff was very easy to work with and easily accessible whenever needed.

Shifting existing job centres into OSJC and supporting new OSJC: Before the start of the project the woreda had 5 job centres which were poorly equipped. As per the staff of one of the visited OSJC in Wonji town, the centre did not receive much attention of the government at the time. It had only one staff member and little key facilities including office furniture.

EnJOY has first undertaken a needs and gaps assessment. Based on the outcomes, EnJOY has supported the woreda to open 9 new additional OSJC and to renovate the offices of both the new and existing ones. It has also provided materials: computer, multi-purpose printers (for printing, scanning and coping), office furniture (shelves, tables, chairs and stationary) plus a motorbike for each of the 14 OSJC. In addition to the material support the project has provided ToT training in Debre Zeit/Bishoftu to the OSJC and public agencies staffs. Themes included: work readiness, life skills, entrepreneurship, coaching and mentoring, project proposal development, ET-Works application and basic computer skills. According to the information on the Power BI, a total of 19 OSJC staffs received training (9 women, 10 men). All 14 OSJC are now well equipped and able to provide sufficient support for the unemployed youth and the enterprises. The evaluation team witnessed that the OSJC visited looked vibrant and dynamic in providing job-related services for its clients.

Now that the woreda has 14 OSJC, it has been providing different services to the unemployed youth and to the enterprises that are at work. The OSJC register the unemployed (a total of 8,152 job seekers are registered over the entire project period of which 41% are women, according to Power BI), they organize the youth into enterprises, they provide coaching and monitoring of SME, they provide training on financial management, life skills and entrepreneurship together with TVET, they link job seekers with employers for temporary and permanent jobs, and they share the registered unemployed youth profiles with other woredas and zones, and with regional and federal level line offices. The material and training support of EnJOY has contributed greatly in making the OSJC work productive and visible to the people. Of the total 8,152 job seekers registered, 1,290 found jobs (26% are women) and 1,423 received trainings (25% are women) according to the information on Power BI. The government increased its attention for the OSJC assigning new, additional permanent staff.

The establishment of new rural OSJC and the strengthen of the existing job centres make the OSJC very accessible to the people. Clients do no longer have to go to Adama Town for the same services and this in turn reduces the associated costs and time for the information seekers. The OSJC staffs who the consultants consulted have reported that due to the supports of OSJC in particular and the project in general the number of unemployed youth is decreasing. It is also reported that CACH is the only organization that has been providing support for the OSJC.

The evaluation team wonders whether the OSJC will be able to continue providing the services at the same level once the project phases out. The OSJC may not continue to receive the same support from the government, specially for the running costs (i.e. fuel, per diem and stationary cost).

ET Works: ET Works is a newly-introduced system developed by the Ministry of Labour and Skills (MoLS) as a pilot and supported by EnJOY in the project woredas. ET Works comes with a tablet which is provided both by the project and the Regional Job Creation Bureau. EnJOY organizes trainings on use of the tablet. According to the CACH Field Coordinator, ET Works is still under development and is intended to go beyond mere job seeker registration. Yet, the evaluation team noted on-site that yet another system was now being launched by the government.

The Electronic Labour Market Information System (E-LMIS) has been developed with support of the World Bank. Most of the features of ET-Works are also included in E-LIMS, yet for E-LIMS, individuals are expected to come to the OSJC office for full biometric registration (photo and finger prints) in exchange for a unique Code. Once registered in E-LIMS, one cannot (and does not have to) register again in other areas of the country. The E-LIMS enables the government to know the number of unemployed people in the country, and it helps people who want to travel outside of Ethiopia for employment. All the information is sent to the Federal MoLS, but any organization which has access to the server can get access to the information in the system. In the case of ET Works, the OSJC staff go to the people in the village and register the unemployed youth. No finger print and image is needed for ET Works. According to the CACH field coordinator, the two systems are not the same but can feed information to each other and may possibly be integrated in the future.

PPP: Before PPP establishment, EnJOY assessed the existing partnerships between TVET and the private and public industries/enterprises. EnJOY arranged different panel discussions between these partners: three times at district level and two times at regional level, with the presence of different relevant stakeholders. The main points of discussion were how to further enhance cooperative trainings and school -to-work transition. One of the main issues discussed was that, though the industries agree to provide cooperative training to TVET graduates, they do not always provide sufficient space and opportunities for the students for the cooperative trainings, and they do sometimes not allow the student to use their machines fearing that they might be damaged. The PPP discussed such issues to reach some consensus. The interviewees confirmed that the PPP platforms created good opportunities for collaboration and coordination and for jointly solving common problems. EnJOY facilitated the platforms, and TVET and the Job Creation office led the PPP. Though the government already undertook similar initiatives before, it is found to be difficult to make such platforms sustainable. The evaluation team considers that more work is needed to define when a platform is a platform, who should be the “manager” and how the PP could become self-sustaining in the longer run.

Outcome 2:

Establishment and strengthening of SME: According to Power BI data, a total of 107 enterprises and 1,730 members (40% are women) are available in Adama Zuria Woreda. Of these SME, 44 are in the services sector, 32 in agriculture, 20 in manufacturing (metalworks and woodworks), 8 in mining/quarrying, and 3 in construction. The SME gap assessment revealed gaps in knowledge and skills. Based on this, trainings on different subjects were provided to SME members, including on: life skills, entrepreneurship, and work readiness. Irrigation management trainings were provided to those engaging in irrigation. Some government staff also received ToT trainings on the subject matters.

The TVET have been providing training and mentorship and coaching for the enterprises together with OSJC staff. During the field work, the evaluation team met with a TVET staff member assigned at OSJC (in Wonji) to support the centre in capacitating and helping the SME and individual job seekers on trainings and capacity building support. The team considers this combined arrangement to be very useful to job seekers. It might be copied also to other areas. Another major activity of EnJOY was the elaboration and diffusion of radio programs (21 sessions in Oromiffa) using the public Oromia Broadcast Network (OBN) to encourage youth to proactively seek jobs and trainings to become entrepreneurs and to change attitudes and working cultures. The respective OSJC arranged radio listening sessions. Through the radio programs also many people living outside the project woredas have been reached.

Access to finance for SME: EnJOY helped SME to get access to loans. Fourteen (14) SME were selected with the involvement of OSJC and woreda relevant offices. Selected were SME engaging primarily in agriculture (70%) and the manufacturing sector, and SME with a large number of women. A total of ETB 1.4 million of loans was dispersed at a 10% annual interest rate, through the Oromia Cooperative Bank from a Revolving Fund provided by EnJOY. The SME are expected to reimburse the loan within 14 months – including a 2 months’ grace period. So far, ETB 500,000 had been re-paid (36% of total). The reimbursement rate thus is lower than in other districts. A major reason for this likely is the geographical expansion of Adama Town in 2023. As Adama Town was not part of EnJOY project from the start it did not thus far undertake much follow-up to ensure reimbursement. The key informants from Adama Zuria Woreda believe, however, that these SME would be able to reimburse their loans as they all are in business and have the capacity to repay. It is just a matter of effective follow-up.

The Oromia Cooperative Bank and the Woreda Job creation office jointly manage the Revolving Fund under the supervision of the Regional Job creation office. A MoU was signed on how to manage the fund. The evaluation team notes, however, that only 14 of the 107 SME have received a loan and that the resources available are small as compared to the demand. The FGD discussants also confirmed that the loan amount is very small for the types of business they are engaged in.

Facilitation of IBIC: The IBIC competition has basically two purposes: A) enhancing the skills and knowledge of the participating youths and enterprises, and B) providing access to start-up capital. Just like in Gedeb Assosa, two types of IBIC were organized in Adama Zuria Woreda: 1) one organized by public agencies and OSJC and open to all unemployed youth and enterprises, and 2) another organized by TVET for graduates who incubated their ideas in the BIC. The open IBIC generated a total of 105 applicants of which 30 were selected for trainings and 12 became award winners. The TVET IBIC registered 17 graduates of Wonji TVET of which 15 submitted their business plan and 6 won an award. In total of ETB 1.9 million was awarded to 18 award winners. The regional government has started scaling up the IBIC to Beset and Wolenchite Woredas (East Shewa Zone) soliciting finance from different sources. The Evaluation team notes a relatively low number of IBIC participants from Wonji TVET. This may be due to the important employment opportunities that are around in Adama.

Construction of sheds: EnJOY has constructed two (2) blocks of sheds, each having four rooms/units, to provide enterprises with working space. Lack of access to working premises is one of the key problems for starting enterprises. The demand for work premises is high, which would justify additional support in this area.

Market linkages: EnJOY has supported enterprises to improve their access to markets. The project has sponsored twice the organization of bazars/market days in Adama Town. These events were appreciated by the enterprises, as it helped them to promote their products and to interact with their potential customers.

Other support to SME: EnJOY supported 55 women in Adama Zuria kebeles who are engaging in pottery production. Wonji TVET played a key role in this, by assessing the situation of the women and by generating ideas on how to support the pottery producers. EnJOY provided trainings bringing in experts from Addis Ababa, and by the construction of sheds for display and sale of the products. Each of the producers received a wheel to increase efficiency and productivity (25 wheels manufactured by the Wonji TVET, the rest purchased by EnJOY). As a result of the training and the material support, these women pottery groups have started producing 18 different types of pottery products (before there was just 1 product). Following the improvement in the quality and the market linkage, the price of the items has increased significantly (e.g. the price of a coffee pot, in Amharic called “Jebena”, increased from ETB 20 to ETB 80).

In addition the project has provided improved seeds for 6 enterprises and 22 water pumps for SME engaging in irrigation. Both were grants.

Outcome 3:

General: In Adama Zuria Woreda there is a high number of industries and hotels etc. providing many interesting job opportunities. There are two TVET supported by the project: 1) Wonji Polytechnic, and 2) Awash Melkassa TVET. Wonji TVET was selected for review in this evaluation. Wonji TVET has four areas of specialization: garment production, automotive, manufacturing and electricity. EnJOY has supported two departments, namely Garment production and Manufacturing. Before the support to the TVET, EnJOY first undertook a TVET gaps and needs assessment. It turned out that some of the departments (such as ICT, Garment production, Manufacturing) required renovation. According to the labour market assessment, there is high demand of trainees in garment production and mechanics. In 2022/23, about 500 graduates from garment departments were demanded by local industries.

Purchase of machinery/equipment: As the assessment showed gaps in the areas of equipment, EnJOY purchased 6 types of garment machines for the TVET. The 25 machines are reported to be very modern and easy to adapt and use. For the manufacturing department, the project purchased 5 machines. For the new BIC, EnJOY bought, a total of 25 computers, plus chairs and tables, 1 LCD projector, 1 photocopy machine and 1 printer. The college also received 3 motorbikes. This huge material support has brought

visible change in the TVET. The support to the garment department allowed the provision of short-term trainings based on the labour market assessment, in addition to providing quality trainings for the regular TVET students. At the time of the evaluation, the TVET had managed to provide 4 rounds of short-term trainings, with the 5th one in progress. A good number of youth trainees, particularly women/girls, have benefited from this support. Some created their own jobs and others got employed.

Capacity-building support: The project has provided trainings both to trainers and to management staff in the areas of: entrepreneurship, life skills, project proposal development, IFRS, iBEX, agro-processing, business incubation, garment/apparel, solid works, ICT, metalworks, Auto CAD and surveys. The trainings were held in Hawassa (for more technical training) and in Debre Zeit/Bishoftu (for business and management trainings). According to Power BI data, a total of 44 TVET staffs were trained (10 women, 34 men).

BIC: EnJOY has provided all the necessary support for the establishment of a BIC unit in the TVET, including computers, furniture, printers, renovation of the unit, and provision of training for the staff on business incubation. As a result, graduates of the TVET have been trained at the centre on some important software, and then started developing their business ideas. As per the Power BI, 247 people received training in the BIC (110 women, 37 men). After incubating their business ideas in the BIC, 15 trainees submitted their business plans to compete on the IBIC, of which 6 then won an award.

Cooperative trainings: The TVET already had a cooperative training agreement with different industries before project start. These industries include Wonji Sugar Factory, Ethio Pulp and Paper Factory, Adama Garment Factory, Ethio Turkey Textile/Garment Factory, Balai Ab Kable Factory, Adama Tractor Factory and Adama Iron sheet factory for roofing. However, some industries do not allow the TVET trainees to work on the available machineries for fears of damage due to misuse. To solve this problem and to strengthen the collaboration between the TVET and these industries, the project has organized panel discussions and mediations.

School-to-work transfer/Co-financing: There is no co-financing school-to-work arrangement in the case of Wonji TVET. The main reason is that for graduates there are no major problem to access jobs, as there is a large amount of industries in the area.

Gender equality: Though there are about 18 NGO operating in Adama town, these do not work on gender issues except for EnJOY. EnJOY has twice been supporting the organization of Gender Forums. The forums intended to create a platform for women entrepreneurs to exchange their best experiences and lessons learned, and to learn from others. At the events, women presented their work and their successes. Other women members of the enterprises were invited to attend the event and to learn from it to proactively engage in their own business. Many stakeholders, including the heads of relevant public offices and the heads of gender department of different industries, showed up and shared their experiences for women entrepreneurs. The interviewees from the Women & Children affairs office voiced that this event had been very helpful in making women encouraged and to be aware of the different problems they may face to become successful.

Other Support: During the time of Covid-19 the project spent 5% of the project budget on the provision of humanitarian support for project beneficiaries, such as the provision of personal protection items for 850 beneficiaries, and foodstuffs and personal protection items for another 500 beneficiaries.

Results

1. The project contributed to a reduction of the number of unemployed youth;
2. The establishment of short-term trainings on garment in the TVET has created new job opportunities and skills especially for the women/girls. It helped them to get employed or to become self-employee in the garment sector.
3. The training and the material support increased the capacity of the TVET and the quality of their trainings. This contributed to the status and the reputation of the Wonji Polytechnic TVET. In 2023, the federal government awarded Wonji TVET another ETB 40 million for the installation of very high speed internet facilities. Wonji TVET now has the ambition to become a Centre of Excellence.
4. Due to the participation of Adama University trainers in the IBIC process, knowledge and skills about business and entrepreneurship transferred from the university and the enterprises.

Lessons learned

1. Working on the mindset of the youth is very helpful to bring about change;
2. Collaboration with the different stakeholders from grassroots level up to federal level is found to be useful for ensuring interaction and to bring about visible impacts;
3. The assessments (of OSJC, TVET and the labour market) carried out before the project took off, informed the project design and helped to turn EnJOY into a demand-driven project.

Sustainability

1. The TVET will likely continue to provide quality trainings to the students as they now have the knowledge and the right machinery and equipment to do so. The project contributions have been immense. The BIC training will also continue after the project.
2. Regarding the maintenance of the machinery, the TVET expects no major complications. It plans to manage this as follows:
 - a. There will be TVET internal maintenance services for which the government provides budget;
 - b. The trainers have the skills to ensure basic maintenance of the machinery in their respective department;
 - c. The TVET follow a cluster approach in Ethiopia: one cluster has 6 TVET. Per cluster, there is exchange of ideas and skills between members to solve maintenance-related problems;
 - d. The regional government may contribute in solving maintenance problems as they arrive;
 - e. Maintenance problems could also be solved by the federal government.

Recommendations by stakeholders

1. All interviewees appreciated the EnJOY project support. The support has been huge and had never been expected.
2. The interviewees request the project to continue its work and to finalise the purchase of key machinery and equipment that had been promised in an earlier stage (e.g. an embroidery machine for the Garment department and a model car for the Automotive department).
3. More training is requested for the SME and more material support for the TVET.

Appendix 6. Wollega Woredas (online; AT; 19 December 2023)

Summary Report- Sibu Sire Woreda in Oromia (ECC-SDCO)

(19 December 2023)

Telephone interview with the Dean of Sibu Sire TVET College: Mr. Birehanu Tafese

About the Woreda: The Sibu Sire Woreda is located in East Wollega Zone of Oromia Region. As per the interviewee, unemployment is high and there are many returnees from Arab countries. Migration of youth to the Arab countries is common. Many youth also migrate to Addis Ababa and around Addis Ababa (e.g. in Adama and Bishoftu) to search employment. The woreda is an area of protracted conflicts. Job opportunities for the youth are few and there is very little industry. Though there is a large number of graduated youth, with a degree and a diploma, they are often not able to find a job.

About the supported TVET: Sibu Sire TVET was established with participation of the communities. The TVET has a total of 11 departments but its main areas of specialization are: Furniture production, Crop production, Construction, Building and Electrical Installation.

Before the project: An assessment was carried out of the gaps and the needs of the TVET. The staffs of the college participated in the assessment and listed down the types of machinery and equipment that the TVET required; which was then submitted to the project for consideration. The project has supported the college for nearly 2.5 years.

Types of support provided to the TVET by EnJOY:

Capacity-building support: ToT training both on the subject matter and on business development. This included training on life skills and entrepreneurship, and training on garment production (e.g. on embroidery machines), on welding, on business incubation and various other technical trainings. The ToT trainings were provided in Hawassa for the trainers and for management staff. In addition, technical and vocational counseling guidelines were prepared and orientation on the guidelines was provided. A Guideline on BIC was prepared by Wollega University and orientation was given on how to use it.

Material Support: EnJOY has constructed rooms for the BIC and for an electronic E-Library; which the key informant stated to be the most relevant support. EnJOY has also provided 10 computers plus tables and chairs, printers and a photocopying machine. All these supports are really appreciated. The Dean said that the TVET did not have a printer or a photocopy machine. The project also purchased an internet modem but due to the problems with the local Ethio-Telecom branch office they have not been able yet to install the modem and to make use of it. Some other machines such as welding equipment and woodwork related machines have also been provided.

Other issues discussed: Though the TVET has a garment department, there were no students attending this year, mainly due to the fact that student do not find a job after graduation. In fact, in the last decade the number of students has been decreasing in all departments of the college. Those students who graduated are not able to create their own business while it became difficult for them to penetrate the market. There are not sufficient loans and work premises available, and the working culture of the youth is also reported to be a problem. The youth need to get employed instead of creating their own jobs, but there are no industries in the area.

Cooperative trainings: As part of the 70/30 percent training arrangement, the college has been trying to link its students to other Colleges and research institute, especially to Bako TVET and the Bako Research institute. EnJOY supported students who were attending the cooperative trainings by covering their transportation and other expenses.

Co-financing: Though the college has struggled to help the TVET students benefit from the co-financing arrangement of the project, the school-to-work transition has not been realized, due to a lack of private sector and industries that are willing to accept this arrangement. Remoteness of the woreda from the industrial areas of the country has its own negative impact.

BIC: The BIC is new for the area. Ten (10) computers were purchased and the BIC room constructed. Some SME have just started to incubate their business. The TVET has also started to provide training for members of SME in the BIC, and to youth graduated from Universities and College, as to learn how to develop a business plan and to create jobs.

Results due to the project support

1. Due to the leadership trainings, the TVET management has gained knowledge on how to improve management;
2. The skills of the trainers improved. They started providing quality trainings in their respective department. The machines supported by the project contribute to the provision of quality training.

Recommendations

1. There is need for support for improving some infrastructure like the access to reliable electricity. The TVET also did not receive any vehicle support. As the TVET is located in a remote area, traveling to Addis Ababa and other areas for different purposes is very challenging;
2. The TVET needs continued support from the project as it is still very far off from other colleges in terms of capacity of different types. The TVET also lacks sufficient office space; using for instance one office for about 15 staff members.

=====

Interview of the Head of Jobs and Skills Office of Sibu Sire Woreda - Mr. Ibsa Dilnesa

Introduction: EnJOY is the first project of its kind to intervene in the woreda in the area of unemployment. There is a high number of returnees. There is also high unemployment amongst youth who graduated from different universities and colleges.

Support to OSJC: The woreda had 4 existing job centres, located in urban areas and providing services only to urban people. The offices of the job centres were poorly equipped. They did not have any computers and stationary and they also lacked sufficient human resources. The working environment was not attractive.

EnJOY has supported the establishment of 10 new OSJC. The total number of OSJC now is 14. All offices have been renovated and their staff trained on: entrepreneurship, life skills, customer handling, bookkeeping, the use of ET Works, coaching, etc. The project has also purchased computers and printers, and it installed solar power for those OSJC that are out of grid. In addition, 5 of the 14 OSJCs who do not have access to transportation have each received a motorbike. The government assigned new staff members to each OSJC.

Construction of sheds for the SME: EnJOY supported the construction of three (3) blocks of production sheds for enterprises engaging in poultry. The total cost of these three blocks is estimated to be ETB 7.2 million. The other types of sheds constructed by the project are four (4) blocks of market sheds, each having four units and each unit providing for one enterprise.

Training for the SME: Members of the enterprises received different trainings by staff of OSJC, TVET and other relevant public agencies such as the Woreda Job creation office. The training mainly focused on: auditing, coaching, mentorship, bookkeeping, entrepreneurship, life skills and business plan preparation. The enterprises are engaging in: manufacturing, construction, agriculture, trade, and in the service sector.

Access to loans: The project injected finance to a private micro-finance institution (MFI) called Metemamen. The key informant was not able to provide information about the total number of SME that received loans thus far, but in 2022/23 a total of ETB 3.9 million has been disbursed to 27 SME. The highest loan provided to a single SME was ETB 90,000, at an annual interest rate of 10%. The reimbursement rate is reportedly high; there are no problems reported thus far. The main problem associated with the loans is their small size as compared to needs and taking into account the effect of inflation on purchasing power. The number of SME requiring loans is also much bigger than what is available.

Gender: Regarding gender, 60% of the members of the enterprises who are benefiting from EnJOY are women. The women participation rate in the Wollega woredas thus is good.

Results

1. The skills and the awareness of members of the enterprises who have received support from OSJC staff have improved a lot;
2. Due to support of the project, some unemployed youth have started getting jobs (either self-employment or wage employment).

Sustainability

1. The interviewees are confident that the results and outcomes of the project can be sustained, as they have gained the skills and the knowledge and the commitment. Still, continuation of the project is desired and requested.
2. The support to the TVET college has been much appreciated. There is a good collaboration between the Woreda Job creation office and the TVET, and this will contribute to sustainability of the project results and outcomes.

=====

Annexes

Annex 1. Terms of Reference



Terms of Reference

Final Evaluation of the project

Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY)

In selected regions of Ethiopia

Implemented by CARITAS Switzerland (lead)
with

Ethiopian Catholic Church – Social Development Commission – ECC-SDCO
Volontariato Internazionale per lo Sviluppo – VIS
Vita/RTI





Table of contents

Table of contents	2
Introduction	3
Context and description of the project.....	3
Objectives of the external evaluation	4
Methodology	6
Deliverables.....	7
Required Qualification of Consultants	8
Provisional calendar	8
CARITAS/ Consortium’s support to the evaluation mission.....	9
Application.....	9



Introduction

Since February 2020, CARITAS Switzerland as lead organization of a consortium joined by ECC-SDCO, Vita and VIS, is implementing an EU co-funded employment promotion program in 2 regions of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. The program will be phasing out January 2024. As foreseen in the contracts, Caritas Switzerland is required to organize a final evaluation and, therefore, wishes to contract a team of consultants, ideally one international and one national expert, tasked to implement an assessment of the “Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY)” programme. In line with the contracts underlying the action, the evaluation will be arranged as an external, independent assessment consisting of a desktop (literature/ document) study and a field phase with interviews, focus group discussions and site visits involving key stakeholders. The evaluation approach will be compatible with EU / OECD-DAC standards.

Context and description of the project

Title of the action:	Enhancing Job Opportunities and Employability for Youth and Women (EnJOY)
Location(s) of the action:	Selected regional states of Ethiopia: Oromia, Southern Nations, Nationalities and Peoples (SNNP), Sidama Regions (recently, Southern Ethiopia and Central Ethiopia regions have become independent from SNNP)
Total duration of the action (months):	01 February 2020 to 31 January 2024 (48 months)
Budget and EU contribution	EUR: 8,700,000 (90.00% of total eligible costs)
Objectives of the action	<p>Overall objective: To enhance the capacities of the local authorities to proactively support job-seekers to have better access to information on available job opportunities and job placements.</p> <p>Specific objective: To enhance economic development and access to job opportunities for the youth and women.</p>
Target group(s)	The action will work directly with and for <u>Intermediate Public-Institutions</u> (Agriculture Technical Vocational Educational Training (A/TVET) institutes, Job Centres, Micro Finance Institutes (MFIs), other government agencies etc.) and also with and for <u>individuals</u> (youth, women, Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) and hosts etc.). The project activities target these groups either directly or indirectly.
Final beneficiaries ¹²	The final beneficiaries can be divided in <u>sectorial</u> or <u>society</u> beneficiaries. Sectorial beneficiaries benefit indirectly from improved services provided by sector offices and better trainings provided by A/TVETs to employees. At large the entire population of the 8 target Woredas with 1,3 Mio inhabitants (85% are farm households (HHs)) will benefit through increased employment opportunities.



Expected outputs:	<p>Output 1.1: Job centres (at woreda level) are transformed into One-Stop-Job-Centres (OSJC); 1.2: Public Private Partnership (PPP) (local authorities, private sectors, OSJC, Public Employment Services (PES), A/TVET institutes) platforms at woreda level are in place and competence of their members to enhance employability is increased; 1.3: One online Job portal is designed and functional at woreda level and is linked to the regional and national existing portals to inform about skills development and employment-oriented opportunities, to track users’ formative success; 2.1: Existing Small and Micro Enterprises (SMEs) business plans are updated, and life-skills training facilitated, and start-up of innovative SMEs run by youth and women supported; 2.2: SMEs have improved access to finance services; 3.1: A/TVETs’ capacities are improved to address skill gaps and increase youth employability; 3.2: Work based learning schemes (WBLS) (between A/TVET providers and companies) are established; 3.3: Business Incubation Centres (BIC) at Universities, A/TVET and private sector are established and functional; 4.1: PPPs at regional/national level established to manage and assess effectiveness of active labour policies and employment measures activated at lower levels; 4.2: Evidence based paper to assess the impact of the employment schemes implemented and recommend active labour market measures to enhance the sustainability of the governance system and the effective implementation of the National Rural Job Creation Strategy.</p>																											
Main activities:	<p>Public awareness raising events; PES gap assessment, design model OSJC, refurbishment of job centres, capacity building of PES and other government staff, SMEs needs assessment and assessment of interns’ absorption capacities; improve access to finance, facilitate and implement employment/training schemes; develop and equip BIC, certified short term training courses relevant to labour market demand and implement trainings through A/TVETs; Investments into A/TVET workshop facilities, business development and cooperative trainings with selected enterprises; increasing existing loan scheme revolving funds through local Saving and Credit Cooperatives (SACCOs).</p>																											
Intervention areas	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Woreda</th> <th>Zone</th> <th>Region</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Sibu Sire</td> <td>East Wollega</td> <td>Oromia</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gimbi</td> <td>West Wollega</td> <td>Oromia</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Adama Zuria</td> <td>East Shewa</td> <td>Oromia</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gedeb Hasasa</td> <td>West Arsi</td> <td>Oromia</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Sankura</td> <td>Silte Zone</td> <td>Central Ethiopia (former SNNP)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Duguna Fango</td> <td>Wolayta Zone</td> <td>South Ethiopia (former SNNP)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dale</td> <td>Central Sidama</td> <td>Sidama (former SNNP)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Dilla Zuria</td> <td>Gedeo Zone</td> <td>South Ethiopia (former SNNP)</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Woreda	Zone	Region	Sibu Sire	East Wollega	Oromia	Gimbi	West Wollega	Oromia	Adama Zuria	East Shewa	Oromia	Gedeb Hasasa	West Arsi	Oromia	Sankura	Silte Zone	Central Ethiopia (former SNNP)	Duguna Fango	Wolayta Zone	South Ethiopia (former SNNP)	Dale	Central Sidama	Sidama (former SNNP)	Dilla Zuria	Gedeo Zone	South Ethiopia (former SNNP)
Woreda	Zone	Region																										
Sibu Sire	East Wollega	Oromia																										
Gimbi	West Wollega	Oromia																										
Adama Zuria	East Shewa	Oromia																										
Gedeb Hasasa	West Arsi	Oromia																										
Sankura	Silte Zone	Central Ethiopia (former SNNP)																										
Duguna Fango	Wolayta Zone	South Ethiopia (former SNNP)																										
Dale	Central Sidama	Sidama (former SNNP)																										
Dilla Zuria	Gedeo Zone	South Ethiopia (former SNNP)																										

Objectives of the external evaluation

The final evaluation’s objective is to provide an overall external assessment of the performance and the results of the project, both for the purpose of accountability towards the donor and the public as well as for the purpose of learning to improve future planning and implementation of development cooperation programs. The evaluation team will provide their professional opinion on the appropriateness of the



intervention approach, operational plan and budget and measure the achievements against the defined indicators. The evaluation will focus on assessing the project intervention's relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and, as far as possible at this point in time possible, impact and sustainability.

In addition, the evaluation team must consider to what extent and how gender, environment and climate change were mainstreamed and addressed by the intervention and the effects – desired and undesired – on different types of target groups. It shall furthermore consider whether the relevant SDGs and their interlinkages were identified; the principle of Leave No-One Behind and the rights-based approach methodology was followed in the identification/formulation documents and the extent to which they have been reflected in the implementation of the action, its governance and monitoring.

The final evaluation will cover the full implementation period and all the activities carried out in the context of the project, at all intervention sites. Site visits, however, will be carried out in selected areas considering time, budget and security-related restrictions.

The evaluation must provide evidence-based information that is credible, reliable, and useful. The evaluation team is expected to follow a participatory and consultative approach ensuring close engagement with the local organizations, experts, project partners, the project and management team, final beneficiaries, and other key stakeholders.

The evaluation team is expected to:

- Measure / evaluate the level of achievement and quality of the activities, of the results obtained as well as the effects produced as compared to the objectives of the project
- Provide recommendations on how the approach / intervention logic could (have been) improve(d) (with a focus on appropriateness of the consortium's response to external challenges, e.g. security, Covid-19 and government administrative and geographical reorganization)
- To assess the quality, efficiency, and relevance of the action strategy
- To feed the organization with clear recommendations on the implementation process and the mobilization process of the beneficiaries and the different actors and stakeholders – what could be lessons for the organizations for a similar action in future (capitalization of learnings)
- To highlight strengths and weaknesses of the implementation and monitoring processes.
- The EnJOY program follows a systemic and multi-level approach which includes support measures with government partners at different levels (regional, district, kebele), promotion of an enabling environment for a strengthened private sector and direct investments to support the creation of micro and small enterprises. Apart from the usual “achievements against defined indicators” evaluation, the consortium is interested to benefit from a comparative analysis which assesses the relative cost-benefits of the different approaches combined in the EnJOY program.

Furthermore, in order to contribute to the consortium's learning, the evaluation team is requested to analyze the following three aspects:

- Understanding the practical nature of the EnJOY program's impact, what kind of **social change** do interventions such as the community businesses (i.e., market shades) have on the fabric of remote and peri urban communities that were supported.
- What is the **added value** of the use of business case competitions and other business development activities in creating sustainable and lucrative jobs?



- Does **working directly with and providing in-kind support** to local government organizations (e.g., TVETs and job centers) generate more effective results and therefore more impact on the local communities? If so, how? If not, why?

Methodology

The consultant is requested to propose a methodological concept complying with the following minimum requirements:

- Desk research: should include a review of all the material and documentation developed within the project, the reports of local teams, beneficiaries and consultants, the tools created or adapted, including the monitoring and evaluation ones, etc. The consultant(s) should review all quantitative as well as qualitative information to be found in reports, assessments, minutes of meetings etc. The desk research includes a financial analysis (expenditure against the budget provided).
- Since the EnJOY program has developed and is operating a comprehensive Monitoring, Evaluation, Accountability & Learning (MEAL) system, the evaluation team will in detail review the data and information generated by the MEAL experts and use these data for their analysis.
- Key Informant Interviews/Focus group discussions: The consultant(s) should carry out interviews/group discussions with the project team and all partners as well as representatives of the target groups/beneficiaries.
- The consultants will use the following standard evaluation criteria in accordance with the OECD-DAC evaluation approach:

RELEVANCE

Appropriateness of the project strategy to the actual needs and priorities of the target groups/beneficiaries taking into account the circumstances. Is the project strategy appropriate and logical and does it work directly toward attaining the objectives?

COHERENCE

Analysis of whether the program is coherent with the strategies in job creation building programs in Ethiopia and with other relevant EU policies, as well as with the respective Ethiopian national strategies and policies.

EFFECTIVENESS

Contribution of the project results in the achievement of the project objectives. To what extent are the specific objectives achieved / are likely to be achieved? What are the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives?

EFFICIENCY

Measures the outputs - qualitative and quantitative - in relation to the inputs. How well are the means/inputs and activities converted into outputs? Are the activities implemented in line with the plans? Are they implemented and the outputs delivered in a cost-efficient manner?

IMPACT

The positive and negative changes produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended. This involves the main impacts and effects resulting from the activity on the local social, economic, environmental and other development indicators. The examination should be concerned with both intended and unintended results and must also include the positive and negative impact of external factors, such as changes in terms of trade and financial conditions. What intervention package/activities



proved to be most effective and have the potential of achieving long-term impact achieving the main aim of job creation? What is the potential of scaling this intervention/what activities to be scaled?

SUSTAINABILITY

Analyze to what extent the effects and results of the project are likely to last beyond its implementation period. What was put in place by the project to ensure the sustainability of the expected project outcomes and in how far did the project activities support the attainment of SDG

- Assess the local ownership and involvement in the project implementation,
- Assess to what extent the local partners (i.e., local authorities) have the capacities to properly take over the trail, technically, financially, and managerially.
- Assess to what extent the local partners (i.e., local authorities) have the capacities to properly take over the trail, technically, financially, and managerially.
- Collect lessons learned and good practices and express recommendations for the partners and stakeholders.

In how far has the systemic approach proven successful in generating sustainability of the actions and potential of being reproduced by government actors in other areas?

Deliverables

- 1 inception meeting report, including preliminary workplan with in-country mission timetable, tentative list of key informants, outline of the report tentatively: 2 days.
- Desktop studies, document review tentatively: 5 days.
- In-country mission. First findings (at the end of the in-country mission at a consortium meeting) in English consisting of a Powerpoint presentation of 15 to 20 slides focusing on a) course and results of the mission, b) preliminary findings, c) lessons learned and recommendations for future programs, d) steps and timetable for completion of the assignments. tentatively: 13 days.
- 1 Draft report up to 30 pages plus annexes (English, digital (MS-WORD), including a table of contents, a brief introduction, the objectives and the methodology, and preliminary evaluation findings & lessons learned based on the criteria mentioned above. Annexed: acronyms, list of interviewees, ToRs, methodology, schedule, etc., see Annex 1 to TORs). If the EU is interested, a separate presentation for the EU delegation will be arranged. tentatively: 7 days.
- 1 final report, after having received written comments from the project management and EU. tentatively: 3 days.

The deliverables are expected to be produced by the team as a whole, represented in legal terms by the team leader. Sharing tasks between the team members is up them and should be explained in the proposal. Overall, the evaluation is estimated to require 30 working days for the international and 20 working days for the national expert, to be delivered within the period of November – December 2023; however, the Lead consultant is free to suggest the actual allocation of fee days in the offer.



Required Qualification of Consultants

Applicants must meet the following conditions:

Ideally, the evaluation shall be carried out by a team of experts, one international and one national, with an academic background at MSc level in a field related to the project. The evaluation team will comprise the best available mix of skills that are required to assess the project, and as a whole, will have expertise in all the following subject matters: Rural Development, Local Economic Development, TVET, SMEs Development, Youth and Women Affairs, Employment/ Job Creation Strategies & Policies.

A strong theoretical and practical background in aid delivery modalities and evaluation methodology is indispensable.

The international expert/team leader must have a proven record of 10 years of experience at senior level with development cooperation projects focusing promotion of micro- small & medium enterprises including national youth employment policies and have a good understanding of rural-urban migration dynamics and employment promotion particularly for youth and women.

The international expert/team leader must have extensive work experience in Africa including work experience in Ethiopia (2 years' minimum). He/she must have strong experiences as an evaluation teamleader in related sectors in Eastern Africa, preferably in Ethiopia.

The national experts must have an MSc in a related field and minimum of 5 years of proven and strong experience in designing, analysing and/or implementing market system development (MSD) programs and the development of national youth employment policies and / or national migration and internally displaced people policy. He/she should be capable of contributing the necessary specialized local (Oromia, SNNPR) know-how to the team. Expertise in data analysis, particularly for analyzing data provided by the program's MEAL system, would be a strong asset.

Other requirements:

- Excellent writing and verbal communication skills in English is mandatory for the international expert/team leader and the national expert. In addition, the national expert must be fluent in Amharic; being able to communicate at a basic level in afan oromo is a must; mastering the language would be strong advantage.
- A good understanding of migration dynamics and issues related to youth task force development in Ethiopia is needed including the knowledge of the administrative set-up of the respective government sector
- Committed to deadlines
- Experiences in communication and facilitating learning workshops
- CACH reserves the right to fully or partially cancel this bid for consultancy service.
- Availability in line with the defined mission calendar and ability to deliver as per the agreement.

Provisional calendar

The applicant is free to suggest an alternative calendar provided that the final evaluation report will be submitted until latest December 30, 2023.



Provisional calendar	date	days
Publication of ToR	26-Oct-23	21
Selection of the Evaluator	16-Nov-23	7
Contracting the Evaluator	23-Nov-23	4
Inception Meeting	27-Nov-23	1
Desk Research	28-Nov-23	5
Inception report	3-Dec-23	4
Interviews and focus groups	7-Dec-23	13
1st Draft Report	20-Dec-23	5
Comments to draft report	25-Dec-23	5
Final Report	30-Dec-23	

CARITAS/ Consortium’s support to the evaluation mission

The evaluation team will enjoy logistical support including transport for field trips (TBD during inception phase) but will not support with translation services.

The following documents provided to the evaluation team for review during the desk study phase (to be updated in the inception phase):

- Project proposal
- Baseline study report
- Data available from the program’s MEAL system
- Mid-term review report
- Annual reports
- Various studies and assessment reports

Note: The evaluation team will identify and obtain any other document worth analyzing, through independent research and during interviews with relevant informed parties and stakeholders of the intervention.

Application

Applications by interested firms or associated individuals are welcome. The application should include:

- 1-page expression of interest, highlighting relevant experience and knowledge of the context, daily rate and availability for travel to and in Ethiopia;



- A technical proposal detailing your approach to evaluation of the project, including methodology proposal (maximum 5 pages) and team organization.
- A detailed implementation plan, showing timing and duration of tasks for all team members
- A detailed financial proposal
- Updated CV(s)
- Contact details for 2 references
- Please submit the application before November 16, 2023 CoB
- Assessment of the offers

The offers will be assessed as follows

1. Technical evaluation criteria

The CACH selects the offer with the best value for money using a 70/30 weighting between technical quality and price. The technical quality is evaluated on the basis of the following grid:

Criteria
<i>Total score for the approach to work</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understanding of ToR and the aim of the services to be provided
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Overall methodological approach, quality control approach, appropriate mix of tools and estimate of difficulties and challenges
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Organisation of tasks including timetable
<i>Score for the expertise of the proposed team</i>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Qualification of the international expert/team leader • Qualification of the national expert
<i>Overall total score</i>

2. Technical threshold

Any offer falling short of the technical threshold of 75 out of 100 points, is automatically rejected.

3. Interviews during the evaluation of the offers

During the evaluation process of the offers received the Contracting Authority reserves the right to interview virtually one or several members of the proposed evaluation teams.

Annex 2. Visit programme (5-21 December 2023)

Institution	Person	Position	M/F	F	M
Tuesday 5 December					
Inception meeting (on-line)					
CACH (Hamburg)	Frank SANDVOSS	CACH / Project manager	M		1
CACH (Addis)	Jens STEUERNAGEL	CACH / Country Director	M		1
CACH (from sept 2023)	Metadel FETAHUAN	EnJOY / Project coordinator	F	1	
ECC-SDCO	Kinfu GUTA	EnJOY / Project coordinator	M		1
VIS	Anna Laura BIGATTI	EnJOY / Project coordinator	F	1	
VITA/RTA	Mesfin KEBEDE RETA	EnJOY / Project coordinator	M		1
CACH	Eyasu LEMA	EnJOY / M&E / Coordinator	M		1
Wednesday 6 December					
Addis Ababa					
CACH (from sept 2023)	Metadel FETAHUAN	CACH / EnJOY / Project coordinator	F		
Thursday 7 December					
Addis Ababa					
ECC-SDCO	Kinfu GUTA	ECC-SDCO / EnJOY / Project coordinator	M		
CACH	Jens STEUERNAGEL	CACH / Country Director	M		
CACH	Eyasu LEMMA	EnJOY / M&E / Coordinator	M		
CACH	Demiss FEYISSA	CACH / Security Officer	M		1
VITA/RTA	Mesfin KEBEDE RETA	VITA / EnJOY / Project coordinator	M		
Friday 8 December					
Addis Ababa					
Kick-off meeting	Metadel FETAHUAN	CACH / EnJOY / Project coordinator	F		
	Eyasu LEMMA	CACH / EnJOY / M&E / Coordinator	M		
	Mesfin KEBEDE RETA	VITA / EnJOY / Project coordinator	M		
Federal Min Labour & Skills	Solomon TADESSE	Market Linkage Officer (former MEAL officer)	M		1
Oromia Min Labour & Skills	Adanech GONFA	Director Trainers Development	F	1	
Saturday 9 December					
Addis Ababa					
CACH	Jens STEUERNAGEL	CACH / Country Director	M		
CACH (until Sept 2023)	Sarah KOHLS	CACH / EnJOY / Project coordinator	F	1	
Oromia Min Labour & Skills	Befikadu TOLESSA	Director One-Stop-Job-Centres (OSJC)	M		1
Travel to Debre Zeit / Bishoftu					
Sunday 10 December					
Dilla (South Ethiopia)					
Travel to Dilla					
VIS (in Dilla)	Anna Laura BIGATTI	VIS / Programme Manager	F		
	Admasu ABERA	VIS / EnJOY Project coordinator	M		1
Don Bosco TVET / Dilla	Efren UMANDAL	Salesian Brother / Focal person	M		1
Monday 11 December					
Dilla (South Ethiopia) & Dale (Sidama)					
Don Bosco TVET / Dilla	Efren UMANDAL	Salesian Brother / Focal person	M		
Travel to Dale					
Dale Woreda	Addisu SORESSA	Labour & Social Affairs	M		1
Dale Woreda	Hani SHUDURA	Women & Youth & Child Affairs	F	1	
Yirgalem Polytechnic TVET	Adoosha MENGISTU	Dean	M		1
Dale Woreda	Abebayehu BULGUDA	Enterprise Development	M		1
Pinieli Haqunna Siwiilu	???	Director / Carpenter Training Centre	M		1
	12 women trainees	Carpenter Trainees	F	12	

Tuesday 12 December	Dale & Hawassa (Sidama)			
OSJC Namaro Dela	Tarik Tamire Anbeeter DIAB	OSJC Coordinator	F	1
	Desalegn TSEGAYE	Database officer	M	1
	Abebayehu BULGUDA	Enterprise Development	M	
OMO Bank	Buzayehu BOGALE	Field agent	M	1
Yirgalem / FGD Enterprises	Tamirat TADESSE	Electricity	M	1
(7 persons; 2 M, 5 F)	Mamush KEFIZE	Tree nursery (Neriser Sayst)	M	1
	Markos ELIAS	Vermicompost	M	1
	Simirawit GEZAHEGN	Tree nursery (Neriser Sayst)	F	1
	Assmeret KACHARA	Poultry (Abize)	F	1
	Biskut ZERHUI	Poultry (Daracho)	F	1
	Tenoyo KASA	Poultry (Yoye)	F	1
IBIC award winner	Medihanit BOGALE	Milk processor / Store	F	1
Travel to Hawassa				
Sidama Regional Office	Kifle AJAJE	JSED / Director Trainings	M	1
	Yohannes BELETE RODISSO	JSED / Vice-Director Job creation	M	1
	Kefiyaalewu KEBEDE SORSA	JSED / Director Job creation	M	1
Wednesday 13 December	Sankura (Central Ethiopia)			
Travel to Werabe				
VITA	Gudeno TEIGANE	EnJOY Project coordinator (based in Sodo/Wolayta)	M	1
Siltie Zone Government	Yesuf OUMER	Finance CSO Officer	M	1
	Faud KEDIR	Head of TVET	M	1
Travel to Alem Gebaye				
Sankura Woreda Office	Habib KEDIR	Sankura Enterprise Development (urban OSJC)	M	1
	Mudesir Aman SHUKRE	Sankura Enterprise Development (rural OSJC)	M	1
Sankura TVET / Alem Gebaye	Abdunasir Shafi KEMAL	Dean	M	1
Travel to Halaba Kulito				
Thursday 14 December	Sankura (Central Ethiopia)			
Travel to Alem Gebaye & Halaba Kulito				
Sankura Woreda Office	Sofia SULTAN	Sankura Women & Child Affairs / Head	F	1
	Tamirat ABEBE	Sankura Social Affairs / Head	M	1
IBIC award winner	Zakia RAMATO	Food processing & sale / Injera & Bread & Yoghurt	F	1
Alem Gebaye OSJC (urban)	Nuriya AWOL	Manufacturing officer	F	1
	Fesu KEDIR	Database manager	F	1
	Reduwan MOHAMMED	Market shed manager	M	1
	Natnael WORKU	Finance related officer	M	1
Radina Masure / FGD Enterprises	Mohammed A. CHOMMISSO	Food processing & sale / Juices & Yoghurt & Coffee	M	1
(6 persons; 5 M, 1 F)	Rowde SAIDE	General retail & Water & Spices	F	1
	Husen Mefase TEADT	Furniture sales (production elsewhere)	M	1
	??	Food processing & sale / Juices & Yoghurt & Coffee	M	1
	Debiso GOJE	Food processing & sale / Injera & Bread	M	1
	Mudesir ZEYNU	Vegetables retail	M	1
VITA	Gudeno TEIGANE	EnJOY Project coordinator (based in Sodo/Wolayta)	M	
Travel to Hawassa				
Friday 15 December	Gedeb Assosa (Oromia)			
Travel to Gedeb Asosa				
Gedeb Asossa Woreda Office	Sufi YEBA	Gedeb Assosa / Women & Child Affairs	M	1
	Yasin EDIRS	Gedeb Assosa / Finance office / NGO Focal Point	M	1
	Hassen JEWARO	Gedeb Assosa / Finance office	M	1
	Tahir Haji NAGESO	Gedeb Assosa / Labour & Social Affairs	M	1
Gedeb Asossa Woreda Office	Bedaso Nuro OGEDO	Gedeb Assosa / Job Creation & Skills / Focal person	M	1
Travel to Hawassa				

Annex 3. Evaluation matrix

Criteria	Evaluation questions	Indicators	Source of information
Relevance & Coherence	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Did the project objective and design remain relevant over time? To what extent does the project address the needs and priorities of the clients/beneficiaries? Are the expected results still consistent with the national priorities? How adequate is the project design (e.g. log frame coherence, linkages between components and activities) in supporting the activities and expected outcomes? To what extent is the intervention coherent, both internal (among its different components) and externally (with other interventions in the country). 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Needs and priorities have been inventoried. Intervention strategies are geared towards these needs and priorities. Conformity of the project and its orientations with the national policies and priorities. Analysis of the project design and its coherence. Analysis of the project interventions and their coherence. 	<p>Analysis before project Base-line study Mid-Term & Progress reports National, regional and local policies Representatives of beneficiary groups Producers, processors and exporters involved (men, women)</p>
Effectiveness	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent has the project achieved the expected results and outcomes? Which intended and unintended results have been generated (positive, negative)? What results, intentional and unintentional, has the project achieved at the time of the evaluation; and are they contributing to the achievement of the project's objectives? Are the expected outcomes likely to be achieved? Quality of M&E system - To what extent is the M&E system (e.g. indicators, guidelines) able to collect the necessary, timely, accurate and comparable data and information? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Degree (%) of achievement of the intended results (based on key indicators and qualitative information). Analytical description of contextual factors. Results reported in the matrix of key indicators. Listing of initial impacts. Baseline and qualitative information of clients/beneficiaries and other value chain actors. Analysis of the M&E system, results and outcomes. 	<p>Project reports Mid-Term & Progress reports Other reports Representatives of beneficiary groups Clients/Beneficiaries (men, women)</p>
Efficiency	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent has the project been effective and efficient? Has the intervention encountered any delays and was the planning revised accordingly? Have the modalities and quality of implementation, the institutional structure and governance of the project, the financial, technical and operational resources and procedures in place are contributing to or hindering the achievement of the project's results and objectives? To what extent is the project efficient in executing the resources? To what extent does the project ensure good coordination with other projects and initiatives? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Qualitative appreciations of the efficiency of the project interventions. Description of variations in the contexts and of the project's response and adaptations. Analysis of the degree of budget exhaustion. List of agreements, initiatives and partnerships established by the project to coordinate and seek synergy with other groups and initiatives. 	<p>Project reports Mid-Term & Progress reports Other reports Representatives of beneficiary groups Clients/Beneficiaries (men, women)</p>
(Initial) Impacts & Sustainability	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> How sustainable are the results achieved to date and what are the prospects for sustainability in the next phase of project implementation? What is the potential for the project's components to be scaled-up or replicated? Is the project contributing effectively towards institutions and beneficiaries capacity development? Is capacity building based on real needs and building on existing capacities? Is it integrated (individual, organisational, enabling environment level)? How has information on project objectives, progress and results been communicated and knowledge gained been shared among stakeholders? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Listing of main risks for the sustainability of the results and impacts of the project, and their probability. Listing of results, lessons and experiences having been replicated and/or ready for diffusion and replication. Analysis of the capacity development activities in relation to needs and existing capacities. Analysis of the communication and information activities, results and outcomes. 	<p>Project reports Mid-Term & Progress reports Other reports Representatives of beneficiary groups Clients/Beneficiaries (men/women) Structures involved in the project</p>
Cross-cutting issues	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> To what extent have considerations of youth and women and less-privileged groups been taken into account in the project design and implementation? How is the intervention dealing with environmental constraints and opportunities? 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Analysis of the strategy and achievements of the project regarding youth and women and less-privileged groups. Analysis of the project approach to environmental constraints and opportunities. 	<p>Project reports Mid-Term & Progress reports Representatives of beneficiary groups Clients/Beneficiaries Structures involved in the project</p>

Annex 4. List of Guiding questions per stakeholder group

I. Guiding Questions for public stakeholders (regional, woreda, OSJC)

A. *Outcome 1: An improved local public-private governance system, including empowered One Stop Job Centres, has been supported and is able to plan, deliver, manage and monitor effective job opportunities for vulnerable youth and women at district, zonal, regional and national levels*

1. What are the key areas of collaboration between the PES providers (i. e. relevant government stakeholders) and Enjoy?
2. Do you think the PES gap assessment identified the key gaps experienced by the relevant government sectors? What were the gaps?
3. What major supports the public relevant sectors received from the project? In terms of staff development and material and equipment supports? How relevant are the supports in particular - and the project in general?
4. What were the key challenges that the public sectors were facing before EnJOY that hindered them to provide PES to the job seekers (both individuals and SME)? Does the project contribute through its parts in solving these problems? Please specify.
5. What is the contribution of the project in transforming the Job center into OSJC and in designing model OSJC? What key supports the project provided for this to happen?
6. Who are members of the PPP platform established? What capacity support has been provided for the PPP? What is the contribution of the PPP increasing information exchange and enhancing youth employability? Its contribution in establishing and strengthening linkage between PES sectors and business sectors? Who own and govern the PPP?
7. What major changes have occurred as a result of the support? Do the OSJC provide effective and efficient information for job seekers, potential enterprises and existing SME?
8. Do you think that the project contributed in reinstating the missing link between the public sectors, the private sectors, the job seekers, A/TEVT and SME?
9. Does the improved service as a result of the project reach job seekers in remote areas?
10. What key lessons have been learned due to PPP and exchange and development of the OSJC? What do the lessons contribute to sharpening the job market solution system?
11. Do you think consulting and skill development capacities of PES increased? Does it helps the PES structures to deliver the required services?
12. Is the online job portal designed and does it provide the intended services? In the Portal linked with other portals at regional and national levels?
13. What are the real benefits of the portals for the job seekers and the PES sectors? What challenges has the portal been encountering (e.g. internet-related and technology-related challenges) that hinders the effective functioning of the services? Challenges related to the (in)ability of the users to effectively using the portals?
14. Which institution owns the portal? How do you ensure sustainable functioning of the portal?
15. What are the success factors?
16. How do you see the technical, financial, institutional and environmental sustainability of the project?

II. Guiding questions for SME and Self-employed

B. Outcome 2: Enabled the environment for a strengthened private sector in Oromia and SNNP Regions to promote economic development through better access to finance by SMEs and self-employment opportunities for vulnerable youth and women.

1. No. of enterprises for which business plan is updated and life skill training facilitated? What is the benefit of these efforts for SMEs? What changes have been seen as a result?
2. No. of new innovative SME run by youth the women? In which key sectors? How are the sectors selected? Is it based on a gap and need assessment?
3. What is the contribution of labour market assessment in providing information on potential self-employed job opportunities?
4. Was there any capacity-building support for potential entrepreneurs in the areas of SME and business trainings to enter potential job sectors? Number of job created?
5. What types of training provided to SME? Like Business plan development, financial management? Product development? Linking them up to SACCO or MFIs to help them have access to financial services?
6. Have the targeted SME improved their access to financial services? What are their major sources of finance? What key requirements the SME and self-employed need to fulfil to get the loan? Is the loan easily accessible and the process fast? Which sector is the most preferred by the financial institutions that are providing the loan? Is there any MoU between MFI and the public sector in facilitating the loan and the roles of the project?
7. Is there a detailed analysis made by the project together with relevant public and private sectors and MFI on promising sectors for SME, areas of specific loan products and schemes for youth and women as well as IDP and returnees?
8. What key support the project and the public sectors provided to the financial institutions that enhance their capacity in adjusting and shaping their portfolio so as to make their financial services more attractive to potential customer? What are the roles of PPP in this regards?
9. What key supports that SACCO have received from the project so as to upgrade their revolving fund based loan schemes which may ultimately increase the number of people who have access to loan?
10. Among the MFI and SACCO which one is the most preferred in terms of availing loan product? Why? Please explain?

III. Guiding Questions for A/TVET

C. Outcome 3: The A/TVET offer is more flexible, demand-driven and more linked to the job opportunities in order to facilitate skills development and school to work transition.

1. What cooperation and collaboration has the Project with the target A/TVET? What key supports were provided? Both material and in-kind supports and human development supports?
2. Were the supports provided based on a detailed gap assessment? Do you think the assessment revealed the real gaps?
3. What major changes the A/TEVT has exhibited as a result of the supports? Please explain in terms of institutional capacity including human power? Technical capacity including capacity in terms of machineries and other equipment so as to diversify trainings by introducing new one based on demand (like irrigation, solar powered technologies...etc.)?
4. Major changes in terms of design of demand and market-driven curriculum and development of training materials? Introduction of new field of trainings/studies? Please mention some? Provision of internship in different forms following the supports?
5. MoU between the A/TVET and the work providers to facilitate the school – work transition and enhance WBLS? To what extent the WBLS helps in enhancing the youth and women employability by enhancing their skill and experience?
6. Are BIC established in both public and private A/TVET? No. of BIC established and in which sectors? How functional and helpful are these BICs? What key support is provided by the project to make them functional and productive enhancing youth employability? What is the contribution of the BIC in enhancing the skill of self-employed youth and women in the areas of financial management, business planning and basic monetary practices?

IV. Guiding Question for PPP at regional and national level

D. Outcome 4: An improved MEAL System, led by an empowered PPP, is able to track and evaluate the effectiveness and the impact of Active Labour Market Policies (ALMPs) and governance tools & measures in order to give factual implementation to the National Rural Job Creation Strategy

1. Is the PPP established at regional and national level? Members of the PPP platform? What key supports is provided to the PPP by the project? Which organisation is leading the PPP at regional and national level? What key activities the PPP is doing to enhance and strengthen the linkage between the PES sectors and the business actors at regional and national level? How well is the PPP assessing and tracking the effectiveness of active labour policies?
2. Contribution of the PPP for effective implementation of the National Rural Job Creation Strategy?
3. The contribution of the PPP in assessing the project-induced improved employment schemes?
4. The support of PPP to governmental line bureaus and ministries to be able to make decisions on the job market solutions? What was the support of the project in collection and analysis of data to produce an evidence based paper?

V. Guiding questions derived from Log frame

Outcome level:

1. Is the final format of OSJC decided, tested and documented and functional? Is this activity made possible in all target woredas?
2. How many PPPs have been established at district/woreda and zonal level?
3. Are there capacity-building trainings for authorities on rural job creation and youth/women and IDP integration? Number of staffs trained?
4. Number of SME supported by the project that are active and functional and the sector they are engaging in?
5. Number of women engaging in the newly-established SME (disaggregated by sector and gender)?
6. Number of policy change suggestions from lower-level PPP discussed and forwarded for decision for making policy changes?
7. Is there any adopted standardized MEAL system agreed and in place?

Output level

A. Output one:

1. Job center transformed and # of OSJC renovated, equipped and transformed?
2. The competency of members of the woreda level PPP to enhance the employability of youth? The number of PPP platform event organized at woreda level? How regularly PPP organized?
3. Is the on line job portal designed and functional at woreda level and linked to regional and national similar portals? How is it helping in information sharing and for youth and women employability? Who are using the portal (SME owners, individual youth, women..)? If possible, number of people using the portal disaggregated by gender and age? And number of job placement facilitated and or supported through the online job portal?

B. Output two

1. What key supports have been provided? Is the business plan updated? What is the number of SME that had their business plan updated?
2. Is the life skill training provided? What is the number of SME that received skill training?
3. On what subject? How many people trained (disaggregated by sex and age)? Is the training helpful? How many new SME established and on what sectors?
4. How many SME have been linked with MFI by sectors? What is the trend in the increase in number of established SME on yearly basis? Which sector is increasing more and why?

C. Output three

1. The support of the project in enhancing the capacity of the A/TEVT? What key results have been made as a result of capacitating the A/TEVT, especially enhancing the skill of the youth from the prospective of giving them demand driven skill to enhance youth employability?
2. The project contribution in enhancing the Work-Based Learning Schemes (WBLS) (internship/apprenticeship) to enhance the capacity of the job seeker youth and women?
3. What were the original status of the BIC and what is their current status after the support? What key support was provided for the establishment of the BIC?

of TVET renovated and equipped? What are the key supports in terms of staff training and machineries?

of TVETs which are applying improved and adjusted curricula to as to enhance the labour market?

of learning schemes MoU between A/TVET and Companies signed disaggregated by Sector?

of youth benefiting from WBLs disaggregated by gender and sector

of BIC established and renovated? And people using the BIC per year? Is it increasing or decreasing? Why please explain?

D. Output four

1. What is the objective and benefit of establishing PPP at national and regional level? What is the number of PPP established at regional and national level?
2. What are the key supports of the project in the process of establishing the PPP?
3. What results and learning have been brought as a result of the engagement of PPP at regional and national level especially in strengthening the linkage between the public sectors and the private sectors and the research institutions?
4. What about the sustainability of the project activities and outcomes? Have there been any policy suggestions? Have there been any changes in policy as a result?

=====

Annex 5. Evaluation team

The evaluation team consists of an International consultant and a National consultant. The profiles of the team members fully cover the range of expertise requested in the ToR and considered necessary for successful completion of the assignment. The work of the team will be based on a wide range of knowledge and experiences regarding development interventions, programmes, projects and their review and evaluation; in Ethiopia and abroad. Precise roles and responsibilities will be agreed within the team. The Team leader will be responsible for submission and presentation of the Draft and Final reports.

Peter TON

International consultant, Team leader, Evaluation expert

Areas: Food security, Value chains, Rural development, Entrepreneurship, Climate adaptation, Resilience, TVET, Gender equality, Youth employment, Programme and project reviews and evaluations

Peter Ton has more than twenty years of experience carrying out reviews, studies and evaluating complex programmes in the areas of value chains, rural development, sustainable agriculture, entrepreneurship, extension, TVET, gender, youth, nutrition, livelihoods, climate adaptation. Peter has carried out several previous assignments in Ethiopia (in Afar, Amhara, Benishangul-Gumuz, Gambella, Oromia, SNNPR, Sidama, Tigray) and the Horn of Africa (in Kenya, Djibouti, Somalia, South Sudan, Uganda).

Specific evaluation experience in Ethiopia – as a Team leader or Team member:

- Final Evaluation of the project “Employable Youth in Ethiopia” (EUR 9.1 mln) - on youth employment and entrepreneurship (2021/22). Remote interviews (Covid-19 period) and field visits in and around Addis Ababa, Hawassa, Wolayta, Shashemene.
- Mid-Term Review of EU-funded National Biogas Dissemination Programme (NBPE+) (EUR 23 mln) (2020), with field visits to SNNPR, Sidama, Afar, Amhara, Benishangul-Gumuz.
- Lesson Learning exercise with Danida and Agricultural Transformation Agency (ATA) for the Danish-funded programme “Greening Agricultural Transformation in Ethiopia (GATE)” (EUR 27 million) (2019), with field visits to Tigray and Oromia.
- Mid-Term Review of the Dutch-funded Horn of Africa-Climate Change Programme (HoA-CCP) in integrated landscape management in Ethiopia, Kenya, Djibouti and Somalia (EUR 4 million) (2017); including field visit in Gambella region.
- Final Evaluation of Dutch-funded ICCO Food Security and Rural Entrepreneurship (FSRE) Fund in Ethiopia (EUR 6.6 million); including ten (10) case studies out of 75 entrepreneurship projects (2016); including field visits to Oromia, SNNPR, Amhara.

Abiyot TILAHUN

National consultant, Gender & Development expert, Evaluation expert

Areas: Food security, Resilience, Value chains, Gender, Youth, Disaster risk reduction, Entrepreneurship, Water & Sanitation, Health & Nutrition, Monitoring and Evaluation.

Abiyot Tilahun is an Ethiopian expert having eighteen (18) years of work experience in the field of development. He has a rich track record of baseline surveys, impact assessments, Mid-Term Reviews and Final evaluations of livelihood, food security, climate adaptation and resilience projects and programs. Abiyot is an expert in gender, youth and development.

Main areas of engagement include: food and livelihood security, disaster risk reduction and climate change, environment conservation, gender, youth, value chain analysis and entrepreneurship, youth

employment, water & Sanitation, and health & nutrition. Abiyot is familiar with the other youth and women employment projects in Ethiopia, and with large national programs including PSNP, Agricultural Growth Program, Pastoral Development Program (PCDP), etc. Abiyot has extensive experience of project cycle management (PCM) including developing qualitative and quantitative research methodologies and tools. He is fluent in Amharic and Oromiffa.

Specific evaluation experience in Ethiopia:

- End-line evaluation of project Together for sustainable livelihood and landscape project of ECC-SDCBOM- Funded by Caritas Austria and Biovision Foundation, Implemented in Oromia Region, Team leader, Sep and Oct 2023
- Final evaluation of ECHO Funded Danish Refugee Council (DRC) Integrated Humanitarian Response Project implemented in Tigray, Gambella, Afar and Somali regions, as assistance team leader and evaluation specialist, in July and August 2023
- Final Evaluation of the project “Employable Youth in Ethiopia” (EUR 9.1 mln) - on youth employment and entrepreneurship (2021/22). Remote interviews (Covid-19 period) and field visits in and around Addis Ababa, Hawassa, Wolayta, Shashemene. (see above);
- Final Evaluation of the Dan Church Aid Ethiopia Country Programme as assistant team leader (2021), including on TVET and youth employment;
- Mid-Term Review of the EU-funded National Biogas Dissemination Programme in Ethiopia (NBPE+) (2020) (see above);
- Final evaluation for Child Fund Canada of the Household Economic Strengthening and Natural Resource Conservation project (2019);
- Final evaluation for CAFOD, SCIF and Trocaire of the Climate Change Adaptation and Disaster Resilient Project in Northern Ethiopia. (2018);
- Final Evaluation for HORIZONT3000 and DKA of Integrated Community Based development project in Oromia, on women socio-economic empowerment (2018);
- Mid Term Review of the Horn of Africa - Climate Change Programme, in Ethiopia and Kenya. (2017) (see above);
- Final Evaluation of the Dutch-funded ICCO Food Security and Rural Entrepreneurship (FSRE) Fund in Ethiopia (2016) (see above).

=====